



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	CLAREMORE, Oklahoma	Accident Number:	FTW00LA133
Date & Time:	April 28, 2000, 15:15 Local	Registration:	N5023L
Aircraft:	Lake LA-4-200	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:		Injuries:	3 Minor
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

Analysis

During the demonstration flight, the pilot-in-command (PIC)/airplane owner occupied the right front seat, and the prospective buyer occupied the left front seat. After circling the airport to confirm wind sock position and that the 2,400-foot grass runway was clear of obstructions, a pattern entry was made for landing to the south. On final approach, the pilots noted that the airplane was low on the approach, and the left seat pilot added power. Subsequently, the airplane was too far down the runway and the airspeed was too fast for the landing. The PIC called for a go-around, and the left seat pilot added full power. The airplane flew in ground effect, about 5 feet agl, for several hundred feet. Subsequently, the airplane climbed to about 20 feet agl, and the left seat pilot retracted the landing gear. The PIC raised the flaps, and the airplane settled to 5 to 10 feet agl and impacted a fence and trees. During a post accident compression check of the engine, the prospective buyer and his mechanic found that the #2 intake valve was leaking.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's premature raising of the flaps.

Findings

Occurrence #1: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH OBJECT
Phase of Operation: GO-AROUND (VFR)

Findings

1. (C) GO-AROUND - DELAYED - PILOT IN COMMAND
2. (C) CLEARANCE - NOT MAINTAINED - PILOT IN COMMAND
3. OBJECT - FENCE
4. OBJECT - TREE(S)
5. ENGINE ASSEMBLY, VALVE, INTAKE - LEAK

Factual Information

On April 29, 2000, at 1515 central daylight time, a Lake LA-4-200, single-engine amphibian airplane, N5023L, struck a fence and trees during a go-around from a private grass airstrip near Claremore, Oklahoma. The airplane was owned and operated by a private individual under 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 91. The two private pilots and the aft seat passenger received minor injuries, and the airplane sustained substantial damage. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed for the local personal flight, and a flight plan was not filed. The flight departed the Claremore Municipal Airport approximately 1445.

During the demonstration flight, the pilot-in-command/owner of the airplane occupied the right front seat, and the prospective buyer occupied the left front seat. After re-fueling at Claremore, the pilots flew over Lake Oologah and then proceeded to the Avian Country Estates airstrip, a 2,400-foot grass airstrip near Claremore.

On the Pilot/Operator Aircraft Accident Report (NTSB Form 6120.1/2), the left seat pilot reported the following information. Upon approaching the airport from the north, they circled the airport to confirm windsock position and that the runway was clear of obstructions. Subsequently, on final approach for runway 17, the pilots noted that the airplane was low on the approach, and the left seat pilot added power. The power was left on too long, the airplane traveled too far down the runway, and the airspeed was too fast for the landing. The pilot-in-command called for a go-around, and the left seat pilot added full power. The airplane flew in ground effect, about 5 feet above the runway, for several hundred feet. Subsequently, the airplane climbed to about 20 feet agl, and the left seat pilot retracted the landing gear. The pilot-in-command raised the flaps, and the airplane settled to 5 to 10 feet agl, traveled through trees, and continued traveling approximately 200 feet before it struck a tree and came to rest.

One witness observed the airplane touchdown and bounce. Subsequently, the witnesses observed the airplane slightly airborne until it hit [the] trees. One witness described the engine as "loud." Witnesses reported the winds were calm with the windsock "motionless."

According to the Pilot/Operator Report (NTSB Form 6120.1/2), the pilot-in-command had accumulated a total of 3,200 flight hours, of which 1,200 hours were in the make and model of the accident aircraft. The pilot/prospective buyer had accumulated a total of 1,105 flight hours, of which 10 hours were in the make and model.

Local authorities and the FAA inspector responding to the site found that the right wing struck a barbed wire fence and a tree. The FAA inspector stated that the tree "was broken off approximately 4 feet from the ground." The airplane came to rest inverted with the fuselage split aft of the front seats. The left main landing gear was found up and locked, the right main landing gear partially extended, and the nose landing gear in the wheel well with the gear doors

half closed. The left flap was found in the retracted position, and the right flap was found separated at the outboard attachment points.

A review of the aircraft maintenance records by the FAA inspector revealed that the last annual inspection was performed on October 8, 1999, at an accumulated total aircraft time of 1,841.0 hours.

The operating procedures manual for the airplane states in part: All take-off and landings should be made flaps down.

On May 10, 2000, the prospective buyer and his mechanic examined the airplane. During a compression check, they found cylinder #2 compression at 20 psi. They removed the #2 cylinder and poured solvent into the intake ports for the valve assembly and observed solvent leaking into the cylinder.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Single-engine sea	Seat Occupied:	Right
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	Helicopter	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medical--w/ waivers/lim	Last FAA Medical Exam:	June 18, 1998
Occupational Pilot:	UNK	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	3200 hours (Total, all aircraft), 1200 hours (Total, this make and model), 3000 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 25 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 20 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Lake	Registration:	N5023L
Model/Series:	LA-4-200 LA-4-200	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	480
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle; Amphibian	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	November 16, 1999 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2600 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	28 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	1870 Hrs	Engine Manufacturer:	Lycoming
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	IO-360-A1B
Registered Owner:	THOMAS L. KILPATRICK, JR.	Rated Power:	200 Horsepower
Operator:	KENNETH L. CLARK	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:		Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:		Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Unknown	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	/	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	0°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	29°C / 7°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	, OK (107)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:		Type of Clearance:	
Departure Time:	14:45 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class E

Airport Information

Airport:	AVIAN COUNTY ESTATES NONE	Runway Surface Type:	Grass/turf
Airport Elevation:	800 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	18	IFR Approach:	
Runway Length/Width:	2400 ft / 100 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Go around

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	2 Minor	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	1 Minor	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	3 Minor	Latitude, Longitude:	36.309844,-95.609809(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Roach, Joyce
Additional Participating Persons:	CARY E WILCOX; OKLAHOMA CITY , OK
Original Publish Date:	July 17, 2001
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	The NTSB traveled to the scene of this accident.
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=49081

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).