



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	STANLEY, Idaho	Accident Number:	SEA99LA124
Date & Time:	July 16, 1999, 09:55 Local	Registration:	N5304K
Aircraft:	Navion B	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:		Injuries:	2 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

Analysis

The pilot reported that he first over flew the airstrip to assess the landing field. The pilot stated that he was aware that this was a 'one way strip' and that he would be landing with a tailwind of about ten knots. The pilot stated that just prior to flaring, the airplane was about 20 to 30 feet above ground level, when it suddenly went straight down. The pilot applied full power, however, the airplane continued the rapid descent and subsequently landed hard on all three landing gear. Both the pilot and the flight instructor on board felt that the aircraft was hit with a strong tailwind gust.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: An improperly planned approach and gusting wind conditions. A tailwind was a factor.

Findings

Occurrence #1: HARD LANDING
Phase of Operation: LANDING

Findings

1. (F) WEATHER CONDITION - TAILWIND
2. (C) PLANNED APPROACH - IMPROPER - PILOT IN COMMAND
3. (C) WEATHER CONDITION - GUSTS

Factual Information

On July 16, 1999, at 0955 mountain daylight time, a Navion B, N5304K, registered to and operated by the pilot as a 14 CFR Part 91 personal flight, landed hard at the Sulphur Creek Ranch airstrip, located about 30 miles northwest of Stanley, Idaho. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time and no flight plan was filed. The airplane was substantially damaged and the private pilot and flight instructor were not injured. The flight departed from McCall, Idaho, about 30 minutes prior to the accident.

The pilot reported that he was participating in a mountain flying seminar that consisted of practicing takeoffs and landings at high density altitude to short dirt/grass airstrips in canyons and valleys. The pilot stated that he circled the airstrip twice to assess the landing field. The pilot reported that he entered the pattern at about 900 feet above ground level for landing on runway 26 with a tailwind of about ten knots. The pilot stated that just prior to flaring, the airplane was about 20 to 30 feet above ground level, when it suddenly went straight down. The pilot applied full power, however, the airplane continued to descend and landed hard on all three landing gear. The landing roll was uneventful and the pilot taxied the airplane to parking to check for damage. The pilot reported that he felt that a sudden down draft or high tailwind gust caused the airplane to drop like it did.

The flight instructor reported that the pilot did not have time to react to the tailwind gust which resulted in the aircraft's rapid descent and subsequent hard landing.

The Idaho Airport Facilities Directory recommends "land runway 26 (upstream), takeoff runway 8 (downstream); one way strip."

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	60, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medical--w/ waivers/lim	Last FAA Medical Exam:	June 29, 1999
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	491 hours (Total, all aircraft), 391 hours (Total, this make and model)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Navion	Registration:	N5304K
Model/Series:	B B	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	2204B
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	June 5, 1999 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	3100 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	30 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	2600 Hrs	Engine Manufacturer:	Continental
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	IO-520B
Registered Owner:	THEODORE C. CARR	Rated Power:	285 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:		Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:		Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	10 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	260°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:		Temperature/Dew Point:	16°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	MCCALL , ID (MYL)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:		Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	09:30 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class G

Airport Information

Airport:	SULPHUR CREEK RANCH	Runway Surface Type:	Grass/turf
Airport Elevation:	5835 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	26	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	3300 ft / 40 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Traffic pattern

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	2 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 None	Latitude, Longitude:	44.260993,-114.969932(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Eckrote, Debra
Additional Participating Persons:	LEON LINDSAY; BOISE , ID
Original Publish Date:	October 13, 2000
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=46985

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).