



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	NASHVILLE, Tennessee	Accident Number:	ATL99LA069
Date & Time:	April 6, 1999, 04:50 Local	Registration:	N80UL
Aircraft:	Beech 58	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:		Injuries:	1 Minor
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 135: Air taxi & commuter - Non-scheduled		

Analysis

The approach controller issued the pilot an approach clearance to runway 2C. While on final approach, the pilot recalled that there were rain showers and high winds associated with thunderstorm activity in the immediate vicinity of the approach facilities. Upon realizing that his final approach altitude was too high, the pilot requested a landing on runway 2L. The controller cleared the flight to land on the requested runway; however, the airplane collided with the ground as the pilot maneuvered for a landing back to runway 2C, and came to rest about 200 yards left of the approach end of the runway. The pilot did not report a mechanical problem with the airplane during the flight. The pilot reported experiencing moderate rain and strong winds out of the northwest while maneuvering for the landing. A review of the available runways at the airport revealed that runway 31 was available and was 11,000 feet long. The prevailing winds at the time of the accident were 300 degrees at 19 knots with wind gust to 20 knots. According to the flight manual for the Beech 58, the cross wind component is approximately 19 knots.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's inflight decision to land on a runway with a strong cross wind, rather than on a runway into the wind. A factor was the strong cross wind conditions.

Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF CONTROL - ON GROUND/WATER

Phase of Operation: APPROACH - VFR PATTERN - FINAL APPROACH

Findings

1. (F) WEATHER CONDITION - CROSSWIND
2. (C) IN-FLIGHT PLANNING/DECISION - IMPROPER - PILOT IN COMMAND

Factual Information

On April 6, 1999, at 0450 central daylight time, a Beech 58, N80UL, collided with the ground and burst into flames during an instrument approach to runway 2C at the Nashville International Airport in Nashville, Tennessee. The cargo flight was operated by Paragon Air Express Inc., under the provisions of Title 14 CFR Part 135 with an instrument flight plan filed. Visual weather conditions prevailed at the time of the accident. The airplane sustained substantial damage. The commercial pilot received minor injuries. The flight departed Memphis, Tennessee, at 0340.

The pilot reported that upon arriving in the Nashville area, the approach controller issued him an approach clearance to runway 2C. While on final approach, the pilot recalled that there were rain showers and high winds associated with thunderstorm activity in the immediate vicinity of the approach facilities. Upon realizing that his final approach altitude was too high, the pilot requested a 2L landing; the controller cleared the flight to land on runway 2L. The airplane collided with the ground as the pilot maneuvered for a landing back to runway 2C (see attached pilot accident report form).

Examination of the accident site disclosed that the airplane came to rest about 200 yards left of the approach end of runway 2C, and was oriented on a southwest heading. There was extensive fire damage to both outboard panels of the wing assembly. The pilot did not report a mechanical problem with the airplane during the flight. The pilot reported experiencing moderate rain and strong winds out of the northwest while maneuvering for the landing.

A review of the pilot's flight training records disclosed that the pilot completed his initial operation training on January 11, 1999. The pilot had accumulated a total of 1353 flight hours as a pilot of which 176 hours had been flown in the Beech 58.

A review of the available runways at Nashville International Airport revealed that runway 31 was available and is 11,000 feet long. The prevailing winds at the time of the accident were 300 degrees at 19 knots with wind gust to 20 knots. According to the flight manual for the Beech 58, the cross wind component is approximately 19 knots.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Commercial	Age:	48, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 2 Valid Medical--no waivers/lim.	Last FAA Medical Exam:	August 25, 1998
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	1353 hours (Total, all aircraft), 176 hours (Total, this make and model), 176 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 36 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Beech	Registration:	N80UL
Model/Series:	58 58	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	TH-1008
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	2
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	March 18, 1999 100 hour	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	5400 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	60 Hrs	Engines:	2 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	6927 Hrs	Engine Manufacturer:	Continental
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	IO-520CB40
Registered Owner:	PARAGON AIR EXPRESS, INC	Rated Power:	285 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	On-demand air taxi (135)
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Night/dark
Observation Facility, Elevation:	BNA ,599 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:	04:54 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Unknown	Visibility	6 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Broken / 3100 ft AGL	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	19 knots / 20 knots	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	300°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	29 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	16°C / 14°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	N/A - None - Rain		
Departure Point:	MEMPHIS , TN (MEM)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	IFR
Destination:	(BNA)	Type of Clearance:	IFR
Departure Time:	03:40 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class A

Airport Information

Airport:	NASHVILLE INTERNATIONAL BNA	Runway Surface Type:	Concrete
Airport Elevation:	599 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Wet
Runway Used:	2	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	8000 ft / 150 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full stop

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Minor	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	Unknown
Total Injuries:	1 Minor	Latitude, Longitude:	

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Powell, Phillip
Additional Participating Persons:	GEORGE ERDEL; NASHVILLE , TN
Original Publish Date:	June 21, 2000
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=46025

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).