

Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	TUCSON, Arizona		Accident Number:	LAX99LA046
Date & Time:	December 11, 199	98, 16:00 Local	Registration:	N9320N
Aircraft:	Piper	PA-28R-200	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:			Injuries:	2 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Instructional			

Analysis

The purpose of the flight was to conduct a proficiency check. The flight instructor demonstrated a soft field landing from the right seat. On the landing rollout the airplane veered to the right. The airplane was configured with left-hand toe brakes only. Brakes on the right side are optional, and this particular airplane did not come equipped with right side brakes. He was unable to regain control of the airplane and it continued off of the runway and the gear collapsed. The flight instructor felt that the student pilot panicked and he did not respond quickly enough to the situation. He believed that the pilot continued to apply incorrect inputs into the steering and brakes to control the airplane. The airplane's landing gear and braking system were inspected, as well as the airplane maintenance logs, no discrepancies were noted.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: Failure of the instructor pilot to maintain directional control and properly supervise the landing. A contributing factor was the unavailability of brakes on the instructor's side (the right side) of the airplane.

Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF CONTROL - ON GROUND/WATER Phase of Operation: LANDING - ROLL

Findings

(C) DIRECTIONAL CONTROL - NOT MAINTAINED - PILOT IN COMMAND(CFI)
(C) SUPERVISION - INADEQUATE - PILOT IN COMMAND(CFI)
(F) BRAKES(NORMAL) - UNAVAILABLE - PILOT IN COMMAND(CFI)

Occurrence #2: ON GROUND/WATER ENCOUNTER WITH TERRAIN/WATER Phase of Operation: LANDING - ROLL

Findings

4. TERRAIN CONDITION - DITCH

Factual Information

On December 11, 1998, at 1600 hours mountain standard time, a Piper PA-28R-200, N9320N, veered off the right side of runway 6R and struck a ditch on the landing rollout at Ryan Field, Tucson, Arizona. The airplane, operated under 14 CFR Part 91, sustained substantial damage. The flight instructor and the private pilot/owner were not injured. Visual meteorological conditions existed for the local instructional flight that had originated at 1530. No flight plan was filed.

In the instructor's written statement he reported that the purpose of the flight was to conduct a proficiency check for the private pilot. He stated that he was demonstrating a soft field landing. The instructor reported that the airplane was in a nose-high configuration and he was not applying brakes (as brakes are not available on the right side of this model) on the landing rollout. He stated that he felt a "sudden abrupt veering to the right - unable to get longitudinal control (no brakes on right side of arrow)." The airplane veered off the runway, the gear collapsed, and they exited the airplane without injury. No mechanical anomalies were noted with the airplane or engine by the instructor pilot.

In a subsequent interview with a Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) inspector, the instructor and son of the pilot reported that the pilot had lost control of the airplane after landing, and that the instructor was not quick enough to respond to the situation. The instructor felt that the pilot panicked and continued to apply incorrect inputs into the steering and brakes to control the airplane.

An FAA inspector reviewed the maintenance logbook and found no discrepancies. He further examined the landing gear and braking system, and found no abnormalities that may have contributed to the accident.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Airline transport; Commercial; Flight instructor	Age:	34,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Right
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane multi-engine; Airplane single-engine; Instrument airplane	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 1 Valid Medicalno waivers/lim.	Last FAA Medical Exam:	August 29, 1998
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	2719 hours (Total, all aircraft), 42 hours (Total, this make and model), 2607 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 604 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 92 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 4 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Piper	Registration:	N9320N
Model/Series:	PA-28R-200 PA-28R-200	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	28R-35020
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2600 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:		Engine Manufacturer:	Lycoming
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	IO-360-C1C
Registered Owner:	RICK AND THEOPHANE SAITAS	Rated Power:	180 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	RYN ,2403 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:	16:26 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	40 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	4 knots / None	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	330°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	15°C / 3°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipita	ation	
Departure Point:	(RYN)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:		Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	15:30 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class D

Airport Information

Airport:	RYAN FIELD RYN	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	2403 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	6R	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	5500 ft / 75 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full stop

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	2 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 None	Latitude, Longitude:	32.220218,-110.969039(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Cornejo, Tealeye		
Additional Participating Persons:	RENNIE LUTZ; SCOTTSDALE , AZ		
Original Publish Date:	September 28, 2000		
Last Revision Date:			
Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>		
Note:			
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=45468		

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available here.