



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	STANLEY, Idaho	Accident Number:	SEA96LA151
Date & Time:	July 10, 1996, 13:10 Local	Registration:	N5352P
Aircraft:	Piper PA-24-250	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:		Injuries:	3 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

Analysis

While on an approach to land at a mountain airstrip, the pilot encountered crosswinds. He stated that substantial left rudder was required to counteract a crosswind during the flare. After touchdown, the aircraft went to the left. The pilot attempted to recover with right rudder, but the airplane continued to skid left on the turf runway. Since the airplane did not have toe brakes installed, the pilot was unable to use differential braking. The airplane continued to the left, hit a ditch and stopped, collapsing the landing gear and causing substantial damage.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: the pilot's inadequate compensation for the wind conditions, and his failure to maintain directional control of the airplane, which resulted in an inadvertent ground swerve. The crosswind was a related factor.

Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF CONTROL - ON GROUND/WATER
Phase of Operation: LANDING

Findings

1. (F) WEATHER CONDITION - CROSSWIND
2. (C) COMPENSATION FOR WIND CONDITIONS - INADEQUATE - PILOT IN COMMAND
3. (C) DIRECTIONAL CONTROL - NOT MAINTAINED - PILOT IN COMMAND
4. (C) GROUND LOOP/SWERVE - INADVERTENT - PILOT IN COMMAND

Occurrence #2: ON GROUND/WATER ENCOUNTER WITH TERRAIN/WATER
Phase of Operation: LANDING - ROLL

Findings

5. TERRAIN CONDITION - DITCH

Factual Information

On July 10, 1996, approximately 1310 mountain daylight time, N5352P, a Piper PA-24-250, sustained substantial damage during landing at Smiley Creek airstrip, near Stanley, Idaho. The private pilot and his two passengers were uninjured. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time of the occurrence. The flight had departed from Ogden, Utah, approximately 1130, and was to have been operated in accordance with 14 CFR 91. There was no report of the ELT actuating.

The pilot encountered a crosswind while on landing approach to runway 14 of the 4900 foot turf airstrip. He stated that as he was flaring, it took substantial left rudder to counteract the crosswind. Upon touchdown the airplane went left. He applied right rudder and the airplane "continued to skid left on the (turf) runway. I applied the hand brake (it had no toe brakes, hence no differential steering) and kept the aircraft as straight as possible, so [as] not to cartwheel. I never did get traction, continued to veer left, hit the ditch, and then stopped in the barbed wire fence." The pilot added that the wind seemed to be consistent in both direction and velocity on final, however when he was flaring he felt it both gusted and swirled. He stated that there was no chance to abort the landing at that time. The left main landing gear collapsed, nose gear separated, and the right main strut penetrated the right wing.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	31,U
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 2 Valid Medical-w/ waivers/lim	Last FAA Medical Exam:	August 21, 1995
Occupational Pilot:	UNK	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	212 hours (Total, all aircraft), 141 hours (Total, this make and model), 182 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 14 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 14 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Piper	Registration:	N5352P
Model/Series:	PA-24-250 PA-24-250	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	24-399
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	July 2, 1996 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2800 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	14 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	4333 Hrs	Engine Manufacturer:	Lycoming
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	O-540-A1A5
Registered Owner:	ALLAN G. FLATAU	Rated Power:	250 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:		Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:		Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Scattered / 7000 ft AGL	Visibility	30 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	4 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	20°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	24°C / 11°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	OGDEN , UT (OGD)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	(U87)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	11:30 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class G

Airport Information

Airport:	SMILEY CREEK U87	Runway Surface Type:	Grass/turf
Airport Elevation:	7160 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	14	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	4900 ft / 150 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full stop

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	2 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	3 None	Latitude, Longitude:	44.259277,-114.97055(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Stockhill, Michael
Additional Participating Persons:	RUSSELL GRAVES; BOISE , ID
Original Publish Date:	February 28, 1997
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=42414

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).