



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	PAINESVILLE, Ohio	Accident Number:	NYC92LA031
Date & Time:	November 15, 1991, 23:00 Local	Registration:	N9637M
Aircraft:	MOONEY M20C	Aircraft Damage:	Destroyed
Defining Event:		Injuries:	2 Fatal
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

Analysis

THE TWO PILOTS DEPARTED KEENE, NH, IFR AND UPON ARRIVAL AT PAINESVILLE, OH, THEY RECEIVED A CLEARANCE TO EXECUTE THE NDB B APPROACH. ONE OF THE PILOTS CANCELLED THE IFR FLIGHT PLAN AND REPORTED THE AIRPORT IN SIGHT. THE CONTROLLER QUERIED THE PILOT WHEN HE OBSERVED THE AIRPLANE ON RADAR 4 MILES FROM THE AIRPORT. ONE OF THE PILOTS INDICATED THEY WERE MANEUVERING TO LAND ON A DIFFERENT RUNWAY. THE AIRPLANE STRUCK A 150 FOOT TALL POWERLINE SUPPORT TOWER APPROXIMATELY 140 FEET ABOVE THE GROUND. THE VISIBILITY AT THE TIME OF THE ACCIDENT WAS LESS THAN ONE MILE IN RAIN AND FOG. POST ACCIDENT EXAMINATION OF THE WRECKAGE REVEALED THE AIRPLANE WAS NOT EQUIPPED WITH AN ADF.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: THE PILOT'S FAILURE TO SEE AND AVOID THE POWERLINE TOWER STRUCTURE WHILE EXECUTING A VISUAL APPROACH TO THE AIRPORT. FACTORS RELATED TO THE ACCIDENT WERE THE LACK OF PROPER RADIO EQUIPMENT NECESSARY TO EXECUTE THE INSTRUMENT APPROACH, RESTRICTED VISIBILITY AND NIGHT CONDITIONS.

Findings

Occurrence #1: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER
Phase of Operation: APPROACH

Findings

1. (F) WEATHER CONDITION - LOW CEILING
2. (F) WEATHER CONDITION - FOG
3. (F) WEATHER CONDITION - RAIN
4. (F) LIGHT CONDITION - DARK NIGHT
5. FLIGHT/NAV INSTRUMENTS,RADIO MAGNETIC INDICATOR - NOT INSTALLED
6. (C) IN-FLIGHT PLANNING/DECISION - IMPROPER - PILOT IN COMMAND
7. (C) IFR PROCEDURE - NOT POSSIBLE - PILOT IN COMMAND
8. OBJECT - TOWER(MARKED)
9. (C) CLEARANCE - NOT MAINTAINED - PILOT IN COMMAND

Factual Information

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	48, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Unknown
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medical--no waivers/lim.	Last FAA Medical Exam:	July 21, 1989
Occupational Pilot:	UNK	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	2896 hours (Total, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	MOONEY	Registration:	N9637M
Model/Series:	M20C M20C	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	670108
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	November 1, 1986 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2500 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	1010 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	4762 Hrs	Engine Manufacturer:	LYCOMING
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	O-360-A1D
Registered Owner:	SMITH, HARRY E.	Rated Power:	
Operator:	SMITH, HARRY E.	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Instrument (IMC)	Condition of Light:	Night/dark
Observation Facility, Elevation:		Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:		Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:		Visibility	1 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Overcast / 500 ft AGL	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	16 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	260°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	12°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	N/A - None - Fog		
Departure Point:	KEENE , NH (EEN)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	IFR
Destination:		Type of Clearance:	IFR
Departure Time:	18:15 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class E

Airport Information

Airport:		Runway Surface Type:	
Airport Elevation:		Runway Surface Condition:	
Runway Used:	0	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:		VFR Approach/Landing:	None

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	2 Fatal	Aircraft Damage:	Destroyed
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	On-ground
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 Fatal	Latitude, Longitude:	41.720676,-81.239349(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Feith, Gregory
Additional Participating Persons:	ROBERT TAYLOR; CLEVELAND , OH
Original Publish Date:	May 27, 1993
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=37108

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).