



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	MONTGOMERY, New York	Accident Number:	NYC92LA012
Date & Time:	October 19, 1991, 11:40 Local	Registration:	N9122P
Aircraft:	PIPER PA-24-260	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:		Injuries:	2 Minor
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Instructional		

Analysis

DURING INITIAL CLIMB, THE ENGINE QUIT THEN STARTED AGAIN. THE ENGINE THEN FAILED TOTALLY, AND THE PILOT ELECTED TO MAKE A FORCED LANDING. DURING THE DESCENT, THE AIRPLANE HIT TREES. WRECKAGE EXAMINATION SHOWED THE RIGHT FUEL TANK EMPTY, WITH NO EVIDENCE OF FUEL LEAKAGE. THE LEFT MAIN FUEL TANK WAS HALF FULL AND BOTH AUXILIARY TANKS WERE FULL. THE FUEL SELECTOR VALVE SWITCH WAS IN THE 'OFF' POSITION, FUEL BOOST PUMP IN THE 'ON' POSITION, AND FUEL STRAINER AND SUMP VOID OF ANY FUEL. EXAMINATION OF THE AIRFRAME AND ENGINE REVEALED NO DISCREPANCIES. THE PILOT-IN-COMMAND HAD A TOTAL OF 2 FLIGHT HOURS IN THIS TYPE OF AIRPLANE.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: FAILURE OF THE PILOT-IN-COMMAND TO CORRECTLY POSITION THE FUEL SELECTOR WHEN THE RIGHT MAIN FUEL TANK WAS EXHAUSTED, RESULTING IN FUEL STARVATION TO THE ENGINE.

Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF ENGINE POWER(TOTAL) - NONMECHANICAL
Phase of Operation: CLIMB

Findings

1. (C) FUEL TANK SELECTOR POSITION - NOT CORRECTED - PILOT IN COMMAND
 2. (C) FLUID,FUEL - STARVATION
 3. (F) REMEDIAL ACTION - NOT PERFORMED - PILOT IN COMMAND
 4. (F) LACK OF TOTAL EXPERIENCE IN TYPE OF AIRCRAFT - PILOT IN COMMAND
-

Occurrence #2: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH OBJECT
Phase of Operation: DESCENT - EMERGENCY

Findings

5. (F) OBJECT - TREE(S)

Factual Information

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Commercial; Flight instructor	Age:	23, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Right
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane single-engine; Instrument airplane	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 1 Valid Medical--no waivers/lim.	Last FAA Medical Exam:	June 3, 1991
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	850 hours (Total, all aircraft), 2 hours (Total, this make and model), 700 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 65 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 36 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	PIPER	Registration:	N9122P
Model/Series:	PA-24-260 PA-24-260	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	24-4601
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	January 2, 2000 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	3200 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	6 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	3532 Hrs	Engine Manufacturer:	LYCOMING
ELT:	Installed, activated, did not aid in locating accident	Engine Model/Series:	IO-540-D4A5
Registered Owner:	KLAUS REYROTH	Rated Power:	260 Horsepower
Operator:	DAVID H. BALSAN	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:		Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:		Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Unknown	Visibility	20 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Unknown	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	/	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	0°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:		Temperature/Dew Point:	18°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:		Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	WEST MILFORD , NJ (41N)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	11:40 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class D;Class E

Airport Information

Airport:	ORANGE COUNTY MGJ	Runway Surface Type:	Concrete
Airport Elevation:	365 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	21	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	5006 ft / 100 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Forced landing;Touch and go;Traffic pattern

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	2 Minor	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 Minor	Latitude, Longitude:	41.640888,-73.559417(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Yurman, Alan
Additional Participating Persons:	A.C. MCCLAIN; TETERBORO , NJ
Original Publish Date:	March 31, 1993
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=37093

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).