

Aviation Investigation Final Report

| Location: | SAN CARLOS, Calif | ornia | Accident Number: | LAX97LA132 |
|-------------------------|---------------------|-------------------|----------------------|-------------|
| Date & Time: | March 27, 1997, 09 | :48 Local | Registration: | N60TJ |
| Aircraft: | Beech | 100 | Aircraft Damage: | Substantial |
| Defining Event: | | | Injuries: | 1 None |
| Flight Conducted Under: | Part 91: General av | iation - Personal | | |

Analysis

According to the aircraft operator, during a landing, the aircraft dropped approximately 10 feet onto the runway. The aircraft touched down with enough force as to warrant concern by the operator and the pilot. The pilot stated that the gear warning horn was activated after the landing. He examined the landing gear and bent the squat switches to silence the horn, then conducted a test flight. Before landing, three green gear down lights were observed; however, the left landing gear collapsed during the rollout. Before coming to rest, the aircraft struck a sign and three runway lights. The aircraft landing gear was inspected by the FAA and a technical representative (tech rep) from Raytheon Aircraft Company. The tech rep reported that the downlock plates were bent from the hard landing. Review of the logbooks revealed that the aircraft did not have a primary 150-hour inspection, since August 1993, and was in an unairworthy condition. Due to the extent of damage to the landing gear, no preexisting anomalies in those components could be identified.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: the pilot's improper flare, which resulted in a hard landing; his improper adjustment of the landing gear warning horn squat switch(es); and his decision to attempt flight with known equipment deficiencies.

Findings

Occurrence #1: HARD LANDING Phase of Operation: LANDING - FLARE/TOUCHDOWN

Findings 1. (C) FLARE - IMPROPER - PILOT IN COMMAND 2. LANDING GEAR, GEAR LOCKING MECHANISM - BENT

Occurrence #2: MAIN GEAR COLLAPSED Phase of Operation: LANDING - ROLL

Findings

3. (C) MAINTENANCE, ADJUSTMENT - IMPROPER - PILOT IN COMMAND
4. LANDING GEAR, GEAR WARNING SYSTEM - MALFUNCTION
5. (C) OPERATION WITH KNOWN DEFICIENCIES IN EQUIPMENT - ATTEMPTED - PILOT IN COMMAND
6. GEAR DOWN AND LOCKED - NOT ATTAINED

Occurrence #3: ON GROUND/WATER COLLISION WITH OBJECT Phase of Operation: LANDING

Findings 7. OBJECT - AIRPORT SIGN/MARKER 8. OBJECT - RUNWAY LIGHT

Factual Information

On March 27, 1997, at 0948 hours Pacific standard time, a Beech 100, N60TJ, was substantially damaged when the left landing gear collapsed during landing on runway 12 at the San Carlos, California, airport. The aircraft struck a sign and three runway lights. The airline transport pilot, the sole occupant, was not injured. Visual meteorological conditions existed for the local business flight and no flight plan was filed.

In an interview with Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) inspectors from the San Jose, California, Flight Standards District Office, the pilot stated that after landing the first time at the airport he had a gear warning horn on taxiing. After adjusting the squat switch to terminate the horn he decided to do a test hop to check it out. On landing rollout the aircraft started to veer off the runway. The pilot reported that he corrected as much as he could but the aircraft continued off the runway. Prior to touchdown he observed three green gear down lights. He reported that approximately 6 to 8 months ago all three gears were replaced with rebuilt gears per an airworthiness directive.

Following his statement, the pilot subsequently declined to provide any information to either the Safety Board or the FAA.

In a separate report, a representative of the company which owns the aircraft said that upon landing the aircraft dropped approximately 10 feet onto the runway in a hard landing. The operator stated that the passenger departed the aircraft and the pilot made a visual inspection of the landing gear, then made a decision to test fly the aircraft in the pattern and make a landing before the passenger returned from his business meeting. The operator reported that the pilot told them that the flight went well and all systems checked out, including a recycling of landing gear. The landing went well but on rollout to taxi the left landing gear collapsed.

According to records at the San Carlos Air Traffic Control Tower, the initial landing was 15 to 20 minutes prior to the accident. The pilot made a full stop, taxied in, taxied out, went around the pattern, and then landed. That was when the accident occurred.

A technical representative for the Raytheon Aircraft Company examined the aircraft under the supervision of the FAA. He reported that the right main gear downlock plate was bent approximately 25 degrees, and the left main gear downlock plate was bent 45 degrees. He further stated that the downlock plates appeared to have been bent from the hard landing. The downlock blocks were engaged which prevented the drag legs from moving into a retracted position. The aircraft landed normally with the downlocks holding the landing gear into position. Upon going into reverse and the weight of the aircraft shifting aft, the left-hand lock plate bent 45 degrees which released it from the downlock allowing the left-hand main gear to collapse. The consultant stated that the excessive load placed on the actuator would have

caused the mount to fail, dislodging the actuator and bending the shaft.

The FAA inspector stated that there were no preexisting anomalies found with the landing gear due to the damage.

A review of the aircraft's logbooks was conducted by the FAA inspectors. They reported that this aircraft has a history of being in an "unairworthy" condition. Since August 1993, this aircraft has not had a primary 150-hour inspection per Beech maintenance program requirements. In June 1995, the aircraft was inspected at a Beech maintenance facility, who told the owner that it was in an unairworthy condition. The owner then removed the aircraft from the facility with no further work performed by the facility. On August 24, 1995, the aircraft's landing gear was overhauled and deficient items noted by the previous company were corrected, with no mention of the primary 150-hour inspection. The aircraft was flown to Texas for engine work, where it remained for approximately 5 months. The engines were disassembled and inspected. A logbook entry notes that per customer's request the engines were reassembled for shipping purposes only and not reinstalled on the aircraft. It was noted by the company in Texas in the same entry that the aircraft was in an unairworthy condition. See attached file Record of Log Book Review.

Pilot Information

| Certificate: | Airline transport | Age: | 52,Male |
|---------------------------|--|-----------------------------------|--------------------|
| Airplane Rating(s): | Single-engine land; Single-engine sea; Multi-engine sea | Seat Occupied: | Left |
| Other Aircraft Rating(s): | None | Restraint Used: | |
| Instrument Rating(s): | None | Second Pilot Present: | No |
| Instructor Rating(s): | None | Toxicology Performed: | No |
| Medical Certification: | Class 2 Valid Medicalno waivers/lim. | Last FAA Medical Exam: | September 13, 1996 |
| Occupational Pilot: | UNK | Last Flight Review or Equivalent: | |
| Flight Time: | 1500 hours (Total, all aircraft) | | |

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

| Aircraft Make: | Beech | Registration: | N60TJ |
|----------------------------------|---------------------------------|-----------------------------------|----------------|
| Model/Series: | 100 100 | Aircraft Category: | Airplane |
| Year of Manufacture: | | Amateur Built: | |
| Airworthiness Certificate: | Normal | Serial Number: | BE-21 |
| Landing Gear Type: | Retractable - Tricycle | Seats: | 11 |
| Date/Type of Last Inspection: | Unknown | Certified Max Gross Wt.: | 10600 lbs |
| Time Since Last Inspection: | | Engines: | 2 Turbo prop |
| Airframe Total Time: | | Engine Manufacturer: | Airesearch |
| ELT: | | Engine Model/Series: | TPE-331 |
| Registered Owner: | ANDREA LEASING | Rated Power: | 210 Horsepower |
| Operator: | A&A REOMIX CONCRETE MIX INC. | Operating Certificate(s) Held: | None |
| Operator Does Business As: | | Operator Designator Code: | |

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

| Conditions at Accident Site: | Visual (VMC) | Condition of Light: | Day |
|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|---|---------|
| Observation Facility, Elevation: | | Distance from Accident Site: | |
| Observation Time: | | Direction from Accident Site: | |
| Lowest Cloud Condition: | Clear | Visibility | |
| Lowest Ceiling: | None | Visibility (RVR): | |
| Wind Speed/Gusts: | / | Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual: | / |
| Wind Direction: | 0° | Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual: | / |
| Altimeter Setting: | | Temperature/Dew Point: | |
| Precipitation and Obscuration: | No Obscuration; No Precipitation | | |
| Departure Point: | (SQL) | Type of Flight Plan Filed: | None |
| Destination: | | Type of Clearance: | VFR |
| Departure Time: | 09:48 Local | Type of Airspace: | Class D |

Airport Information

| Airport: | SAN CARLOS SQL | Runway Surface Type: | Asphalt |
|----------------------|-----------------|----------------------------------|-----------|
| Airport Elevation: | 2 ft msl | Runway Surface Condition: | Dry |
| Runway Used: | 12 | IFR Approach: | |
| Runway Length/Width: | 2600 ft / 75 ft | VFR Approach/Landing: | Full stop |

Wreckage and Impact Information

| Crew Injuries: | 1 None | Aircraft Damage: | Substantial |
|------------------------|--------|-------------------------|--------------------------|
| Passenger Injuries: | | Aircraft Fire: | None |
| Ground Injuries: | N/A | Aircraft Explosion: | None |
| Total Injuries: | 1 None | Latitude, Longitude: | 37.48933,-122.25933(est) |

Administrative Information

| Investigator In Charge (IIC): | Cornejo, Tealeye | |
|--------------------------------------|---|--|
| Additional Participating Persons: | JIM FRIEL; SAN JOSE , CA MARGARET J FREYDOZ; SAN JOSE , CA | |
| Original Publish Date: | June 26, 1998 | |
| Last Revision Date: | | |
| Investigation Class: | <u>Class</u> | |
| Note: | | |
| Investigation Docket: | https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=29750 | |

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available <u>here</u>.