

Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	ELKO, Nevada		Accident Number:	LAX95LA275
Date & Time:	July 29, 1995, 15:27	' Local	Registration:	N9599Y
Aircraft:	BEECH	P35	Aircraft Damage:	Destroyed
Defining Event:			Injuries:	1 Fatal
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General avi	ation - Personal		

Analysis

THE CROSS-COUNTRY PILOT WAS CLEARED TO LAND ON RUNWAY 12, WITH THE WINDS REPORTED TO BE FROM 190 TO 230 DEGREES AT 35 KNOTS. THE PILOT WAS OBSERVED TO BE LANDING TOO LONG AND HE STATED HE WAS GOING AROUND. GROUND WITNESSES OBSERVED THE AIRCRAFT BEGIN A TURN TO THE LEFT, FLYING AT A SLOW AIRSPEED AND AT A LOW ALTITUDE, WITH THE WINGS ROCKING BACK AND FORTH. THEY THEN SAW THE AIRCRAFT STALL AND DESCEND NOSE FIRST INTO THE GROUND. THE OTHER RUNWAY (05/23) THAT WAS MORE FAVORABLE FOR THE WIND CONDITIONS WAS CLOSED DUE TO CONSTRUCTION.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: the failure of the pilot to maintain airspeed in a turn during high wind conditions while executing a go-around at a low altitude, which resulted in an inadvertent stall and an uncontrolled descent into the ground.

Findings

Occurrence #1: IN FLIGHT ENCOUNTER WITH WEATHER Phase of Operation: GO-AROUND (VFR)

Findings 1. (F) WEATHER CONDITION - CROSSWIND 2. (F) WEATHER CONDITION - GUSTS3. (F) WEATHER CONDITION - SAND/DUST STORM

Occurrence #2: LOSS OF CONTROL - IN FLIGHT Phase of Operation: GO-AROUND (VFR)

Findings

4. (C) STALL/MUSH - INADVERTENT - PILOT IN COMMAND 5. (C) AIRSPEED(VMC) - NOT MAINTAINED - PILOT IN COMMAND

Occurrence #3: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER Phase of Operation: DESCENT - UNCONTROLLED

Factual Information

On July 29, 1995, at 1527 hours Pacific daylight time, a Beech P35, N9599Y, owned and operated by the pilot, crashed during a go-around at the airport in Elko, Nevada. The aircraft was destroyed and the private pilot was fatally injured. The aircraft had departed earlier from Ogden, Utah, with a destination of Sacramento, California. The pilot received a weather briefing from the Flight Service Station (FSS) at Cedar City, Utah, and an updated briefing from the Reno FSS for the Sacramento area when approaching Elko.

According to the Elko air traffic controller, the pilot reported that he was northeast of the airport and would like to land. The winds at the time were variable from 190 to 230 degrees at 23 knots, gusting to 35 knots. The aircraft appeared to land too long and the pilot stated he was going around and would attempt to land on runway 30. The pilot made a left turn and was then observed to nose down into the ground. The pilot indicated no mechanical problems with the aircraft during these radio transmissions.

According to ground witnesses, the aircraft started a left turn at a low altitude and was observed to be flying at a slow speed with the wings rocking back and forth. All of the witnesses commented on the windy conditions, with several stating the pilot was in obvious trouble because of them. It was during the turn to the left that some of them observed the aircraft stall and descend nose down into the ground.

Examination of the aircraft under the supervision of an FAA inspector from the Reno, Nevada, Flight Standards District Office found that the landing gear and the flaps were retracted at the time of impact. There was no ground fire and no evidence found of an aircraft malfunction. See the attachments to this report for details.

The elevation of the Elko airport is 5,135 feet and the temperature was recorded as 89 degrees. The density altitude was estimated to be about 8,000 feet. Also recorded shortly after the accident was a visibility of 2.5 miles with blowing dust and variable winds from 190 to 260 degrees at 28 knots, gusting to 38 knots.

According to the tower controller, runway 05/23 was closed for construction and this was acknowledged by the pilot.

The toxicological report on the pilot was negative for carbon monoxide, drugs, cyanide, and ethanol.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	70,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	Yes
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medicalw/ waivers/lim	Last FAA Medical Exam:	January 17, 1995
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	717 hours (Total, all aircraft), 394 hours (Total, this make and model), 650 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	BEECH	Registration:	N9599Y
Model/Series:	P35 P35	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	D-7047
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	5
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	January 6, 1995 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	3125 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	67 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	2352 Hrs	Engine Manufacturer:	Continental
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	IO-470-N
Registered Owner:	JOHN H DOTTER	Rated Power:	260 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	EKO ,5135 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	2 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	15:29 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	160°
Lowest Cloud Condition:		Visibility	2.5 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Overcast / 20000 ft AGL	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	28 knots / 38 knots	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	260°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	29 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	32°C / 2°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	N/A - Blowing - Widespread dust		
Departure Point:	OGDEN , UT (OGD)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	SACRAMENTO , CA (SAC)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	15:15 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class D

Airport Information

Airport:	ELKO MUNICIPAL EKO	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	5135 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	12	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	3331 ft / 150 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full stop;Go around

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Fatal	Aircraft Damage:	Destroyed
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 Fatal	Latitude, Longitude:	40.94968,-115.789184(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Mucho, R	
Additional Participating Persons:	REID S WALBERG; RENO , NV	
Original Publish Date:	February 27, 1996	
Last Revision Date:		
Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>	
Note:		
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=29168	

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available here.