



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	FIREBAUGH, California	Accident Number:	LAX93LA370
Date & Time:	September 25, 1993, 14:30 Local	Registration:	N7246Z
Aircraft:	BEECH A-36	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:		Injuries:	2 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Instructional		

Analysis

THE PRIVATE PILOT/OWNER WAS TAKING PART IN A FLIGHT PROFICIENCY CLINIC. AT THE TIME OF THE ACCIDENT, THE PILOT WAS RECEIVING DUAL INSTRUCTION FROM A CERTIFIED FLIGHT INSTRUCTOR. AFTER LANDING AT THE AIRPORT AND WHILE TAXIING BACK TO THE LANDING RUNWAY THRESHOLD, THE CFI INSTRUCTED THE PILOT TO EXECUTE A SOFT FIELD TAKEOFF. THE PILOT DOES NOT HAVE ANY INDEPENDENT RECOLLECTION IF HE HAD RETRIMMED THE AIRPLANE BUT PROCEEDED TO EXECUTE THE SOFT FIELD TAKEOFF. ON LIFT-OFF THE AIRPLANE'S STALL WARNING ACTIVATED AND THE AIRPLANE BEGAN TO SETTLE. THE CFI ASSUMED THE FLIGHT CONTROLS. THE AIRPLANE STRUCK THE GROUND AND EXITED THE RUNWAY. THE NOSE GEAR BECAME ENTANGLED WITH THE 3 - 4 FT HIGH WEEDS ADJACENT TO THE RUNWAY.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: the CFI's inadequate supervision of the flight and his delay in taking remedial action; the dual student's premature liftoff and improper use of the flight controls. The high vegetation and soft terrain were factors in this accident.

Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF CONTROL - IN FLIGHT
Phase of Operation: TAKEOFF - INITIAL CLIMB

Findings

1. (C) LIFT-OFF - PREMATURE - DUAL STUDENT
2. (C) FLIGHT CONTROLS - IMPROPER USE OF - DUAL STUDENT
3. (F) STALL/MUSH - INADVERTENT - PILOT IN COMMAND(CFI)
4. (C) SUPERVISION - INADEQUATE - PILOT IN COMMAND(CFI)
5. (C) REMEDIAL ACTION - DELAYED - PILOT IN COMMAND(CFI)

Occurrence #2: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER
Phase of Operation: DESCENT - UNCONTROLLED

Findings

6. (F) TERRAIN CONDITION - HIGH VEGETATION
7. (F) TERRAIN CONDITION - SOFT

Factual Information

On September 25, 1993, at 1430 hours Pacific daylight time, a Beech A-36, N7246Z, collided with terrain at Firebaugh Airport, Firebaugh, California. The pilots were conducting a local visual flight rules instructional flight. The airplane, registered to and operated by the certificated private pilot receiving instruction, herein referred to as the dual student, sustained substantial damage. Neither the certificated airline transport pilot/flight instructor (CFI) nor the dual student were injured. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed. The flight originated at Fresno Air Terminal, Fresno, California, at 1230 hours.

Mr. Robert Follet, Wofford Flying Service, Fresno, California, told Safety Board investigators that the dual student was performing a soft field takeoff at the time of the accident. The airplane lifted off and then the stall warning horn activated. The airplane began to settle and the CFI took the controls to arrest the stall/mush, but without success. The airplane struck the ground and exited the runway.

The dual student submitted the required Pilot/Operator Aircraft Accident Report, NTSB Form 6120.1/2, together with a Statement of Incident. In the statement, he reported that the flight was part of a Bonanza Society Flight Proficiency Class which was conducted over a three-day period. Certified flight instructors provided ground and flight training for the participants.

While in the practice area, the CFI instructed the pilot to perform various maneuvers. The flight then proceeded to Los Banos Airport where the dual student performed normal and short field takeoffs and landings and then flew to Firebaugh Airport.

After landing at Firebaugh, the dual student returned to the departure end of the landing runway. When the airplane approached the runway threshold, while still on the taxiway, the CFI instructed the dual student execute a soft field takeoff. When approaching the hold short line, the dual student applied full power and pulled back on the yoke and turned onto the runway. The dual student then said, "The airplane appeared to be a little left of center line with a nose up attitude."

Almost immediately the CFI then said, "It's my plane, I have the plane." The airplane continued down the runway in a nose-up attitude and it drifted to the right of the centerline. The CFI pushed the nose down, but the airplane had already exited the runway and the nose gear became entangled with weeds between three and four feet high.

The CFI reportedly told the dual student immediately after the accident that, "I am sorry this happened Ernie, since I am pilot-in-command, I take full responsibility for this."

Mr. Jim Hallows, Aviation Safety Inspector (Operations), Fresno Flight Standards District

Office, reported that he administered a reexamination of the CFI on October 20, 1993. The CFI told him that he was pilot-in-command during the referenced accident flight. The CFI also stated that "he had just let things go too far before attempting to take corrective action."

The CFI did not file the Pilot/Operator Aircraft Accident Report, NTSB Form 6120.1/2, as required by Title 49 CFR 830.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Airline transport; Commercial; Flight instructor	Age:	32, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane multi-engine; Airplane single-engine; Instrument airplane	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 1 Valid Medical-w/ waivers/lim	Last FAA Medical Exam:	
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	231 hours (Total, all aircraft), 140 hours (Total, this make and model), 160 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 30 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 12 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	BEECH	Registration:	N7246Z
Model/Series:	A-36 A-36	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal; Utility	Serial Number:	2266
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	6
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	November 1, 1992 Continuous airworthiness	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	3600 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	515 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	515 Hrs	Engine Manufacturer:	CONTINENTAL
ELT:	Installed, activated, did not aid in locating accident	Engine Model/Series:	IO-550
Registered Owner:	EARNEST CAMACHO	Rated Power:	300 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:		Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:		Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	30 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	/	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	0°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:		Temperature/Dew Point:	37°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:		Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:		Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	14:30 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class G

Airport Information

Airport:	FIREBAUGH Q49	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:		Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	0	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:		VFR Approach/Landing:	None

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	2 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 None	Latitude, Longitude:	36.849178,-120.539657(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Llorente, A.
Additional Participating Persons:	DAVE LEHMAN; FRESNO , CA
Original Publish Date:	September 26, 1994
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=28490

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).