

Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	WILLARD, Ohio		Accident Number:	IAD96LA089
Date & Time:	June 3, 1996, 08:5	51 Local	Registration:	N86AT
Aircraft:	Piper	PA60-601P	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:			Injuries:	5 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 135: Air taxi & commuter - Non-scheduled			

Analysis

According to the pilot, when the airplane was about 35 feet above the ground during the approach to land at the destination airport, it yawed rapidly to the left. The pilot was unable to regain directional control or perform a go-around. The pilot stated that the airplane touched down on the runway '...in a right skid, causing [eventual landing] gear failure.' The police report indicated that there was an 11 mph left quartering headwind for the active runway at the time of the accident.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: the pilot's inability to maintain directional control of the airplane during the landing flare/touchdown.

Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF CONTROL - IN FLIGHT Phase of Operation: LANDING - FLARE/TOUCHDOWN

Findings 1. (C) DIRECTIONAL CONTROL - NOT MAINTAINED - PILOT IN COMMAND

Occurrence #2: GEAR COLLAPSED Phase of Operation: LANDING - ROLL Findings 2. LANDING GEAR, MAIN GEAR - OVERLOAD

Factual Information

On June 3, 1996, at approximately 0851 eastern daylight time, a Piper PA60-601P, N86AT, operated as an air taxi flight, sustained substantial damage when the right main landing gear collapsed during the landing at Willard Airport, in Willard, Ohio. The Airline Transport Pilot (ATP) rated pilot and the four passengers reported no injuries. An instrument flight rules (IFR) flight plan was filed; however, visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time of the accident. The pilot canceled the IFR flight plan at 0845 eastern daylight time. The flight operated under 14 CFR Part 135, and originated from Lancaster, Pennsylvania, at 0711 eastern daylight time, with an intended destination of Willard, Ohio.

The pilot stated that after he canceled the IFR flight plan, he tried, unsuccessfully, to obtain airport advisory information from Willard traffic and/or ground personnel. The pilot circled the airport to observe wind direction, determined that runway 28 was the active runway, and entered the traffic pattern to land on that runway. The pilot reported that as the airplane was at an altitude of about 35 feet, over the paved surface leading to the displaced threshold, the airplane yawed rapidly to the left, "...causing it to leave the runway centerline....." The pilot applied "...heavy pressure..." to the right rudder pedal in an attempt to regain directional control, but it "...had no effect."

The pilot stated that as the airplane slowed down it descended into a skid, he "...reached to retract the flaps to 20 degrees, but elected to fully retract the flaps instead to force the airplane onto the ground...." The pilot reported that he did not attempt a go-around because he did not feel that the airplane was responding predictably. The pilot indicated that the airplane contacted the runway, right main landing gear first in a right skid, and the landing gear collapsed.

Postaccident examination of the aircraft revealed no evidence of preimpact airframe or engine anomaly, and the pilot's written statement indicated that there was no mechanical malfunction. The pilot stated that both engines appeared to be operating normally, and he did not believe that the right front seat passenger contacted the rudder pedals during the accident sequence. The right front seat passenger indicated that he kept his feet flat on the floor during the flight. According to the Ohio State Police accident report, the winds at the time of the accident were out of the west-southwest at 11 miles per hour.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Airline transport	Age:	72,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 2 Valid Medicalw/ waivers/lim	Last FAA Medical Exam:	May 1, 1996
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:		3 hours (Total, this make and model), st 90 days, all aircraft), 32 hours (Last	•

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Piper	Registration:	N86AT
Model/Series:	PA60-601P PA60-601P	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	61P-0364
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	5
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	May 11, 1996 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	6315 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	27 Hrs	Engines:	2 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	2884 Hrs	Engine Manufacturer:	Lycoming
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	IO-540-AA1A5
Registered Owner:	HENRY WEBBER A/C DIST., INC.	Rated Power:	350 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	On-demand air taxi (135)
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	MFD ,1297 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:	08:56 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Unknown	Visibility	7 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Overcast / 1200 ft AGL	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	11 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	200°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	17°C / 16°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	LANCASTER , PA (LNS)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	(8G1)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	07:11 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class G

Airport Information

Airport:	WILLIARD 8G1	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	967 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	28	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	4040 ft / 65 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full stop;Traffic pattern

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	4 None	Aircraft Fire:	On-ground
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	5 None	Latitude, Longitude:	41.049263,-82.719497(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Moffett, Jodi
Additional Participating Persons:	
Original Publish Date:	February 18, 1997
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=28060

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available <u>here</u>.