

# **Aviation Investigation Final Report**

Location: FABENS, Texas Accident Number: FTW90LA121

**Date & Time:** June 20, 1990, 09:00 Local **Registration:** N76728

Aircraft: CESSNA 140 Aircraft Damage: Substantial

**Defining Event:** 1 None

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General aviation - Personal

## **Analysis**

FOUR ACFT DEPD CARLSBAD, NM, ON A FLT TO FABENS, TX. THE 1ST OF THE 4 ACFT TO ENTER THE TFC PATTERN AT FABENS WAS CESSNA 140, N76728. IT ENTERED THE PATTERN BEHIND A HIGH WING CESSNA (BORDER PATROL ACFT) THAT LANDED ON RWY 26. HOWEVER, SINCE THE WIND FAVORED RWY 8, THE 140 PLT 'PASSED OVER 26,' ENTERED A DOWNWIND FOR RWY 8 & ANNOUNCED HIS INTENTIONS ON THE UNICOM FREQ. WHEN THE BORDER PATROL ACFT CLRD RWY 26, THE 140 PLT CONTD HIS APCH TO LND ON RWY 8. HE ASSUMED THE PLTS OF THE OTHER 3 ACFT OF THE FLT WOULD FOLLOW HIM. THE 2ND ACFT OF THE FLT WAS A RYAN ST-3KR, N48743. THE RYAN PLT SAW THE HIGH WING CESSNA (BORDER PATROL ACFT) CLR RWY 26 & ELECTED TO LAND ON THAT RWY. SUBSEQUENTLY, THE CESSNA 140 & RYAN ST-3KR CONVERGED WHILE LANDING FROM OPPOSITE DIRECTIONS. THE CESSNA 140 PLT SAW THE RYAN ST-3KR JUST BEFORE IMPACT, BUT NOT IN TIME TO AVOID A COLLISION.

## **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: INADEQUATE VISUAL LOOKOUT BY THE PILOTS OF BOTH AIRCRAFT, WHICH RESULTED IN A FAILURE OF EACH PILOT TO SEE-AND-AVOID THE OTHER AIRCRAFT. A FACTOR RELATED TO THE ACCIDENT WAS: FAILURE OF THE RYAN ST-3KR PILOT TO MAKE TRAFFIC ADVIZORIES WHILE ENTERING THE TRAFFIC PATTERN AND APPROACHING TO LAND.

#### **Findings**

Occurrence #1: ON GROUND/WATER COLLISION WITH OBJECT

Phase of Operation: LANDING - ROLL

#### Findings

- 1. (F) TRAFFIC ADVISORY NOT ISSUED PILOT OF OTHER AIRCRAFT
- 2. (C) VISUAL LOOKOUT INADEQUATE PILOT IN COMMAND
- 3. (C) VISUAL LOOKOUT INADEQUATE PILOT OF OTHER AIRCRAFT
- 4. OBJECT AIRCRAFT MOVING ON GROUND

Page 2 of 11 FTW90LA121

# **Factual Information**

#### **Pilot Information**

Certificate:	Private	Age:	42,Female
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):		Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medicalno waivers/lim.	Last FAA Medical Exam:	August 30, 1989
Occupational Pilot:	UNK	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	600 hours (Total, all aircraft), 500 hours (Total, this make and model), 500 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 14 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 14 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 8 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Page 3 of 11 FTW90LA121

## **Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information**

Aircraft Make:	CESSNA	Registration:	N76728
Model/Series:	140 140	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	11160
Landing Gear Type:	Tailwheel	Seats:	2
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	February 1, 1990 100 hour	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	1500 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	15 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	1909 Hrs	Engine Manufacturer:	CONTINENTAL
ELT:	Installed, activated, did not aid in locating accident	Engine Model/Series:	85-12
Registered Owner:	DON S. SINGLETON	Rated Power:	85 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	

## **Meteorological Information and Flight Plan**

meteorological informati	3			
Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)		Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:			Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:			Direction from Accident Site:	
<b>Lowest Cloud Condition:</b>	Clear		Visibility	25 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None		Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	8 knots /		Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	90°		Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:			Temperature/Dew Point:	-18°C / -18°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscurati	on; No Precipita	tion	
Departure Point:	CARLSBAD	, NM (CNM)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	(E35)		Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	07:45 Local		Type of Airspace:	

Page 4 of 11 FTW90LA121

# **Airport Information**

Airport:	FABENS E35	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	3660 ft msl	<b>Runway Surface Condition:</b>	Dry
Runway Used:	8	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	4200 ft / 60 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full stop

# Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 None	Latitude, Longitude:	31.500993,-106.149269(est)

Page 5 of 11 FTW90LA121

#### **Administrative Information**

Investigator In Charge (IIC): Griffin, John

Additional Participating
Persons:

Original Publish Date: May 3, 1993

Last Revision Date:

Investigation Class: Class

Note:

Investigation Docket: https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=23141

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 United States Code section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 United States Code section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 6 of 11 FTW90LA121



# **Aviation Investigation Final Report**

Location: FABENS, Texas Accident Number: FTW90LA121

**Date & Time:** June 20, 1990, 09:00 Local **Registration:** N48743

Aircraft: Ryan ST-3KR Aircraft Damage: Substantial

**Defining Event:** 1 None

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General aviation - Personal

## **Analysis**

FOUR ACFT DEPD CARLSBAD, NM, ON A FLT TO FABENS, TX. THE 1ST OF THE 4 ACFT TO ENTER THE TFC PATTERN AT FABENS WAS CESSNA 140, N76728. IT ENTERED THE PATTERN BEHIND A HIGH WING CESSNA (BORDER PATROL ACFT) THAT LANDED ON RWY 26. HOWEVER, SINCE THE WIND FAVORED RWY 8, THE 140 PLT 'PASSED OVER 26,' ENTERED A DOWNWIND FOR RWY 8 & ANNOUNCED HIS INTENTIONS ON THE UNICOM FREQ. WHEN THE BORDER PATROL ACFT CLRD RWY 26, THE 140 PLT CONTD HIS APCH TO LND ON RWY 8. HE ASSUMED THE PLTS OF THE OTHER 3 ACFT OF THE FLT WOULD FOLLOW HIM. THE 2ND ACFT OF THE FLT WAS A RYAN ST-3KR, N48743. THE RYAN PLT SAW THE HIGH WING CESSNA (BORDER PATROL ACFT) CLR RWY 26 & ELECTED TO LAND ON THAT RWY. SUBSEQUENTLY, THE CESSNA 140 & RYAN ST-3KR CONVERGED WHILE LANDING FROM OPPOSITE DIRECTIONS. THE CESSNA 140 PLT SAW THE RYAN ST-3KR JUST BEFORE IMPACT, BUT NOT IN TIME TO AVOID A COLLISION.

## **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: INADEQUATE VISUAL LOOKOUT BY THE PILOTS OF BOTH AIRCRAFT, WHICH RESULTED IN A FAILURE OF EACH PILOT TO SEE-AND-AVOID THE OTHER AIRCRAFT. A FACTOR RELATED TO THE ACCIDENT WAS: FAILURE OF THE RYAN ST-3KR PILOT TO MAKE TRAFFIC ADVIZORIES WHILE ENTERING THE TRAFFIC PATTERN AND APPROACHING TO LAND.

#### **Findings**

Occurrence #1: ON GROUND/WATER COLLISION WITH OBJECT

Phase of Operation: LANDING - ROLL

#### Findings

- 1. (F) TRAFFIC ADVISORY NOT ISSUED PILOT IN COMMAND
- 2. (C) VISUAL LOOKOUT INADEQUATE PILOT IN COMMAND
- 3. (C) VISUAL LOOKOUT INADEQUATE PILOT OF OTHER AIRCRAFT
- 4. OBJECT AIRCRAFT MOVING ON GROUND

Page 8 of 11 FTW90LA121

# **Factual Information**

#### **Pilot Information**

Certificate:	Private	Age:	64,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Unknown
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):		Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medicalw/ waivers/lim	Last FAA Medical Exam:	July 18, 1988
Occupational Pilot:	UNK	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	659 hours (Total, all aircraft), 480 hours (Total, this make and model), 601 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 7 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 7 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 7 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

# Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Ryan	Registration:	N48743
Model/Series:	ST-3KR ST-3KR	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	1287
Landing Gear Type:	Tailwheel	Seats:	2
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	August 3, 1989 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	1885 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:		Engine Manufacturer:	KINNER
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	R55
Registered Owner:	NORMAN D. JUSTICE	Rated Power:	160 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	

Page 9 of 11 FTW90LA121

# Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:		Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:		Direction from Accident Site:	
<b>Lowest Cloud Condition:</b>	Clear	Visibility	25 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	8 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	90°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:		Temperature/Dew Point:	-18°C / -18°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipit	ation	
Departure Point:	CARLSBAD , NM (CNM)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	(E35)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	07:00 Local	Type of Airspace:	

# **Airport Information**

Airport:	FABENS E35	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	3660 ft msl	<b>Runway Surface Condition:</b>	Dry
Runway Used:	8	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	4200 ft / 60 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full stop

# **Wreckage and Impact Information**

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 None	Latitude, Longitude:	31.500993,-106.149269(est)

Page 10 of 11 FTW90LA121

#### **Administrative Information**

Investigator In Charge (IIC): Griffin, John

Additional Participating
Persons:

Original Publish Date: May 3, 1993

Last Revision Date:

Investigation Class: Class

Note:

Investigation Docket: https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=23141

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 United States Code section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 United States Code section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 11 of 11 FTW90LA121