

Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location: RIVIERA, Texas Accident Number: FTW98LA084

Date & Time: January 2, 1998, 08:30 Local Registration: N1091Y

Aircraft: Hughes 269C Aircraft Damage: Substantial

Defining Event: 2 None

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General aviation - Other work use

Analysis

Following a total loss of engine power, during a cattle herding flight, the pilot executed an autorotation to an area confined by trees. Engine examination revealed a broken crankshaft & camshaft. The camshaft exhibited deformation consistent with overload. All four cylinder mounting flanges were fretted & all piston rings showed 'excessive' wear. The #1 & #4 cylinder top compression rings were broken. Main bearing saddle faces of the crankcase showed heavy fretting. The engine manufacturer Materials Laboratory reported the mode of fracture of the crankshaft was fatigue. The fatigue originated from the oil hole (between #3 main & #3 crankpin journals) in the cheek and near the rear fillet radius of the #3 main bearing journal. The cause of the fatigue was not determined. During the overhaul, the crankshaft received a magnaflux inspection & re-nitriding by an inspection facility. The engine was reassembled & returned to service by company maintenance personnel. The engine had 1150.6 hours since overhaul.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The total loss of engine power due to a fatigue failure of the crankshaft for undetermined reason. A factor was the lack of suitable terrain for the forced landing.

Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF ENGINE POWER Phase of Operation: MANEUVERING

Findings

1. (C) ENGINE ASSEMBLY, CRANKSHAFT - FATIGUE

2. (C) REASON FOR OCCURRENCE UNDETERMINED

Occurrence #2: FORCED LANDING

Phase of Operation: EMERGENCY DESCENT/LANDING

Findings

3. (F) TERRAIN CONDITION - NONE SUITABLE

4. OBJECT - TREE(S)

Page 2 of 7 FTW98LA084

Factual Information

On January 2, 1998, at 0830 central standard time, a Hughes 269C helicopter, N1091Y, owned and operated by Smith Helicopters, Inc., under Title 14 CFR Part 91, sustained substantial damage during an autorotation following a loss of engine power while maneuvering near Riviera, Texas. The commercial pilot and the passenger were not injured. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed for the local cattle herding flight and a flight plan was not filed. The flight originated from the King Ranch at 0745.

During telephone interviews, conducted by the investigator-in-charge (IIC), and on the Pilot/Operator Aircraft Accident Report (NTSB Form 6120.1/2), the pilot and the operator reported that the pilot was maneuvering the helicopter at 75 feet agl herding cattle on the King Ranch when the engine "started missing briefly then quit." The pilot executed an autorotation to a dirt road confined by mesquite trees 15 to 20 feet in height. During the landing, the main rotor struck the tailboom. The tailboom, vertical and horizontal stabilizer, main rotor blades, and the tail rotor driveshaft received structural damage.

A review of the engine maintenance records, by the FAA inspector and the IIC, revealed that the Lycoming HIO-360-D1A engine, S/N L-25772-51A, was manufactured in 1991. The engine was overhauled in January 1995. During the engine overhaul, the crankshaft received a magnaflux inspection and re-nitriding. The crankshaft was certified and approved for return to service by Aircraft Engine & Accessory Co., Inc., Dallas, Texas. The engine was reassembled by a mechanic and installed in N1091Y. The engine was returned to service by company maintenance personnel on February 21, 1995. At the time of the accident, the engine time since overhaul was 1,150.6 hours. The last 100 hour inspection was performed on October 7, 1997, and the airplane had accumulated 69 hours since the inspection.

On March 10, 1998, at Laredo, Texas, the FAA inspector examined the helicopter and the engine. Structural damage to the airframe was confirmed. The inspector reported that the engine crankshaft would not rotate. When cylinders #1 and #3 were removed from the engine, the FAA inspector found that a portion of the crankshaft appeared to be separated in the area of the #3 main bearing. A piece of metal was found in the oil screen sump. The engine was shipped to Textron Lycoming, Williamsport, Pennsylvania, for further examination.

On September 16, 1998, in Williamsport, Pennsylvania, under the surveillance of an FAA inspector, a teardown of the engine revealed a broken crankshaft and camshaft. The camshaft exhibited deformation consistent with overload. All four cylinder mounting flanges were fretted and all piston rings showed "excessive" wear. The #1 and the #4 cylinder top compression rings were broken. The engine and aircraft logs provided no indications as to what service bulletins or FAA Airworthiness Directives had been complied with from overhaul to the time of the accident. The #1, #2, and the #3 center main bearing saddle faces of the

Page 3 of 7 FTW98LA084

crankcase showed heavy fretting. Fresh fretting was seen on the #4 main saddle surface. The oil holes and galleys were normal. See the enclosed reports for additional details.

The crankshaft was examined by the Textron Lycoming Materials Laboratory. The mode of fracture of the crankshaft was fatigue. The fatigue originated from the oil hole (between #3 main and #3 crankpin journals) in the cheek and near the rear fillet radius of the #3 main bearing journal. The cause of the fatigue was not determined.

The helicopter was released to the owner's representative.

Pilot Information

| Certificate: | Commercial | Age: | 28,Male |
|---------------------------|--|-----------------------------------|----------------|
| Airplane Rating(s): | None | Seat Occupied: | Left |
| Other Aircraft Rating(s): | Helicopter | Restraint Used: | |
| Instrument Rating(s): | None | Second Pilot Present: | No |
| Instructor Rating(s): | None | Toxicology Performed: | No |
| Medical Certification: | Class 2 Valid Medicalno waivers/lim. | Last FAA Medical Exam: | April 15, 1997 |
| Occupational Pilot: | Yes | Last Flight Review or Equivalent: | |
| Flight Time: | 567 hours (Total, all aircraft), 567 hours (Total, this make and model), 527 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 254 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 61 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft) | | |

Page 4 of 7 FTW98LA084

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

| Aircraft Make: | Hughes | Registration: | N1091Y |
|-------------------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------|
| Model/Series: | 269C 269C | Aircraft Category: | Helicopter |
| Year of Manufacture: | | Amateur Built: | |
| Airworthiness Certificate: | Normal | Serial Number: | 411050 |
| Landing Gear Type: | Skid | Seats: | 2 |
| Date/Type of Last Inspection: | October 7, 1997 100 hour | Certified Max Gross Wt.: | 1700 lbs |
| Time Since Last Inspection: | 69 Hrs | Engines: | 1 Reciprocating |
| Airframe Total Time: | 6631 Hrs | Engine Manufacturer: | Lycoming |
| ELT: | | Engine Model/Series: | HIO-360-D1A |
| Registered Owner: | SMITH HELICOPTERS, INC. | Rated Power: | 190 Horsepower |
| Operator: | | Operating Certificate(s) Held: | None |
| Operator Does Business As: | | Operator Designator Code: | |

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

| Conditions at Accident Site: | Visual (VMC) | Condition of Light: | Day |
|----------------------------------|------------------------------|--------------------------------------|----------|
| Observation Facility, Elevation: | | Distance from Accident Site: | |
| Observation Time: | | Direction from Accident Site: | |
| Lowest Cloud Condition: | Clear | Visibility | 20 miles |
| Lowest Ceiling: | None | Visibility (RVR): | |
| Wind Speed/Gusts: | 5 knots / None | Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual: | / |
| Wind Direction: | 135° | Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual: | / |
| Altimeter Setting: | | Temperature/Dew Point: | 20°C |
| Precipitation and Obscuration: | No Obscuration; No Precipita | ation | |
| Departure Point: | | Type of Flight Plan Filed: | None |
| Destination: | | Type of Clearance: | VFR |
| Departure Time: | 07:45 Local | Type of Airspace: | |

Page 5 of 7 FTW98LA084

Airport Information

| Airport: | | Runway Surface Type: | |
|----------------------|---|----------------------------------|----------------|
| Airport Elevation: | | Runway Surface Condition: | |
| Runway Used: | 0 | IFR Approach: | |
| Runway Length/Width: | | VFR Approach/Landing: | Forced landing |

Wreckage and Impact Information

| Crew Injuries: | 1 None | Aircraft Damage: | Substantial |
|------------------------|--------|-------------------------|---------------------------|
| Passenger Injuries: | 1 None | Aircraft Fire: | None |
| Ground Injuries: | N/A | Aircraft Explosion: | None |
| Total Injuries: | 2 None | Latitude, Longitude: | 27.280019,-97.809707(est) |

Page 6 of 7 FTW98LA084

Administrative Information

| Investigator In Charge (IIC): | Roach, Joyce | |
|-----------------------------------|--|--|
| Additional Participating Persons: | JIM AGUILAR; SAN ANTONIO , TX JOE GREEN; NEW CUMBERLAND , PA BOB OHNMEISS; WILLIAMSPORT , PA | |
| Original Publish Date: | February 16, 2001 | |
| Last Revision Date: | | |
| Investigation Class: | <u>Class</u> | |
| Note: | | |
| Investigation Docket: | https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=20510 | |
| | | |

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 7 of 7 FTW98LA084