



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	Danville, Kentucky	Accident Number:	ERA24LA352
Date & Time:	July 19, 2024, 16:00 Local	Registration:	N9991E
Aircraft:	Cessna 172	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:	Hard landing	Injuries:	3 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

Analysis

The private pilot (who was the pilot-in-command for the flight) was flying with two passengers, one of whom was seated in the right front pilot seat, held a commercial pilot certificate, and had more flight experience than the private pilot. The pilot-rated passenger in the right front seat reported that during the approach, she had commented to the pilot twice about the airplane's airspeed, and that she had nudged the yoke forward with one finger as an indication to the pilot to lower the nose; however, the pilot pulled back on the yoke and added power to cushion the landing, which resulted in several bounces on the runway before the airplane traveled off the left side. She further described that the landing flare occurred while the airplane too high above the runway and at too slow a speed, about 15 ft above the runway and at an airspeed decreasing to less than 50 knots.

The pilot reported that during the landing attempt, after the pilot-rated passenger pushed the yoke forward, he pulled back because he did not want the nose of the airplane to strike the runway first, which resulted in a hard landing and subsequent bounce. As the pilot was attempting to regain control of the airplane, the pilot-rated passenger increased the engine power to full in attempt to abort the landing, but the airplane then veered to the left and departed the runway surface. The airplane came to rest upright in a grass area next to the runway. The fuselage was substantially damaged during the accident sequence. The pilot reported that there were no preimpact mechanical malfunctions or failures of the airplane that would have precluded normal operation. He also stated that, "...we will need to improve the communication between me as the PIC and [any pilot-rated passengers] such as informing me of their concern rather than touching the control, especially during landing."

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

The pilot’s failure to maintain control of the airplane while landing and his inadequate communication to the pilot-rated passenger of her role during the flight.

Findings

Personnel issues	Aircraft control - Pilot
Aircraft	Landing flare - Not attained/maintained
Aircraft	Directional control - Not attained/maintained
Personnel issues	Lack of communication - Pilot

Factual Information

History of Flight

Landing	Hard landing (Defining event)
Landing	Loss of control on ground
Landing	Runway excursion
Landing	Collision with terr/obj (non-CFIT)

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	30,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	3-point
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	
Medical Certification:	Class 1 With waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	February 2, 2024
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	August 14, 2023
Flight Time:	148 hours (Total, all aircraft), 26 hours (Total, this make and model), 93 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 8 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 7 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 4 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Pilot-rated passenger Information

Certificate:	Commercial	Age:	Female
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Right
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	3-point
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	
Medical Certification:	Class 2 With waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	January 2, 2021
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:			

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Cessna	Registration:	N9991E
Model/Series:	172 N	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	17272308
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:		Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2300 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:		Engine Manufacturer:	Lycoming
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	O-320
Registered Owner:	WINGS FLIGHT ENTERPRISES INC	Rated Power:	160 Horsepower
Operator:	WINGS FLIGHT ENTERPRISES INC	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	DVK,1022 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	0 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	15:50 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	0°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	3 knots / None	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	None / None
Wind Direction:	220°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	N/A / N/A
Altimeter Setting:	30.09 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	29°C / 13°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:			
Departure Point:	Knoxville, TN (DKK)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Danville, KY	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	14:45 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class G

Airport Information

Airport:	Stuart Powell DVK	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	1022 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	13	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	5000 ft / 75 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full stop;Traffic pattern

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	2 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:		Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	3 None	Latitude, Longitude:	37.577575,-84.769498

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Gretz, Robert
Additional Participating Persons:	Mark McLeroy; FAA/FSDO; Louisville, KY
Original Publish Date:	November 19, 2024
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class 4
Note:	The NTSB did not travel to the scene of this accident.
Investigation Docket:	https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=194966

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).