

Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	CARLSBAD, New N	<i>l</i> exico	Accident Number:	FTW95LA131
Date & Time:	February 25, 1995,	, 23:58 Local	Registration:	N5613P
Aircraft:	PIPER	PA-24-250	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:			Injuries:	1 Minor, 1 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal			

Analysis

AFTER 4 HOURS OF DARK NIGHT CROSS COUNTRY FLIGHT, THE ENGINE LOST POWER AND THE PILOT LANDED THE AIRPLANE GEAR UP IN A FIELD. EN ROUTE, THE PILOT NOTED THE FUEL GAUGES READING 'LOWER THAN NORMAL,' BUT ELECTED TO CONTINUE TO THE DESTINATION AS HIS 'CALCULATIONS SHOWED WE COULD MAKE IT WITH FUEL TO SPARE.' THE AIRCRAFT WAS REFUELED PRIOR TO DEPARTURE AND THE PILOT ESTIMATED A TIME EN ROUTE OF 4.1 HOURS WITH A TOTAL OF 5.3 HOURS OF FUEL ON BOARD. FOLLOWING THE FORCED LANDING, THE PILOT EXAMINED 'THE GASCOLATOR AND, FINDING NO FUEL IN THE BOWL, CONCLUDED THE QUICK DRAIN HAD BEEN LEAKING SINCE HE CHECKED THE FUEL PRIOR TO DEPARTURE.'

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: FUEL EXHAUSTION ENGINE POWER LOSS DUE TO A LEAK IN THE FUEL SYSTEM. FACTORS WERE DARK NIGHT CONDITIONS AND THE LACK OF SUITABLE TERRAIN FOR THE FORCED LANDING.

Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF ENGINE POWER(TOTAL) - MECH FAILURE/MALF Phase of Operation: CRUISE - NORMAL

Findings

1. (C) FUEL SYSTEM, DRAIN - LEAK 2. (C) FLUID, FUEL - EXHAUSTION

Occurrence #2: FORCED LANDING Phase of Operation: EMERGENCY DESCENT/LANDING

Occurrence #3: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER Phase of Operation: LANDING - ROLL

Findings

3. (F) LIGHT CONDITION - DARK NIGHT

4. (F) TERRAIN CONDITION - NONE SUITABLE

Factual Information

On February 25, 1995, at 2358 mountain standard time, a Piper PA- 24-250, N5613P, was substantially damaged during a forced landing near Carlsbad, New Mexico. The commercial pilot sustained minor injuries. The private pilot rated passenger was not injured. Dark night visual meteorological conditions prevailed for the personal cross-country flight.

Prior to departing Texarkana, Arkansas, for Carlsbad, the pilot refueled the airplane and calculated an estimated time en route of 4.1 hours with a total of 5.3 hours of fuel on board. These figures are consistent with the performance charts found in the Piper PA-24 Owner's Handbook. The pilot stated that he "noted [fuel] gauges reading lower than normal north of Andrews, Texas" and "was planning a fuel stop in Hobbs if necessary." At this time he checked the weather at Hobbs and found that it was "IFR" with a thunderstorm in progress. The pilot "thought it best to continue to Carlsbad as my calculations showed we could make it with fuel to spare."

About 10 miles northeast of Carlsbad, approximately four hours into the flight, the engine lost power. After attempting unsuccessfully to restart the engine, the pilot tried to identify a local highway to land on, "but as it was almost midnight local time, there was no traffic on the road" and he was unable to see it. He then "aimed for a dark area" and landed the airplane gear up in a field. Damage to the airplane included deformation of the lower firewall. The pilot examined the gascolator and found no fuel in the bowl. He "concluded that we had a leak [in the quick drain] after the fuel was checked in Texarkana and it continued to leak for the entire trip, causing at least a 12-gallon loss of fuel."

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Commercial; Flight instructor	Age:	51,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Single-engine sea	Seat Occupied:	Right
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane single-engine; Instrument airplane	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 2 Valid Medical–w/ waivers/lim	Last FAA Medical Exam:	November 10, 1994
Occupational Pilot:	UNK	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	1404 hours (Total, all aircraft), 420 hours (Total, this make and model), 1270 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 91 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 35 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 8 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	PIPER	Registration:	N5613P
Model/Series:	PA-24-250 PA-24-250	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	24-681
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	February 23, 1995 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2800 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	8 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	4453 Hrs	Engine Manufacturer:	LYCOMING
ELT:	Installed, activated, did not aid in locating accident	Engine Model/Series:	0-540-A1C5
Registered Owner:	GUTIERREZ, ALBERTO H.	Rated Power:	250 Horsepower
Operator:	FOUCAULT, JAMES F.	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Night/dark
Observation Facility, Elevation:		Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:		Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Scattered / 2200 ft AGL	Visibility	20 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	8 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	80°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	17°C / 14°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipita	ition	
Departure Point:	TEXARKANA , AR (TXK)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	VFR
Destination:	(CNM)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	20:56 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class G

Airport Information

Airport:		Runway Surface Type:	
Airport Elevation:		Runway Surface Condition:	
Runway Used:	0	IFR Approach:	
Runway Length/Width:		VFR Approach/Landing:	Forced landing

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Minor	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 Minor, 1 None	Latitude, Longitude:	32.400604,-104.2304(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Ellis, Matthew		
Additional Participating Persons:	MANUEL G LOPEZ; ALBUQUERQUE , NM		
Original Publish Date:	August 23, 1995		
Last Revision Date:			
Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>		
Note:			
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=19363		

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available <u>here</u>.