



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	RED LODGE, Montana	Accident Number:	DEN89LA156
Date & Time:	July 3, 1989, 13:00 Local	Registration:	N4391A
Aircraft:	PIPER PA-28RT-201T	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:		Injuries:	1 Serious, 1 Minor
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

Analysis

THE PRIVATE PLT AND HIS WIFE WERE MAKING A X-COUNTRY FLT. THE PLT SELECTED RWY 16, A 4,000 X 75 FT, ASPHALT RWY, WITH WINDS HE ESTIMATED AS FROM 150 DEG AT 5 KTS. THE PLT REPORTED THAT DURING LANDING ROLL, A WIND GUST HE ESTIMATED FROM 260 DEG AT 30 KTS, PUSHED THE ACFT LEFT AND RAISED THE NOSE. HE SAID HE HAD LITTLE CONTROL OF THE ACFT. THE PLT SAID HE CORRECTED TO THE RIGHT AND ATTEMPTED TO GO AROUND BY ADDING FULL POWER. ACCORDING TO WITNESSES, THE ACFT BECAME AIRBORNE AND FLEW AT 10 FT AGL, GRADUALLY LOSING ALTITUDE UNTIL IT STRUCK A 3 FT HIGH BANK AND SLID INTO A WATER FILLED IRRIGATION DITCH. THE ACFT CAME TO REST ABOUT 1,000 FEET WEST OF THE RWY. SEVERAL WITNESSES CONFIRMED THAT THE WIND HAD GUSTED SUDDENLY DURING THE ATTEMPTED LANDING.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: INADEQUATE COMPENSATION FOR THE WIND CONDITIONS DURING LANDING ROLL, RESULTING IN A LOSS OF CONTROL. CONTRIBUTING TO THE ACCIDENT WAS THE GUSTY WIND CONDITION.

Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF CONTROL - ON GROUND/WATER
Phase of Operation: LANDING - ROLL

Findings

1. (F) WEATHER CONDITION - GUSTS
2. (C) COMPENSATION FOR WIND CONDITIONS - INADEQUATE - PILOT IN COMMAND

Occurrence #2: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER
Phase of Operation: LANDING - ABORTED

Findings

3. TERRAIN CONDITION - DIRT BANK/RISING EMBANKMENT
4. TERRAIN CONDITION - WATER

Factual Information

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	47, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medical-w/ waivers/lim	Last FAA Medical Exam:	March 21, 1988
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	355 hours (Total, all aircraft), 66 hours (Total, this make and model), 355 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 33 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 13 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 3 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	PIPER	Registration:	N4391A
Model/Series:	PA-28RT-201T PA-28RT-20	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	28R-8431029
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	May 30, 1989 Continuous airworthiness	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2900 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	1285 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:		Engine Manufacturer:	CONTINENTAL
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	TSIO-360-FB9
Registered Owner:	ROBERT E FRANK	Rated Power:	200 Horsepower
Operator:	FRANK, ROBERT E.	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:		Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:		Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	15 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	5 knots / 30 knots	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	150°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:		Temperature/Dew Point:	28°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	SPOKANE , WA (GEG)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	(RED)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	09:20 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class G

Airport Information

Airport:	RED LODGE RED	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	5400 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	16	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	4000 ft / 75 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Go around

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Serious	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	1 Minor	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 Serious, 1 Minor	Latitude, Longitude:	45.190376,-109.240165(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC): Collins, Robert

Additional Participating Persons:

Original Publish Date: October 24, 1990

Last Revision Date:

Investigation Class: [Class](#)

Note:

Investigation Docket: <https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=17734>

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).