

Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location: BRIGHTON, Michigan Accident Number: CHI88DEC01

Date & Time: April 18, 1988, 19:30 Local Registration: N2326L

Aircraft: BEECH 23 Aircraft Damage: Substantial

Defining Event: 2 Minor, 2 None

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General aviation - Personal

Analysis

THE PILOT STATED THAT, AFTER A LOCAL PLEASURE FLIGHT WITH HIS CHILDREN AS PASSENGERS, HE RETURNED TO HIS DEPARTURE AIRPORT AND RE-ENTERED THE TRAFFIC PATTERN FOR RUNWAY 22. HE REPORTED THAT WHILE ON FINAL APPROACH HE DIDN'T LIKE THE WAY THINGS LOOKED AND CHOSE TO GO-AROUND. HE STATED THAT INITIALLY THE AIRCRAFT RESPONDED NORMALLY AND BEGAN TO CLIMB, BUT 'IMMEDIATELY AFTER METERING OFF FLAPS, THE ENGINE BEGAN TO VIBRATE GROSSLY OUT-OF-BALANCE.' THE PILOT PERFORMED EMERGENCY PROCEDURES, BUT THE 'LOSS OF POWER AND ALTITUDE CONTINUED....LAKE LANDING WAS VERY SUSPECT DUE TO LACK OF ALTITUDE. REVIEWED AREA FOR ALTERNATIVE - NONE!' THE AIRCRAFT STRUCK THE TOP OF A LARGE TREE AND THEN CONTACTED A SMALLER TREE BEFORE IT DESCENDED INTO THE LAKE. PILOT AND PASSENGERS WERE ABLE TO EXIT THE AIRCRAFT BEFORE IT SANK. THE AIRCRAFT WAS SUBMERGED FOR MORE THAN 20 HOURS BEFORE IT WAS RECOVERED FROM THE LAKE. A SUBSEQUENT ENGINE RUN-UP WAS SATISFACTORILY ACCOMPLISHED.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: THE UNSUITABLE TERRAIN (TREES AND A LAKE) ENCOUNTERED DURING A FORCED LANDING MADE NECESSARY BY THE PARTIAL FAILURE OF THE AIRCRAFT'S POWERPLANT DURING AND ATTEMPTED GO-AROUND. THE OCCUPANTS WERE ABLE TO EXIT THE AIRCRAFT BEFORE IT SANK; THE AIRCRAFT WAS SUBMERGED FOR OVER 20 HOURS BEFORE IT WAS SALVAGED FROM THE LAKE.

Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF ENGINE POWER Phase of Operation: GO-AROUND (VFR)

Findings

- 1. (C) REASON FOR OCCURRENCE UNDETERMINED PILOT IN COMMAND
- 2. (F) PLANNED APPROACH NOT ATTAINED PILOT IN COMMAND
- 3. (F) LACK OF TOTAL EXPERIENCE PILOT IN COMMAND
- 4. (F) GO-AROUND PERFORMED PILOT IN COMMAND
- 5. EMERGENCY PROCEDURE PERFORMED PILOT IN COMMAND
- 6. (C) UNSUITABLE TERRAIN OR TAKEOFF/LANDING/TAXI AREA

Occurrence #2: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH OBJECT

Phase of Operation: DESCENT - EMERGENCY

Findings

7. (F) OBJECT - TREE(S)

Occurrence #3: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER

Phase of Operation: DESCENT - EMERGENCY

Findings

8. (C) TERRAIN CONDITION - WATER

Page 2 of 6 CHI88DEC01

Factual Information

Pilot Information

| Certificate: | Private | Age: | 42,Male |
|---------------------------|--|-----------------------------------|--------------|
| Airplane Rating(s): | Single-engine land | Seat Occupied: | Left |
| Other Aircraft Rating(s): | None | Restraint Used: | |
| Instrument Rating(s): | None | Second Pilot Present: | No |
| Instructor Rating(s): | None | Toxicology Performed: | No |
| Medical Certification: | Class 3 Valid Medicalw/ waivers/lim | Last FAA Medical Exam: | May 28, 1987 |
| Occupational Pilot: | No | Last Flight Review or Equivalent: | |
| Flight Time: | 74 hours (Total, all aircraft), 6 hours (Total, this make and model), 40 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 6 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 6 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 1 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft) | | |

Page 3 of 6 CHI88DEC01

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

| Aircraft Make: | BEECH | Registration: | N2326L |
|-------------------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------|
| Model/Series: | 23 23 | Aircraft Category: | Airplane |
| Year of Manufacture: | | Amateur Built: | |
| Airworthiness Certificate: | Normal; Utility | Serial Number: | M-152 |
| Landing Gear Type: | Tricycle | Seats: | 4 |
| Date/Type of Last Inspection: | February 12, 1988 Annual | Certified Max Gross Wt.: | 2300 lbs |
| Time Since Last Inspection: | 7 Hrs | Engines: | 1 Reciprocating |
| Airframe Total Time: | 3072 Hrs | Engine Manufacturer: | LYCOMING |
| ELT: | Installed, not activated | Engine Model/Series: | O-320-D2B |
| Registered Owner: | DONALD ANDREW LADEMANN | Rated Power: | 160 Horsepower |
| Operator: | | Operating Certificate(s) Held: | None |
| Operator Does Business As: | | Operator Designator Code: | |

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

| Conditions at Accident Site: | Visual (VMC) | Condition of Light: | Day |
|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|--------------------------------------|-------------------|
| Observation Facility, Elevation: | LAN ,860 ft msl | Distance from Accident Site: | 36 Nautical Miles |
| Observation Time: | 00:15 Local | Direction from Accident Site: | 290° |
| Lowest Cloud Condition: | Scattered / 4000 ft AGL | Visibility | 15 miles |
| Lowest Ceiling: | None | Visibility (RVR): | |
| Wind Speed/Gusts: | 12 knots / | Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual: | / |
| Wind Direction: | 320° | Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual: | / |
| Altimeter Setting: | 29 inches Hg | Temperature/Dew Point: | 4°C / -11°C |
| Precipitation and Obscuration: | No Obscuration; No Precipitation | | |
| Departure Point: | | Type of Flight Plan Filed: | None |
| Destination: | | Type of Clearance: | None |
| Departure Time: | 18:40 Local | Type of Airspace: | Class G |

Page 4 of 6 CHI88DEC01

Airport Information

| Airport: | HYNE FIELD 45G | Runway Surface Type: | Asphalt |
|----------------------|-----------------|----------------------------------|--------------------------|
| Airport Elevation: | 973 ft msl | Runway Surface Condition: | Dry |
| Runway Used: | 22 | IFR Approach: | None |
| Runway Length/Width: | 1800 ft / 30 ft | VFR Approach/Landing: | Forced landing;Go around |

Wreckage and Impact Information

| Crew Injuries: | 1 Minor | Aircraft Damage: | Substantial |
|------------------------|-----------------|-------------------------|---------------------------|
| Passenger Injuries: | 1 Minor, 2 None | Aircraft Fire: | None |
| Ground Injuries: | N/A | Aircraft Explosion: | None |
| Total Injuries: | 2 Minor, 2 None | Latitude, Longitude: | 42.529949,-83.779182(est) |

Page 5 of 6 CHI88DEC01

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):

Additional Participating
Persons:

Original Publish Date:

June 25, 1990

Last Revision Date:

Investigation Class:

Class

Note:

Investigation Docket:

https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=13844

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 United States Code section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 United States Code section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 6 of 6 CHI88DEC01