



# **Aviation Investigation Final Report**

Location: BURKBURNETT, Texas Accident Number: DEN93LA079

Date & Time: July 15, 1993, 17:45 Local Registration: N4834M

Aircraft: PIPER PA-11 Aircraft Damage: Substantial

**Defining Event:** 1 Minor, 1 None

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General aviation - Personal

### **Analysis**

AFTER SIGHTSEEING FOR ABOUT 30 MINUTES, THE PILOT INITIATED A RIGHT BANK TO RETURN TO THE AIRPORT. THE AIRPLANE BEGAN DESCENDING AND FULL BACK PRESSURE WOULD NOT ARREST THE DESCENT. THE PILOT LEVELED THE WINGS AND APPLIED FULL POWER. THE AIRPLANE IMPACTED A RIVER SAND BAR. POST-ACCIDENT EXAMINATION DISCLOSED THE UP ELEVATOR CABLE WAS DISCONNECTED FROM THE CONTROL HORN. A BOLT, SEVERAL CASTLE NUTS, WASHERS, SHEET METAL SCREWS, A SPACER AND A REMNANT OF A COTTER PIN WERE VACUUMED FROM THE FLOOR OF THE AIRPLANE BENEATH THE ELEVATOR CONTROL HORN. THE AIRPLANE HAD ACCUMULATED 142 HOURS SINCE THE LAST ANNUAL INSPECTION 10 MONTHS BEFORE THE ACCIDENT.

### **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: THE DISCONNECTION OF THE UP ELEVATOR CABLE FROM THE CONTROL HORN. A FACTOR WAS THE INCORRECT INSTALLATION OF THE BOLT AND CASTLE NUT BY UNKNOWN MAINTENANCE PERSONNEL.

### **Findings**

Occurrence #1: AIRFRAME/COMPONENT/SYSTEM FAILURE/MALFUNCTION

Phase of Operation: MANEUVERING

**Findings** 

1. (C) FLT CONTROL SYST, ELEVATOR CONTROL CABLE/ROD - DISCONNECTED

2. (F) MAINTENANCE, INSTALLATION - IMPROPER - OTHER MAINTENANCE PERSONNEL

-----

Occurrence #2: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER

Phase of Operation: DESCENT - UNCONTROLLED

#### Findings

3. TERRAIN CONDITION - SAND BAR

Page 2 of 6 DEN93LA079

#### **Factual Information**

On July 15, 1993, at approximately 1745 central daylight time, a Piper PA-11, N4834M, was substantially damaged when it collided with terrain near Burkburnett, Texas. The pilot sustained minor injuries and the passenger was not injured. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time and no flight plan was filed for the local personal flight.

The pilot of N4834M was also an Air Force pilot stationed at Sheppard Air Force Base, Wichita Falls, Texas. The following is based on a verbal statement he gave to a Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) inspector and a written statement he submitted along with his accident report. The pilot and his passenger had been flying along the Red River at about 300 feet AGL. They decided to return to their home airport at Wichita Falls, Texas. The pilot said he made a 30 to 40 degree right bank at an indicated airspeed between 55 and 60 MPH. The airplane began descending and he applied back pressure to arrest the descent. Instead, the rate of descent increased. The pilot applied left rudder, leveled the wings, and applied full aft elevator and full throttle. The descent continued until ground impact.

The passenger, an Air Force maintenance officer also assigned to Sheppard AFB submitted a written statement that read (in part): "...the pilot...made a steep diving turn. After approximately 360 degrees of turn, an immediate loss of lift was felt and the aircraft entered a nose low attitude. The wings were immediately leveled, however, altitude was not sufficient to recover from the ensuing dive. The aircraft impacted the ground in full throttle, stick aft, and nose level attitude. The aircraft seemed to be operating normally throughout the entire flight."

The FAA inspector examined the airplane after it had been taken back to the airport. The inspector reported that the bolt and castle nut that attaches the up elevator cable to the control horn was missing. A bolt, several castle nuts, washers, sheet metal screws, a spacer, and a remnant of a cotter pin were vacuumed from the floor of the airplane beneath the elevator control horn.

The airplane's maintenance records indicated the last annual inspection was performed ten months before the accident, on September 21, 1992. At the time of the accident, 142 hours had elapsed since the annual inspection.

Page 3 of 6 DEN93LA079

### **Pilot Information**

Certificate:	Commercial	Age:	24,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Front
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 2 Valid Medicalw/ waivers/lim	Last FAA Medical Exam:	March 9, 1969
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	283 hours (Total, all aircraft), 6 hours (Total, this make and model), 245 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 29 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 11 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft)		

# **Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information**

Aircraft Make:	PIPER	Registration:	N4834M
Model/Series:	PA-11 PA-11	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	11-345
Landing Gear Type:	Tailwheel	Seats:	2
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	September 21, 1992 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	1220 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	142 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	1217 Hrs	Engine Manufacturer:	CONTINENTAL
ELT:	Installed, activated, aided in locating accident	Engine Model/Series:	A-65-8F
Registered Owner:	RENTON, PAUL N.	Rated Power:	65 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None
Operator Does Business As:	RENTON AVIATION	Operator Designator Code:	

Page 4 of 6 DEN93LA079

# **Meteorological Information and Flight Plan**

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:		Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:		Direction from Accident Site:	
<b>Lowest Cloud Condition:</b>	Clear	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	10 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	180°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:		Temperature/Dew Point:	35°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipita	ation	
Departure Point:	WICHITA FALLS , TX (SPS )	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:		Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	16:45 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class G

# **Airport Information**

Airport:		Runway Surface Type:
Airport Elevation:		Runway Surface Condition:
Runway Used:	0	IFR Approach:
Runway Length/Width:		VFR Approach/Landing:

# Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Minor	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 Minor, 1 None	Latitude, Longitude:	34.069961,-98.560569(est)

Page 5 of 6 DEN93LA079

#### **Administrative Information**

Investigator In Charge (IIC): Scott, Arnold

Additional Participating Persons:

Original Publish Date: June 22, 1994

Last Revision Date:

Investigation Class: Class

Note:

Investigation Docket: https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=11094

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 United States Code section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 United States Code section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 6 of 6 DEN93LA079