



# **Aviation Investigation Final Report**

| Location:               | St. George, Utah                     | Accident Number:      | WPR22LA127  |
|-------------------------|--------------------------------------|-----------------------|-------------|
| Date & Time:            | March 24, 2022, 13:49 Local          | <b>Registration</b> : | N111NW      |
| Aircraft:               | Piper PA-32R-300                     | Aircraft Damage:      | Substantial |
| Defining Event:         | Unknown or undetermined              | Injuries:             | 2 Serious   |
| Flight Conducted Under: | Part 91: General aviation - Personal |                       |             |

#### Analysis

According to the pilot, the airplane sustained a total loss of engine power during the approach to land. Unable to maintain altitude, the pilot initiated a forced landing to rough desert terrain. During the landing roll, the landing gear collapsed and separated, and the airplane slid about 100 ft before coming to rest upright.

Examination of the airframe and engine revealed no evidence of preimpact malfunctions or anomalies. Residual fuel was found in fuel lines and fuel components in the airframe and engine. The reason for the loss of engine power was undetermined.

# **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

The total loss of engine power for undetermined reasons.

**Findings** 

Aircraft

(general) - Unknown/Not determined

# **Factual Information**

| History of Flight |  |
|-------------------|--|
| Enroute           | Unknown or undetermined (Defining event) |
| Emergency descent | Off-field or emergency landing           |

On March 24, 2022, about 1349 mountain daylight time, a Piper PA-32R-300, N111NW, was substantially damaged when it was involved in an accident near St. George, Utah. The pilot and passenger were seriously injured. The airplane was operated as a Title 14 *Code of Federal Regulations* Part 91 personal flight.

The pilot reported that after refueling the airplane with 94 gallons of fuel they departed Casper/Natrona County International Airport (CPR), Casper, Wyoming, with a destination of St. George Regional Airport (SGU), St. George, Utah. During the approach to runway 19 at SGU, about 3,800 ft above ground level, the pilot reported to the SGU tower that he lost power. Despite several attempts, he was unsuccessful at restarting the engine. Concerned he did not have sufficient altitude to make the runway, he initiated a forced landing to rough desert terrain. During the landing roll, the landing gear collapsed and separated, and the airplane slid about 100 ft before coming to rest upright, resulting in substantial damage to both wings and fuselage. First responder photos from the accident site showed dark colored and fuel saturated ground underneath the left inboard tank. During the wreckage recovery efforts, the left-wing tanks were empty. Twenty gallons of fuel was recovered from the right-wing tanks.



Figure 1-Accident site, view of the left wing and fuel spill.

Postaccident examination of the engine revealed no evidence of any preimpact mechanical malfunctions or failures that would have precluded normal operation. The fuel selector valve handle position was undetermined due to impact damage. The fuel selector valve was undamaged and found in the right tank position. The fuel lines between the wings, fuel selector valve, electric pump, and engine were tested with air and no blockages were noted. Residual fuel was found in fuel lines and fuel components during the examination.

Downloaded instrument flight data revealed that the fuel tanks were switched about every 20 minutes during the accident flight. Accurate fuel tank quantities were undetermined from the data. According to the data, shortly before the loss of engine power, the fuel pressure decreased to near zero, and about 5 seconds later, the fuel flow momentarily increased and

then dropped to zero. Three seconds later, the RPM decreased to zero followed by the manifold pressure increasing to near ambient levels.

#### **Pilot Information**

| Certificate:              | Private   | Age:                              | 56,Male        |
|---------------------------|---|-----------------------------------|----------------|
| Airplane Rating(s):       | Single-engine land  | Seat Occupied:                    | Left           |
| Other Aircraft Rating(s): | None  | Restraint Used:                   | 3-point        |
| Instrument Rating(s):     | None  | Second Pilot Present:             | No             |
| Instructor Rating(s):     | None  | Toxicology Performed:             |                |
| Medical Certification:    | Class 3 Without<br>waivers/limitations                                  | Last FAA Medical Exam:            | April 21, 2021 |
| Occupational Pilot:       | No  | Last Flight Review or Equivalent: | March 7, 2022  |
| Flight Time:              | 149 hours (Total, all aircraft), 106 hours (Total, this make and model) |                                   |                |

#### **Passenger Information**

| Certificate:              | Age:                           | Female  |
|---------------------------|--------------------------------|---------|
| Airplane Rating(s):       | Seat Occupied:                 | Right   |
| Other Aircraft Rating(s): | Restraint Used:                | 3-point |
| Instrument Rating(s):     | Second Pilot Present:          | No      |
| Instructor Rating(s):     | Toxicology Performed:          |         |
| Medical Certification:    | Last FAA Medical Exam:         |         |
| Occupational Pilot: No    | Last Flight Review or Equivale | ent:    |
| Flight Time:              |                                |         |

#### Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

| Aircraft Make:                   | Piper                           | Registration:                     | N111NW          |
|----------------------------------|---------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------|
| Model/Series:                    | PA-32R-300                      | Aircraft Category:                | Airplane        |
| Year of Manufacture:             | 1976                            | Amateur Built:                    |                 |
| Airworthiness Certificate:       | Normal                          | Serial Number:                    | 32R7680499      |
| Landing Gear Type:               | Retractable - Tricycle          | Seats:                            | 6               |
| Date/Type of Last<br>Inspection: | July 31, 2021 Annual            | Certified Max Gross Wt.:          | 3600 lbs        |
| Time Since Last Inspection:      |                                 | Engines:                          | 1 Reciprocating |
| Airframe Total Time:             | 14563 Hrs as of last inspection | Engine Manufacturer:              | Lycoming        |
| ELT:                             | Installed, not activated        | Engine Model/Series:              | IO-540-K1G5     |
| Registered Owner:                | KNELL LLC                       | Rated Power:                      | 300 Horsepower  |
| Operator:                        | Bruce Knell                     | Operating Certificate(s)<br>Held: | None            |

# Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

| Conditions at Accident Site:            | Visual (VMC)                     | Condition of Light:                     | Day                      |
|---|----------------------------------|---|--------------------------|
| <b>Observation Facility, Elevation:</b> | KSGU,2936 ft msl                 | Distance from Accident Site:            | 5 Nautical Miles         |
| Observation Time:                       | 13:56 Local                      | Direction from Accident Site:           | 296°                     |
| Lowest Cloud Condition:                 | Clear                            | Visibility                              | 10 miles                 |
| Lowest Ceiling:                         | None                             | Visibility (RVR):                       |                          |
| Wind Speed/Gusts:                       | 4 knots /                        | Turbulence Type<br>Forecast/Actual:     | Unknown / Unknown        |
| Wind Direction:                         | 210°                             | Turbulence Severity<br>Forecast/Actual: | Unknown / Unknown        |
| Altimeter Setting:                      | 30.14 inches Hg                  | Temperature/Dew Point:                  | 21°C / -11°C             |
| Precipitation and Obscuration:          | No Obscuration; No Precipitation |   |                          |
| Departure Point:                        | Casper, WY (CPR)                 | Type of Flight Plan Filed:              | VFR                      |
| Destination:                            | St. George, UT (SGU)             | Type of Clearance:                      | VFR;VFR flight following |
| Departure Time:                         | 10:30 Local                      | Type of Airspace:                       | Class E                  |

#### **Airport Information**

| Airport:             | St George Municipal Airport SGU | Runway Surface Type:      | Asphalt     |
|----------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------|-------------|
| Airport Elevation:   | 2883 ft msl                     | Runway Surface Condition: | Dry         |
| Runway Used:         | 19                              | IFR Approach:             | None        |
| Runway Length/Width: | 9300 ft / 150 ft                | VFR Approach/Landing:     | Straight-in |

# Wreckage and Impact Information

| Crew Injuries:         | 1 Serious | Aircraft Damage:        | Substantial               |
|------------------------|-----------|-------------------------|---------------------------|
| Passenger<br>Injuries: | 1 Serious | Aircraft Fire:          | None                      |
| Ground Injuries:       |           | Aircraft Explosion:     | None                      |
| Total Injuries:        | 2 Serious | Latitude,<br>Longitude: | 37.059517,-113.49787(est) |

#### **Administrative Information**

| Investigator In Charge (IIC):        | Swick, Andrew  |
|--------------------------------------|--|
| Additional Participating<br>Persons: | James Hill; FAA-FSDO; Salt Lake City, UT<br>Kathryn Whitaker; Piper Aircraft; Phoenix, AZ<br>Mark Platt; Lycoming Engines; Phoenix, AZ |
| Original Publish Date:               | March 20, 2024   |
| Last Revision Date:                  |  |
| Investigation Class:                 | Class 3  |
| Note:                                | The NTSB did not travel to the scene of this accident.   |
| Investigation Docket:                | https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=104826  |

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available here.