



# **Aviation Investigation Final Report**

| Location:               | Heavner, Oklahoma                    | Accident Number:     | CEN22LA140  |
|-------------------------|--------------------------------------|----------------------|-------------|
| Date & Time:            | March 12, 2022, 12:45 Local          | <b>Registration:</b> | N9410Q      |
| Aircraft:               | Beech A36                            | Aircraft Damage:     | Substantial |
| Defining Event:         | Loss of engine power (total)         | Injuries:            | 3 None      |
| Flight Conducted Under: | Part 91: General aviation - Personal |                      |             |

# Analysis

The pilot reported that he noticed the engine oil pressure dropped to 14 psi after he began the descent to his destination airport. He turned toward a nearby airport, but shortly thereafter the oil pressure dropped to 0 psi and the engine seized. The pilot executed a forced landing to a field and the airplane sustained substantial damage to its wings when it struck fences and livestock feeding troughs during the landing.

Postaccident examination of the airplane revealed several missing and loose bolts securing the engine valve covers. The No. 4 cylinder valve cover was completely off and its gasket was not located after the accident. The No. 6 cylinder valve cover was very loose and was only held on by 4 of the 8 bolts normally used to secure the cover. The No. 4 cylinder valve arm shaft bolt was missing. Metal shavings were observed throughout the valve assembly area as well as deposited on the cowling and airplane along with the lost engine oil.

Review of maintenance records did not reveal any recorded maintenance to the rocker covers since the most recent engine overhaul 6 years before the accident. Maintenance entries since the overhaul indicated routine maintenance, including annual/100-hour inspections and oil changes, with no leaks detected during post-maintenance engine runs. Attempts to discover when the rocker covers were last accessed for maintenance were unsuccessful.

Based on the available evidence the loss of engine power was due to oil exhaustion that resulted from improper installation of the engine valve covers. Determination of when the improper maintenance was performed could not be determined based on the maintenance entries that were available.

# **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

A total loss of engine power due to oil exhaustion which resulted from improper engine maintenance.

| Findings         |                                      |
|------------------|--------------------------------------|
| Aircraft         | Oil - Fluid level                    |
| Personnel issues | Installation - Maintenance personnel |
|                  |                                      |

# **Factual Information**

| History of Flight |   |
|-------------------|---|
| Enroute-cruise    | Loss of engine power (total) (Defining event) |

On March 12, 2022, about 1245 central standard time, a Beech A36, N9410Q, was substantially damaged when it was involved in an accident near Heavener, Oklahoma. The pilot and two passengers were not injured. The airplane was operated as a Title 14 *Code of Federal Regulations* Part 91 personal flight.

The pilot reported that the flight was from the Bentonville Municipal Airport/Louise M Thaden Field (VBT), Bentonville, Arkansas, to the Mena Intermountain Municipal Airport (MEZ), Mena, Arkansas. After beginning his descent into to the destination airport, he noticed a dramatic drop in oil pressure to 14 psi. He began to search for alternate airports since his destination was not reachable and the terrain was mountainous. He turned the airplane toward the west to attempt to reach the Robert S. Kerr Airport (KRKR), Poteau, Oklahoma, but within 1-2 minutes the oil pressure dropped to zero and the engine seized. The pilot executed a forced landing to a field. During the landing, the airplane struck fences and livestock feeding troughs, which resulted in substantial damage to the wings.

Postaccident examination revealed that the engine No. 4 cylinder rocker cover was completely off, and the No. 6 cylinder rocker cover was only being held on by 4 bolts, all of which were very loose. The No. 4 cylinder rocker cover gasket was not located after the accident. The No. 4 cylinder rocker arm shaft bolt was missing. Multiple rocker cover bolt holes were elongated and embossed with the bolt thread pattern. Metal shavings were observed throughout the valve assembly area as well as deposited on the cowling and airplane along with the lost engine oil.

Review of maintenance records revealed that the most recent maintenance on the engine was an oil change performed on December 22, 2021. The entry for the oil change noted that a postmaintenance engine run did not reveal any leaks and included no mention of work performed on the rocker covers.

On November 17, 2021, an annual/100-hour inspection was performed on the engine. The entry for the inspection noted that a post-maintenance engine run was normal. A specific notation regarding leaks was not included in the endorsement. No mention of work performed on the rocker covers was noted.

Further examination of the engine maintenance records showed that the engine had undergone an overhaul and was reinstalled on the airplane on November 2, 2016. Subsequent

to the overhaul, several maintenance entries were made; however, none of the entries since the overhaul noted any work performed on the rocker covers of the engine.

Interviews of personnel at the maintenance facility that performed the most recent overhaul revealed that approved hardware and gaskets were used to secure the rocker covers at the time of the overhaul. An interview of the mechanic that performed the most recent oil change revealed that he had not accessed the rocker covers and had no reason to while performing the oil change. Further attempts to discover when the rocker covers were last removed were unsuccessful.

#### **Pilot Information**

| Certificate:              | Private   | Age:                              | 54,Male        |
|---------------------------|---|-----------------------------------|----------------|
| Airplane Rating(s):       | Single-engine land  | Seat Occupied:                    | Left           |
| Other Aircraft Rating(s): | None  | Restraint Used:                   | Lap only       |
| Instrument Rating(s):     | Airplane  | Second Pilot Present:             | No             |
| Instructor Rating(s):     | None  | Toxicology Performed:             |                |
| Medical Certification:    | Class 3 With waivers/limitations  | Last FAA Medical Exam:            | May 2, 2021    |
| Occupational Pilot:       | No  | Last Flight Review or Equivalent: | March 20, 2022 |
| Flight Time:              | 1367 hours (Total, all aircraft), 1020 hours (Total, this make and model), 1296 hours (Pilot In<br>Command, all aircraft), 57 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 24 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft),<br>0 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft) |                                   |                |

### Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

| Aircraft Make:                   | Beech                          | Registration:                     | N9410Q          |
|----------------------------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------|
| Model/Series:                    | A36                            | Aircraft Category:                | Airplane        |
| Year of Manufacture:             | 1971                           | Amateur Built:                    |                 |
| Airworthiness Certificate:       | Normal                         | Serial Number:                    | E-286           |
| Landing Gear Type:               | Retractable - Tricycle         | Seats:                            | 6               |
| Date/Type of Last<br>Inspection: | November 17, 2021 Annual       | Certified Max Gross Wt.:          | 3599 lbs        |
| Time Since Last Inspection:      |                                | Engines:                          | 1 Reciprocating |
| Airframe Total Time:             | 8168 Hrs as of last inspection | Engine Manufacturer:              | Continental     |
| ELT:                             | Installed, not activated       | Engine Model/Series:              | IO-520-BB       |
| Registered Owner:                | HOOK EM LLC                    | Rated Power:                      | 300 Horsepower  |
| Operator:                        | HOOK EM LLC                    | Operating Certificate(s)<br>Held: | None            |

### Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

| Conditions at Accident Site:     | Visual (VMC)                     | Condition of Light:                     | Day               |
|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|---|-------------------|
| Observation Facility, Elevation: | KRKR,451 ft msl                  | Distance from Accident Site:            | 12 Nautical Miles |
| Observation Time:                | 12:35 Local                      | Direction from Accident Site:           | 314°              |
| Lowest Cloud Condition:          | Clear                            | Visibility                              | 10 miles          |
| Lowest Ceiling:                  | None                             | Visibility (RVR):                       |                   |
| Wind Speed/Gusts:                | /                                | Turbulence Type<br>Forecast/Actual:     | /                 |
| Wind Direction:                  |                                  | Turbulence Severity<br>Forecast/Actual: | /                 |
| Altimeter Setting:               | 30.46 inches Hg                  | Temperature/Dew Point:                  | 4°C / -6°C        |
| Precipitation and Obscuration:   | No Obscuration; No Precipitation |   |                   |
| Departure Point:                 | Bentonville, AR (VBT)            | Type of Flight Plan Filed:              | VFR               |
| Destination:                     | Mena, AR (MEZ)                   | Type of Clearance:                      | VFR               |
| Departure Time:                  | 12:15 Local                      | Type of Airspace:                       | Class G           |

### Wreckage and Impact Information

| Crew Injuries:         | 1 None | Aircraft Damage:        | Substantial  |
|------------------------|--------|-------------------------|--------------|
| Passenger<br>Injuries: | 2 None | Aircraft Fire:          | None         |
| Ground Injuries:       |        | Aircraft Explosion:     | None         |
| Total Injuries:        | 3 None | Latitude,<br>Longitude: | 34.88,-94.44 |

#### **Administrative Information**

| Investigator In Charge (IIC):        | Brannen, John  |
|--------------------------------------|--|
| Additional Participating<br>Persons: | Adam Brandt; FAA; Oklahoma City, OK                    |
| Original Publish Date:               | July 26, 2023  |
| Last Revision Date:                  |  |
| Investigation Class:                 | Class 3  |
| Note:                                | The NTSB did not travel to the scene of this accident. |
| Investigation Docket:                | https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=104768          |

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available <u>here</u>.