



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	EVANSVILLE, Indiana	Accident Number:	CHI96LA219
Date & Time:	June 26, 1996, 19:00 Local	Registration:	N4096K
Aircraft:	Navion NA1	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:		Injuries:	2 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

Analysis

The pilot reported that he was making a full stop at the 2,300 foot grass airstrip. He reported that the airplane touched down indicating about 70 mph. An inspection of the aircraft and accident site revealed that the aircraft first touched down slightly right of centerline at about 1000 feet from the approach end of runway 36. The track of the airplane indicated that the aircraft veered left heading straight to the point where it impacted the tree. About 400 to 450 feet after touchdown, the left flap made contact with the grass airstrip. A 250 to 300 foot gouge in the turf was made by the inboard section of the left flap. The left wing struck the tree at the mid section of the wing. The nose gear sheared off. The flaps were in the up position. The left and right main gear were up, not extended. The gear handle was in the down position. When the aircraft was picked up the landing gear came down and locked. The inspectors examined the landing gear and no mechanical discrepancies were noted on the left or right main landing gear.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: the pilot did not maintain control of the aircraft during landing roll.

Findings

Occurrence #1: MAIN GEAR COLLAPSED
Phase of Operation: LANDING - ROLL

Findings

1. (C) AIRCRAFT CONTROL - NOT MAINTAINED - PILOT IN COMMAND
2. LANDING GEAR,MAIN GEAR - COLLAPSED

Occurrence #2: ON GROUND/WATER COLLISION WITH OBJECT

Phase of Operation: LANDING - ROLL

Findings

3. OBJECT - TREE(S)

Factual Information

On June 26, 1996, at 1900 eastern daylight time, a Navion, NA1, N4096K, sustained substantial damage during landing when the left main landing gear collapsed during roll out. The airplane skidded off the runway and the left wing impacted a tree. The commercial pilot and one passenger reported no injuries. The 14 CFR Part 91 flight was returning to Skyline Airport, Evansville, Indiana, where it had departed on a local flight. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed and no flight plan was filed.

The pilot reported that he was making a full stop at the grass airstrip. He reported that he touched down about 400 feet from the approach end of runway 36, indicating about 70 mph. He reported that he continued the rollout for 500 feet beyond the touchdown point when he heard a loud "thump" on the left side of the airplane, just after he had retracted the flaps. He reported that the left landing gear collapsed and the left wing contacted the grass strip. The airplane started veering to the left even though the pilot applied full right rudder and aileron. The pilot indicated that the airplane continued down the runway and turning to the left for about another 400 feet. The plane's left wing struck a tree which was 10 feet west of the 150 foot wide runway. The pilot reported that after the airplane impacted the tree, the nose gear and right gear collapsed, and the propeller struck the ground. The pilot reported that he turned off the fuel, electrical system, radios, and master switch, and evacuated the airplane.

The aircraft and accident site were examined by Airworthiness and Operations Inspectors of the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA). The inspection revealed that the aircraft first touched down slightly right of centerline at about 1000 feet from the approach end of runway 36. The inspector reported that the track of the airplane indicated that the aircraft veered left heading straight to the point where it impacted the tree. About 400 to 450 feet after touchdown, the left flap made contact with the grass airstrip. A 250 to 300 foot gouge in the turf was made by the inboard section of the left flap. The inspector reported that the left wing struck the tree at the mid section of the wing. The nose gear sheared off. The flaps were in the up position. The left and right main gear were up, not extended. The gear handle was in the down position.

The inspectors reported that when the aircraft was picked up the landing gear came down and locked. The inspectors examined the landing gear and no mechanical discrepancies were noted on the left or right main landing gear.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Commercial	Age:	41, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 2 Valid Medical--no waivers/lim.	Last FAA Medical Exam:	June 25, 1995
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	649 hours (Total, all aircraft), 249 hours (Total, this make and model), 19 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 7 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Navion	Registration:	N4096K
Model/Series:	NA1 NA1	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Utility	Serial Number:	NAV-4-1096
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	November 1, 1995 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2750 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	48 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	7692 Hrs	Engine Manufacturer:	Continental
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	E225-4
Registered Owner:	JULES T. MOMINEE	Rated Power:	225 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	EVV ,418 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	6 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	18:54 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	40°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	9 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	308°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	26°C / 14°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	(3EV)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:		Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	00:00 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class E

Airport Information

Airport:	SKYLANE 3EV	Runway Surface Type:	Grass/turf
Airport Elevation:	384 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	36	IFR Approach:	
Runway Length/Width:	2000 ft / 150 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full stop

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 None	Latitude, Longitude:	37.970478,-87.48069(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC): Silliman, James

Additional Participating Persons:

Original Publish Date: May 23, 1997

Last Revision Date:

Investigation Class: [Class](#)

Note:

Investigation Docket: <https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=10290>

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).