



# Aviation Investigation Final Report

<b>Location:</b>	Mesquite, Texas	<b>Accident Number:</b>	CEN20LA134
<b>Date &amp; Time:</b>	March 29, 2020, 15:18 Local	<b>Registration:</b>	N151JD
<b>Aircraft:</b>	MUSE P51D	<b>Aircraft Damage:</b>	Destroyed
<b>Defining Event:</b>	Loss of control in flight	<b>Injuries:</b>	1 Fatal
<b>Flight Conducted Under:</b>	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

## Analysis

Witnesses reported that the pilot took off and turned to a right crosswind in the traffic pattern, followed shortly thereafter by a turn to downwind. The airplane then entered a gradually steepening right turn before transitioning to a steep nose down attitude which continued to impact with terrain.

Automated Dependent Surveillance – Broadcast (ADS-B) data revealed that the airplane entered a right traffic pattern after takeoff and leveled off about 1,800 ft mean sea level (msl) on a crosswind leg before beginning a turn to a downwind leg. The airplane subsequently entered a steep, descending right turn until impact. The average descent rate over the last 6 seconds of the flight was about 6,000 ft per minute.

The airplane was destroyed by impact forces and the postaccident fire. A postaccident examination of the airframe and engine did not reveal any anomalies consistent with a preimpact failure or malfunction. However, the examination was limited by the extent of the impact and postimpact fire damage. For the accident flight, the pilot had planned to proceed to the practice area to conduct airwork; however, he elected to remain in the airport traffic pattern for unknown reasons. Full right rudder trim was set before takeoff in order to counteract engine torque.

Based on the available information, the pilot inadvertently entered an aerodynamic stall from which he was unable to recover. The yaw induced by the full right rudder trim aggravated the stall and made recovery more difficult. The reason for the loss of control could not be determined with the available information.

## Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

The pilot's inadvertent exceedance of the airplane's critical angle of attack for undetermined reasons, which resulted in an aerodynamic stall, loss of control, and subsequent impact with terrain.

## Findings

<b>Personnel issues</b>	Aircraft control - Pilot
<b>Not determined</b>	(general) - Unknown/Not determined
<b>Aircraft</b>	Angle of attack - Not attained/maintained

## Factual Information

### History of Flight

<b>Approach-VFR pattern downwind</b>	Loss of control in flight (Defining event)
<b>Uncontrolled descent</b>	Collision with terr/obj (non-CFIT)

On March 29, 2020, at 1518 central daylight time, a Muse P51D airplane, N151JD, was destroyed when it was involved in an accident near Mesquite, Texas. The pilot was fatally injured. The airplane was operated as a Title 14 *Code of Federal Regulations* Part 91 personal flight.

Witnesses reported that the pilot took off and turned to a right crosswind in the traffic pattern, followed shortly thereafter by a turn to downwind. The airplane then entered a gradually steepening right turn before transitioning to a steep nose down attitude which continued until impact with terrain.

A review of Automated Dependent Surveillance – Broadcast (ADS-B) data revealed that the airplane entered a right traffic pattern after takeoff and leveled off about 1,800 ft mean sea level (msl) on crosswind before beginning a turn to downwind. About 1518:47, the airplane entered a descending right turn from about 1,700 ft msl. The final data point was recorded at 1518:53; the altitude was about 900 ft msl. The average descent rate over the last 6 seconds of data was approximately 8,000 ft per minute.

A postaccident examination of the airframe and engine did not reveal any anomalies consistent with a preimpact failure or malfunction. However, the examination was limited by the extent of the impact and postimpact fire damage.

Toxicology testing performed at the Federal Aviation Administration Forensic Sciences Laboratory found no drugs of abuse.

The owner/builder reported the accident occurred during the third flight of the airplane. The plan was for the pilot to conduct airwork in the local area and to gather data to assist in determining airplane fuel consumption. After the second flight, the pilot informed the builder that he had inadvertently moved the fuel selector to the OFF position while attempting to change tanks. He was able to correct the situation and had no further difficulties. A friend of the pilot reported that the pilot had cut the second flight short because continuous right rudder input was required. For the accident flight, the pilot took off with full right rudder trim to counter act the right turning tendency.

## Pilot Information

<b>Certificate:</b>	Private	<b>Age:</b>	72, Male
<b>Airplane Rating(s):</b>	Single-engine land	<b>Seat Occupied:</b>	Single
<b>Other Aircraft Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Restraint Used:</b>	4-point
<b>Instrument Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Second Pilot Present:</b>	No
<b>Instructor Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Toxicology Performed:</b>	Yes
<b>Medical Certification:</b>	BasicMed	<b>Last FAA Medical Exam:</b>	October 7, 2019
<b>Occupational Pilot:</b>	No	<b>Last Flight Review or Equivalent:</b>	August 3, 2018
<b>Flight Time:</b>	1814 hours (Total, all aircraft), 1.3 hours (Total, this make and model), 1807 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 4.8 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 2.2 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 0 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

## Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

<b>Aircraft Make:</b>	MUSE	<b>Registration:</b>	N151JD
<b>Model/Series:</b>	P51D	<b>Aircraft Category:</b>	Airplane
<b>Year of Manufacture:</b>	2016	<b>Amateur Built:</b>	Yes
<b>Airworthiness Certificate:</b>	Experimental (Special)	<b>Serial Number:</b>	F869
<b>Landing Gear Type:</b>	Retractable - Tailwheel	<b>Seats:</b>	2
<b>Date/Type of Last Inspection:</b>	March 1, 2020 Condition	<b>Certified Max Gross Wt.:</b>	2490 lbs
<b>Time Since Last Inspection:</b>	2 Hrs	<b>Engines:</b>	1 Reciprocating
<b>Airframe Total Time:</b>	2 Hrs at time of accident	<b>Engine Manufacturer:</b>	Chevrolet
<b>ELT:</b>	Installed, activated, did not aid in locating accident	<b>Engine Model/Series:</b>	LS1
<b>Registered Owner:</b>	On file	<b>Rated Power:</b>	350 Horsepower
<b>Operator:</b>	On file	<b>Operating Certificate(s) Held:</b>	None

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

<b>Conditions at Accident Site:</b>	Visual (VMC)	<b>Condition of Light:</b>	Day
<b>Observation Facility, Elevation:</b>	HQZ, 447 ft msl	<b>Distance from Accident Site:</b>	1 Nautical Miles
<b>Observation Time:</b>	20:19 Local	<b>Direction from Accident Site:</b>	270°
<b>Lowest Cloud Condition:</b>	Clear	<b>Visibility</b>	10 miles
<b>Lowest Ceiling:</b>	None	<b>Visibility (RVR):</b>	
<b>Wind Speed/Gusts:</b>	/	<b>Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:</b>	/
<b>Wind Direction:</b>		<b>Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:</b>	/
<b>Altimeter Setting:</b>	30.17 inches Hg	<b>Temperature/Dew Point:</b>	21°C / 7°C
<b>Precipitation and Obscuration:</b>	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
<b>Departure Point:</b>	Mesquite, TX (HQZ )	<b>Type of Flight Plan Filed:</b>	None
<b>Destination:</b>	Mesquite, TX (HQZ)	<b>Type of Clearance:</b>	None
<b>Departure Time:</b>	20:18 Local	<b>Type of Airspace:</b>	Class E

## Airport Information

<b>Airport:</b>	Mesquite Metro HQZ	<b>Runway Surface Type:</b>	Concrete
<b>Airport Elevation:</b>	447 ft msl	<b>Runway Surface Condition:</b>	Dry
<b>Runway Used:</b>	36	<b>IFR Approach:</b>	None
<b>Runway Length/Width:</b>	6000 ft / 100 ft	<b>VFR Approach/Landing:</b>	None

## Wreckage and Impact Information

<b>Crew Injuries:</b>	1 Fatal	<b>Aircraft Damage:</b>	Destroyed
<b>Passenger Injuries:</b>		<b>Aircraft Fire:</b>	None
<b>Ground Injuries:</b>		<b>Aircraft Explosion:</b>	None
<b>Total Injuries:</b>	1 Fatal	<b>Latitude, Longitude:</b>	32.761943,-96.515556

## Administrative Information

<b>Investigator In Charge (IIC):</b>	Sorensen, Timothy
<b>Additional Participating Persons:</b>	Daniel Montie; FAA Flight Standards; Irving, TX
<b>Original Publish Date:</b>	March 11, 2022
<b>Last Revision Date:</b>	
<b>Investigation Class:</b>	<a href="#">Class 3</a>
<b>Note:</b>	The NTSB did not travel to the scene of this accident.
<b>Investigation Docket:</b>	<a href="https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=101126">https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=101126</a>

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).