



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	Palm Coast, Florida	Accident Number:	ERA20CA140
Date & Time:	January 8, 2020, 07:47 Local	Registration:	N536ND (A1); N550ND (A2)
Aircraft:	Cessna 172 (A1); Cessna 172 (A2)	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial (A1); Minor (A2)
Defining Event:	Ground collision	Injuries:	1 None (A1); 1 None (A2)
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Instructional (A1); Part 91: General aviation - Instructional (A2)		

Analysis

A student pilot was taxiing his airplane into the runup area at what he thought was a safe distance from another airplane that was performing a runup. The moving airplane's left wing contacted the stationary airplane's propeller, resulting in substantial damage to the moving airplane's left wing. Neither pilot reported any preaccident mechanical failures or malfunctions with their respective airplanes that would have precluded normal operation.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

The student pilot's failure to allow adequate separation when passing the parked airplane, which resulted in a ground collision.

Findings

Personnel issues (A1)	Task monitoring/vigilance - Pilot
Personnel issues (A1)	Monitoring environment - Pilot
Aircraft (A1)	(general) - Not attained/maintained
Personnel issues (A2)	Task monitoring/vigilance - Pilot of other aircraft

Factual Information

History of Flight

Taxi (A1)	Ground collision (Defining event)
Standing-engine(s) operating (A2)	Ground collision

Student pilot Information (A1)

Certificate:	Student	Age:	24
Airplane Rating(s):	None	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Lap only
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 With waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	November 12, 2019
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	54 hours (Total, all aircraft), 54 hours (Total, this make and model), 6 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 54 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 19 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Student pilot Information (A2)

Certificate:	Student	Age:	24
Airplane Rating(s):	None	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Lap only
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:		Last FAA Medical Exam:	
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:			

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information (A1)

Aircraft Make:	Cessna	Registration:	N536ND
Model/Series:	172 S	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:	2009	Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal; Utility	Serial Number:	172S10932
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	December 20, 2019 100 hour	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2550 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	63 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	8920.7 Hrs at time of accident	Engine Manufacturer:	Lycoming
ELT:	C91A installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	IO-360-L2A
Registered Owner:	Phoenix East Aviation, LLC	Rated Power:	180 Horsepower
Operator:	Phoenix East Aviation, LLC	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	Pilot school (141)

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information (A2)

Aircraft Make:	Cessna	Registration:	N550ND
Model/Series:	172 S	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:	2009	Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal; Utility	Serial Number:	172S10992
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:		Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2550 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:		Engine Manufacturer:	Lycoming
ELT:		Engine Model/Series:	IO-360-L2A
Registered Owner:	Phoenix East Aviation, LLC	Rated Power:	
Operator:	Phoenix East Aviation, LLC	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	Pilot school (141)

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	FIN,33 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	0 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	07:50 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	/	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	None / None
Wind Direction:		Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	N/A / N/A
Altimeter Setting:	30.37 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	7°C / 1°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Palm Coast, FL (FIN) (A1); Palm Coast, FL (FIN) (A2)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None (A1); None (A2)
Destination:	Palm Coast, FL (FIN) (A1); Palm Coast, FL (FIN) (A2)	Type of Clearance:	None (A1); None (A2)
Departure Time:		Type of Airspace:	Class D (A1); Class D (A2)

Airport Information

Airport:	Flagler Executive FIN	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	33 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:		IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:		VFR Approach/Landing:	None

Wreckage and Impact Information (A1)

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 None	Latitude, Longitude:	29.465278,-81.207778(est)

Wreckage and Impact Information (A2)

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Minor
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 None	Latitude, Longitude:	29.465278,-81.207778(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Spencer, Lynn
Additional Participating Persons:	Jennifer Anderson; FAA/FSDO; Orlando, FL
Original Publish Date:	February 2, 2021
Last Revision Date:	March 10, 2025
Investigation Class:	Class 4
Note:	This accident report documents the factual circumstances of this accident as described to the NTSB.
Investigation Docket:	https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=101125

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).