



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location: LUDINGTON, Michigan Accident Number: CHI95LA332

Date & Time: September 24, 1995, 20:19 Local Registration: N6725P

Aircraft: PIPER PA-24-250 Aircraft Damage: Substantial

Defining Event: 1 Serious

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General aviation - Personal

Analysis

THE PILOT REPORTED THAT HE 'RAN OUT OF FUEL,' APPROXIMATELY SIX MILES FROM HIS DESTINATION AIRPORT. HE 'TURNED THE AIRPLANE INTO THE WIND' AND ATTEMPTED A FORCED LANDING IN A PLOWED FIELD. THE PILOT SAID THAT HE HAD TAKEN OFF KNOWING THAT HE WAS 'PROBABLY STRETCHING HIS FUEL TO REACH HIS PLANNED DESTINATION.' THE PILOT DID NOT REFUEL THE AIRPLANE PRIOR TO TAKEOFF. EXAMINATION OF THE WRECKAGE SHOWED EVIDENCE INDICATIVE OF A HARD FLAT IMPACT. THERE WAS NO EVIDENCE OF FUEL AT THE ACCIDENT SITE. EXAMINATION OF THE FUEL SYSTEM SHOWED NO EVIDENCE OF FUEL PRIOR TO IMPACT.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: fuel exhaustion resulting from the pilot's inaccurate fuel calculations and the failure to refuel the airplane prior to takeoff. An additional cause was the stall/mush during the forced landing.

Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF ENGINE POWER(TOTAL) - NONMECHANICAL

Phase of Operation: CRUISE

Findings

1. (C) FLUID, FUEL - EXHAUSTION

2. (C) REFUELING - NOT PERFORMED - PILOT IN COMMAND

3. (C) FUEL CONSUMPTION CALCULATIONS - INACCURATE - PILOT IN COMMAND

Occurrence #2: FORCED LANDING

Phase of Operation: EMERGENCY DESCENT/LANDING

Occurrence #3: LOSS OF CONTROL - IN FLIGHT Phase of Operation: EMERGENCY DESCENT/LANDING

Findings

4. (C) AIRSPEED - NOT MAINTAINED - PILOT IN COMMAND 5. (C) STALL/MUSH - INADVERTENT - PILOT IN COMMAND

Occurrence #4: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER

Phase of Operation: DESCENT - UNCONTROLLED

Page 2 of 6 CHI95LA332

Factual Information

On September 24, 1995, at 2019 eastern daylight time (edt), a Piper PA-24-250, N6725P, piloted by a private pilot, sustained substantial damage during a forced landing to a plowed field. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time of the accident. The flight was operated under 14 CFR Part 91. A flight plan was not on file. The pilot sustained serious injuries. The flight departed Rochester, New York, at 1745 edt, and was en route to Ludington, Michigan.

The pilot reported that he was approximately six miles from his destination airport at 2200 feet mean sea level when he "ran out of fuel." He turned on the fuel pump and switched tanks with no success. The pilot stated that he then "turned the airplane into the wind and looked for a place to put the airplane down." He selected a plowed field to do a forced landing in, but had to clear trees in front of him to reach it. The pilot stated that he was knocked unconscious at impact. In a subsequent telephone conversation with the pilot, he said that he had taken off knowing that he was "probably stretching his fuel to reach his planned destination," but felt that he could "get fuel somewhere en route."

The Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) inspector who examined the wreckage stated that the airplane "impacted in soft dirt and slid approximately 50 feet before coming to rest." The right main gear strut was found driven up through the right wing skin. The left main gear was bent outward and the nose gear was found separated from the rest of the airplane wreckage. The cowling and forward fuselage were bent underneath. Examination of the propeller showed one blade undamaged and the other blade bent aft. There were severe wrinkles observed throughout the skin of the airplane. The cabin was found intact, but the seats, control panel and luggage had been jarred loose. Examination of the flight controls showed no evidence of preimpact damage. There was no evidence of fuel at the accident site. Examination of the fuel system indicated no sign of fuel in the system prior to impact.

Page 3 of 6 CHI95LA332

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	49,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medicalno waivers/lim.	Last FAA Medical Exam:	May 26, 1994
Occupational Pilot:	No Last Flight Review or Equivalent:		
Flight Time:	420 hours (Total, all aircraft), 56 hours (Total, this make and model), 341 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 31 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 11 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	PIPER	Registration:	N6725P
Model/Series:	PA-24-250 PA-24-250	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	24-1852
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	January 1, 1995 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2800 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	75 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	2187 Hrs	Engine Manufacturer:	LYCOMING
ELT:	Installed, activated, did not aid in locating accident	Engine Model/Series:	O-540-A1D5
Registered Owner:	DAVID R. KIEFER	Rated Power:	250 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	

Page 4 of 6 CHI95LA332

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Night/bright
Observation Facility, Elevation:	MBL ,620 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	20 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	20:53 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	207°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Scattered / 6000 ft AGL	Visibility	15 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	/	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	0°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	8°C / 4°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipita	ation	
Departure Point:	ROCHESTER , NY (ROC)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	(LDM)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	00:00 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class E

Airport Information

Airport:		Runway Surface Type:	
Airport Elevation:		Runway Surface Condition:	Soft
Runway Used:	0	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:		VFR Approach/Landing:	Forced landing

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Serious	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 Serious	Latitude, Longitude:	43.949478,-86.440002(est)

Page 5 of 6 CHI95LA332

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC): Bowling, David

Additional Participating Persons:

Original Publish Date: December 19, 1995

Last Revision Date:

Investigation Class: Class

Note:

Investigation Docket: https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=10040

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 United States Code section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 United States Code section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 6 of 6 CHI95LA332