



AVIATION



HIGHWAY



MARINE



RAILROAD



PIPELINE

Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	Newdale, Idaho	Accident Number:	WPR23LA242
Date & Time:	June 26, 2023, 18:45 Local	Registration:	N730SC
Aircraft:	Piper PA-28-140	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:	Aerodynamic stall/spin	Injuries:	2 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Instructional		

Analysis

The flight instructor reported that while his student was at the controls, he initiated a simulated engine failure, and the student executed the emergency procedures for a forced landing. The student chose a place to land and configured the airplane for landing, including full flaps. The instructor noticed that the airplane's airspeed was "a little slow", and he instructed the student to check the airspeed, then recover from the simulation. The student retracted the flaps instead of adding engine power, and the airplane stalled and sank. The instructor immediately attempted to take over the airplane's controls from the student and verbally commanded "my controls", but the student was "stuck on the controls and locked up." The airplane continued to descend and touched down in a field and nosed over. Both wings, the fuselage, the vertical stabilizer, and the rudder sustained substantial damage. The instructor reported that there were no preaccident mechanical malfunctions or failures that would have precluded normal operation.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

The premature retraction of the flaps by the student pilot, while just above the airplane's stall speed. Contributing to the accident was the flight instructor's inadequate supervision and failure to regain aircraft control from the student pilot.

Findings

Personnel issues	Use of equip/system - Student/instructed pilot
Personnel issues	Incorrect action sequence - Student/instructed pilot
Aircraft	Airspeed - Not attained/maintained
Personnel issues	Delayed action - Instructor/check pilot
Personnel issues	Monitoring other person - Instructor/check pilot

Factual Information

History of Flight

Emergency descent	Simulated/training event
Maneuvering-low-alt flying	Aerodynamic stall/spin (Defining event)

Flight instructor Information

Certificate:	Commercial; Flight instructor	Age:	29,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Right
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Lap only
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane single-engine	Toxicology Performed:	
Medical Certification:	Class 1 Without waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	February 1, 2022
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	October 29, 2021
Flight Time:	602 hours (Total, all aircraft), 318 hours (Total, this make and model), 544 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 119 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 50 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 4 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Student pilot Information

Certificate:	Student	Age:	24,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	None	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Lap only
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	
Medical Certification:	Class 1 Without waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	October 26, 2022
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	33 hours (Total, all aircraft), 33 hours (Total, this make and model), 13 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 5 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 1 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Piper	Registration:	N730SC
Model/Series:	PA-28-140	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:	1972	Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	28-7225546
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	March 8, 2023 100 hour	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2150 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	4281.13 Hrs at time of accident	Engine Manufacturer:	Lycoming
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	O-320-E3D
Registered Owner:	On file	Rated Power:	160 Horsepower
Operator:	On file	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	KRXE, 4858 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	10 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	17:53 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	255°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	10 knots / None	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/ None
Wind Direction:	240°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/ Light
Altimeter Setting:	29.9 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	26°C / 4°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Rexburg, ID (KRXE)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Rexburg, ID (KRXE)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	17:30 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class G

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	2 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:		Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 None	Latitude, Longitude:	43.876,-111.579

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Blocher, Kristyn
Additional Participating Persons:	Andy Grover; Federal Aviation Administration; Salt Lake City, UT
Original Publish Date:	November 2, 2023
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class 4
Note:	The NTSB did not travel to the scene of this accident.
Investigation Docket:	https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=192463

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).