

Aviation Investigation Factual Report

Location:	Belleville, Illinois	Accident Number:	CHI07LA056
Date & Time:	December 28, 2006, 16:12 Local	Registration:	N9284P
Aircraft:	Piper PA-24-260B	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:		Injuries:	3 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

Factual Information

On December 28, 2006, at 1612 central standard time, a Piper PA-24-260B (Comanche), piloted by a commercial pilot, was substantially damaged while landing at Scott AFB/MidAmerica Airport (BLV), Belleville, Illinois. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time of the accident. The personal flight was operating under the provisions of 14 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) Part 91 without a flight plan. The pilot and his two passengers were not injured. The flight originated from Piatt County Airport (2K0), Monticello, Illinois, at 1507.

The pilot reported that after takeoff he selected landing gear-up, but the corresponding position light did not illuminate. He checked the landing gear motor circuit breaker and found it tripped. He selected landing gear-down and reset the circuit breaker. The landing gear did not fully extend, as indicated by the position of the emergency extension handle and the position lights. The pilot again attempted to retract the landing gear, but it only retracted about 90-percent before the landing gear motor circuit breaker tripped. The pilot decided to continue to BLV where he planned to perform an emergency landing gear extension prior to landing.

As the airplane neared BLV, the pilot attempted to lower the landing gear without success using the normal extension procedure. He then proceeded with the emergency landing gear extension procedure. The pilot was unable to get the landing gear to fully extend or retract during subsequent attempts. The control tower verified that the landing gear was not fully extended during a fly-by. The pilot decided to retract the landing gear as much as possible and perform a wheels-up landing in the grass area adjacent to runway 14. The airplane sustained substantial damage to a fuselage bulkhead during landing.

Inspection of the airplane showed that the left main and nose landing gear were completely retracted into their respective wheelwells. The right main landing gear was partially extended with its wheel and lower strut assembly rotated in the wheelwell. The AN174-13 bolt (p/n 402-313) that attached the upper and lower portions of the torque link assembly (p/n 20735-03) was sheared in half. The lower torque link was jammed against the wheelwell structure, which restricted the movement of the entire landing gear assembly.

The torque link assembly and bolt were sent to the National Transportation Safety Board's Materials Laboratory in Washington, D.C., for further examination. The bolt fracture features were consistent with shear overstress, as a result of torsion during the action of the torque link assembly. The bolt fracture face did not contain any evidence of fatigue cracking. The separated bolt sections were seized within the upper and lower torque links, as a result of surface corrosion.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Commercial; Flight instructor	Age:	39,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Single-engine sea; Multi-engine land; Multi- engine sea	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	Balloon; Glider; Gyroplane	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane multi-engine; Airplane single-engine; Glider; Gyroplane; Instrument airplane	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Without waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	January 1, 2004
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	October 1, 2005
Flight Time:	2128 hours (Total, all aircraft), 543 hours (Total, this make and model), 1856 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 14 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 8 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 1 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Piper	Registration:	N9284P
Model/Series:	PA-24-260B	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	24-4784
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	August 1, 2006 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	3100 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	5228 Hrs at time of accident	Engine Manufacturer:	Lycoming
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	IO-540-C4D5D
Registered Owner:	On file	Rated Power:	260 Horsepower
Operator:	On file	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	BLV,459 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	0 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	15:55 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	0°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Scattered / 25000 ft AGL	Visibility	7 miles
Lowest Ceiling:		Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	11 knots / None	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	180°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30.14 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	8°C / 1°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipita	ation	
Departure Point:	Monticello, IL (2K0)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Belleville, IL (BLV)	Type of Clearance:	VFR flight following
Departure Time:	15:07 Local	Type of Airspace:	

Airport Information

Airport:	Scott AFB/Mid America Airport BLV	Runway Surface Type:	Grass/turf
Airport Elevation:	459 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:		IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:		VFR Approach/Landing:	Forced landing;Full stop;Traffic pattern

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	2 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	3 None	Latitude, Longitude:	38.552776,-89.836112

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Fox, Andrew
Additional Participating Persons:	Norman Loftsgard; Federal Aviation Administration - St. Louis FSDO; St. Ann, MO
Report Date:	January 29, 2008
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=65208

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available here.