

# **Aviation Investigation Factual Report**

Location:	Tacoma, Washington	Incident Number:	SEA05IA115
Date & Time:	June 2, 2005, 06:00 Local	Registration:	N27PG
Aircraft:	Piper PA-46-350P	Aircraft Damage:	Minor
Defining Event:		Injuries:	1 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Unknown		

## **Factual Information**

On June 2, 2005, approximately 0600 Pacific daylight time, the NTSB Northwest Regional Office was notified via email that a significant crack had been found in the right wing spar lower cap of a Piper Malibu PA-46-350P, N27PG, during an annual inspection at Tacoma Narrows Airport, Tacoma, Washington. The crack in the spar cap, which had progressed through approximately 80 percent of the horizontal surface of the cap, was discovered in a follow-up inspection by a maintenance technician at PAVCO Flight Center, after that individual had found loose lower wing skin rivets directly below the area where the crack was located. The aircraft, which previously had been owned by Pacific Gas and Electric Company (PG&E), and had been occasionally used for low-level pipeline visual observation patrol, had accumulated 5,273 hours on its airframe. The current owner, who had operated the aircraft for the last five years, stated that he was not aware of any significantly hard landing since he had purchased the aircraft. A review of the log books did not show any indication of other airframe damage from any previous hard landing, and there was no other entry that indicated that the aircraft had been involved in any accidents or events that might be expected to have produced such a crack from a one-time overload. The wing spar lower cap was removed from the aircraft and submitted to the NTSB laboratory to determine the extent and mode of the failure.

The NTSB Materials Laboratory inspection of the lower wing spar cap determined that the crack surface features were consistent with a fatigue crack that had initiated at both the aft and forward surfaces of the aft rivet hole on the horizontal surface of the cap, at a location 28.63 inches from its outboard end. The crack was 1.53 inches in length on the cap's upper surface, and 1.53 inches in length on its lower surface. The surface of the crack was relatively flat, with smooth, well defined, curving arrest lines. There was no evidence of inclusions, discontinuities, corrosion pitting, or material defects at the origins of the crack. All dimensional measurements were within engineering drawing specifications, and the hardness of 81.3 HRB, and conductivity of 39.7 percent IACS were within the typical range for the aluminum alloy specified for the wing spar cap material.

During the investigation it was determined that at the time the crack was detected, the aircraft had flown 5,273 hours. Of that total time, approximately 1,100 hours were flown as part of a low-level pipeline patrol mission. It was further determined that as part of the certification process, Piper Aircraft had determined that the "general use" safe time in service (TIS), adjusted with a scatter pattern of eight, was 10,723 hours for the wing structure. The certification process did not include determination of a safe time in service when any portion of the aircraft's life had involved a "pipeline survey" mission profile.

The investigation also determined that the two rivet holes through which the crack passed (one of which contained the points of origin) was the location where two of the rivets that held the lower wing skin on in an area addressed by Piper Service Bulletin 796B, Part One. This

service bulletin was published by Piper to address "loose and working rivets along the lower spar cap." In part, the bulletin states, "If this condition exists, and is left uncorrected over an extended period of time, the structural integrity of the wing could be compromised." The actions delineated in this service bulletin had not been performed on this aircraft (N27PG) even though loose and working (smoking) rivets were found at the subject location on the lower skins of both wings.

#### **Pilot Information**

Certificate:	Age:	
Airplane Rating(s):	Seat Occupied:	
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Second Pilot Present:	
Instructor Rating(s):	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Last FAA Medical Exam:	
Occupational Pilot:	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:		

## Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Piper	Registration:	N27PG
Model/Series:	PA-46-350P	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	4622104
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	6
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	4300 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	0 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	5273 Hrs as of last inspection	Engine Manufacturer:	Lycoming
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	TIO-540-AE2A
Registered Owner:	Wade H. Perrow	Rated Power:	350 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Condition of Light:
Observation Facility, Elevation:	Distance from Accident Site:
Observation Time:	Direction from Accident Site:
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Visibility
Lowest Ceiling:	Visibility (RVR):
Wind Speed/Gusts: /	Turbulence Type / Forecast/Actual:
Wind Direction:	Turbulence Severity / Forecast/Actual:
Altimeter Setting:	Temperature/Dew Point:
Precipitation and Obscuration:	
Departure Point:	Type of Flight Plan Filed:
Destination:	Type of Clearance:
Departure Time:	Type of Airspace:

# Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Minor
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 None	Latitude, Longitude:	47.268054,-122.578056

### **Administrative Information**

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Anderson, Orrin
Additional Participating Persons:	Patrick Padden; Seattle FSDO
Report Date:	July 17, 2006
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=61685

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available <u>here</u>.