



# Aviation Investigation Factual Report

<b>Location:</b>	Sparta, Michigan	<b>Accident Number:</b>	CHI03LA072
<b>Date &amp; Time:</b>	February 18, 2003, 10:00 Local	<b>Registration:</b>	N9439S
<b>Aircraft:</b>	Beech V35	<b>Aircraft Damage:</b>	Substantial
<b>Defining Event:</b>		<b>Injuries:</b>	2 None
<b>Flight Conducted Under:</b>	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

## Factual Information

On February 18, 2003, about 1000 eastern standard time, a Beech V35, N9439S, piloted by a private pilot sustained substantial damage when it landed hard, collapsed the left main landing gear, and hit a snowbank during landing on runway 24 at the Paul C. Miller-Sparta Airport (8D4), Sparta, Michigan. The 14 CFR Part 91 personal flight was operating in instrument meteorological conditions on an instrument flight rules flight plan. The pilot and his one passenger were not injured. The flight originated from Pontiac, Michigan, at 0900.

The pilot reported he received two preflight briefings and decided to make the flight under visual flight rules (VFR) due to reports of icing conditions in the clouds. The pilot noted he encountered freezing rain between Lansing, Michigan, and 8D4. The pilot stated he received an instrument flight rules (IFR) clearance from air traffic control (ATC). The pilot indicated he subsequently climbed above the clouds and was cleared for the VOR approach to runway 24 at 8D4. The pilot reported he did not observe any ice on the wings once above the clouds at 3,500 feet mean sea level (MSL). The pilot stated he delayed his descent to the final approach fix to avoid further icing of the airplane. The pilot indicated he reached the minimum descent altitude and did not notice any ice on the airplane's wings or windshield. The pilot also stated, "the plane felt like it was flying normally." The pilot noted he added flaps and the airplane began to descend rapidly, the pilot indicated he added power. The pilot reported the airplane landed hard and the left main landing gear collapsed, the airplane turned right, the nose landing gear collapsed, and the airplane subsequently slid into a snowbank.

The pilot reported no malfunctions with the airplane or the airplane's engine prior to the accident.

The airport manager who witnessed the accident reported the airplane had "1/2 inch to 3/4 inch of ice accumulation on [the] leading edges of the tail surface and wings."

The weather reported by the weather observation facility at Muskegon County Airport (MKG), 24 miles to the west of the accident site, were:

Time: 0955

Wind: 210 degrees magnetic at 15 knots

Visibility: 10 statute miles

Sky Condition: Overcast 1,300 feet above ground level (AGL)

Temperature: -1 degrees Celsius

Dew Point: -3 degrees Celsius

Pressure: 29.98 inches of mercury

Time: 1055

Wind: 210 degrees magnetic at 15 knots  
Visibility: 8 statute miles  
Sky Condition: Overcast 1,100 feet AGL  
Temperature: -1 degrees Celsius  
Dew Point: -3 degrees Celsius  
Pressure: 29.98 inches of mercury

The weather reported by the weather observation facility at Gerald Ford International Airport (GRR), 18 miles to the southeast of the accident site, were:

Time: 0956  
Wind: 200 degrees magnetic at 8 knots  
Visibility: 2 statute miles  
Sky Condition: Overcast 500 feet AGL, freezing drizzle  
Temperature: -3 degrees Celsius  
Dew Point: -4 degrees Celsius  
Pressure: 29.98 inches of mercury

Time: 1056  
Wind: 220 degrees magnetic at 12 knots  
Visibility: 2 statute miles  
Sky Condition: Overcast 500 feet AGL, freezing drizzle  
Temperature: -3 degrees Celsius  
Dew Point: -4 degrees Celsius  
Pressure: 30.00 inches of mercury

The winds and temperatures aloft forecast for MKG was:

Altitude: 3,000 feet MSL  
Wind: 250 degrees magnetic at 25 knots  
Temperature: N/A

Altitude: 6,000 feet MSL  
Wind: 270 degrees at 27 knots  
Temperature: -5 degrees Celsius

Altitude: 9,000 feet MSL  
Wind: 280 degrees at 33 knots  
Temperature: -8 degrees Celsius

## Pilot Information

<b>Certificate:</b>	Private	<b>Age:</b>	29,Male
<b>Airplane Rating(s):</b>	Single-engine land	<b>Seat Occupied:</b>	Left
<b>Other Aircraft Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Restraint Used:</b>	
<b>Instrument Rating(s):</b>	Airplane	<b>Second Pilot Present:</b>	No
<b>Instructor Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Toxicology Performed:</b>	No
<b>Medical Certification:</b>	Class 3 Valid Medical--no waivers/lim.	<b>Last FAA Medical Exam:</b>	February 11, 2003
<b>Occupational Pilot:</b>	UNK	<b>Last Flight Review or Equivalent:</b>	November 6, 2001
<b>Flight Time:</b>	460 hours (Total, all aircraft), 297 hours (Total, this make and model), 460 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 4 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 4 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 1 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

## Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

<b>Aircraft Make:</b>	Beech	<b>Registration:</b>	N9439S
<b>Model/Series:</b>	V35	<b>Aircraft Category:</b>	Airplane
<b>Year of Manufacture:</b>		<b>Amateur Built:</b>	
<b>Airworthiness Certificate:</b>	Normal	<b>Serial Number:</b>	D-8025
<b>Landing Gear Type:</b>	Retractable - Tricycle	<b>Seats:</b>	6
<b>Date/Type of Last Inspection:</b>	April 1, 2002 Annual	<b>Certified Max Gross Wt.:</b>	3400 lbs
<b>Time Since Last Inspection:</b>	85.1 Hrs	<b>Engines:</b>	1 Reciprocating
<b>Airframe Total Time:</b>	3330 Hrs at time of accident	<b>Engine Manufacturer:</b>	Continental
<b>ELT:</b>	Installed, not activated	<b>Engine Model/Series:</b>	IO-520-BA
<b>Registered Owner:</b>	JLS Corp.	<b>Rated Power:</b>	285 Horsepower
<b>Operator:</b>		<b>Operating Certificate(s) Held:</b>	None

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

<b>Conditions at Accident Site:</b>	Instrument (IMC)	<b>Condition of Light:</b>	Day
<b>Observation Facility, Elevation:</b>	GRR,793 ft msl	<b>Distance from Accident Site:</b>	18 Nautical Miles
<b>Observation Time:</b>	09:56 Local	<b>Direction from Accident Site:</b>	160°
<b>Lowest Cloud Condition:</b>	Unknown	<b>Visibility</b>	2 miles
<b>Lowest Ceiling:</b>	Overcast / 500 ft AGL	<b>Visibility (RVR):</b>	
<b>Wind Speed/Gusts:</b>	8 knots / None	<b>Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:</b>	/
<b>Wind Direction:</b>	200°	<b>Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:</b>	/
<b>Altimeter Setting:</b>	29.97 inches Hg	<b>Temperature/Dew Point:</b>	-3°C / -4°C
<b>Precipitation and Obscuration:</b>	Light - Freezing - Drizzle		
<b>Departure Point:</b>	PONTIAC, MI (PTK )	<b>Type of Flight Plan Filed:</b>	IFR
<b>Destination:</b>	Sparta, MI (8D4 )	<b>Type of Clearance:</b>	IFR
<b>Departure Time:</b>	09:00 Local	<b>Type of Airspace:</b>	Class E

## Airport Information

<b>Airport:</b>	Sparta Airport 8D4	<b>Runway Surface Type:</b>	Asphalt
<b>Airport Elevation:</b>	761 ft msl	<b>Runway Surface Condition:</b>	Dry
<b>Runway Used:</b>	24	<b>IFR Approach:</b>	VOR/DME
<b>Runway Length/Width:</b>	2925 ft / 50 ft	<b>VFR Approach/Landing:</b>	Full stop

## Wreckage and Impact Information

<b>Crew Injuries:</b>	1 None	<b>Aircraft Damage:</b>	Substantial
<b>Passenger Injuries:</b>	1 None	<b>Aircraft Fire:</b>	None
<b>Ground Injuries:</b>	N/A	<b>Aircraft Explosion:</b>	None
<b>Total Injuries:</b>	2 None	<b>Latitude, Longitude:</b>	43.128334,-85.677223

## Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Brannen, John
Additional Participating Persons:	Rod Vigstol; FAA- Grand Rapids FSDO; Grand Rapids, MI
Report Date:	August 5, 2003
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	<a href="#">Class</a>
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	<a href="https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=56532">https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=56532</a>

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).