

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD

* * * * *

Investigation of:

*

*

NATURAL GAS DISTRIBUTION PIPELINE

*

LEAK AND MULTISTORY STRUCTURE

*

EXPLOSION IN HARLEM, NEW YORK

*

MARCH 12, 2014

*

*

* * * * *

Interview of: ROSARIO CARLUZZO

Con Edison

4 Irving Place

New York, New York

Tuesday,

August 5, 2014

The above-captioned matter convened, pursuant to notice.

BEFORE: RAVI CHHATRE

Investigator-in-Charge

APPEARANCES:

RAVI CHHATRE, Investigator-in-Charge
National Transportation Safety Board
Washington, D.C.

KALU KELLY EMEABA, Accident Investigator
National Transportation Safety Board

MATTHEW NICHOLSON, Accident Investigator
National Transportation Safety Board

FRANK McCARTON, Deputy Commissioner
Office of Emergency Management
New York, New York
(Party Representative)

ANASTASIOS GEORGELIS, Director of Field Operations
Bureau of Water and Sewer Operations
Department of Environmental Protection
New York, New York

LEONARD SINGH, Chief Engineer
Gas Distribution Services
Con Edison
(Party Representative)

CHRIS STOLICKY, Utility Supervisor (Safety)
New York State Department of Public Service
(Party Representative)

BRIAN ZAPERT, Esq.
(Representative on behalf of Mr. Carluzzo)

<u>ITEM</u>	<u>I N D E X</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
Interview of Rosario Carluzzo:		
By Mr. Chhatre		6
By Unidentified Speaker		22
By Mr. Chhatre		23
By Mr. Singh		24
By Mr. Chhatre		26
By Mr. Emeaba		28
By Mr. Stolicky		33
By Mr. McCarton		36
By Mr. Singh		38
By Mr. Nicholson		48
By Mr. Chhatre		52

I N T E R V I E W

MR. CHHATRE: Good afternoon. Today is Tuesday, August 5th, 2014. We are currently in Con Edison's facility located at 4 Irving Place, New York. We are meeting regarding the investigation of natural gas distribution pipeline leak and multi-story structure explosion that occurred on March 12, 2014, in Harlem, New York.

My name is Ravi Chhatre, I'm with the National Transportation Safety Board located in Washington, D.C., and I'm the Investigator in charge of this accident. The NTSB Investigation Number for this accident is DCA-14-MP-002.

I would like to start by notifying everyone present in this room that we are recording this interview and we may transcribe it at a later date. Transcripts will be provided directly to the interviewee for review and identifying any typographical errors. This transcript may be posted in NTSB's public docket.

Also I'd like to inform Mr. Rosario Carluzzo that you are permitted to have one other person present with you during the interview. This is a person of your choice, your supervisor, friend, family member or if you choose no one at all.

Please state for the record your full name, spelling of your name, organization you work for, your title and business contact information such as mailing address and whom you have chosen to be present with you during your interview.

1 MR. CARLUZZO: My name is Rosario Carluzzo, spelling is
2 R-O-S-A-R-I-O, last name Carluzzo, C-A-R-L-U-Z-Z-O. I work for
3 the Department of Transportation. What else? What was it?

4 MR. CHHATRE: Your title.

5 MR. CARLUZZO: I'm a Supervisor/Highway Repairer for 25
6 years.

7 MR. CHHATRE: And whom you have chosen to be with you?

8 MR. CARLUZZO: And I requested a representative from DC
9 37, their Legal.

10 MR. CHHATRE: Okay. And the name?

11 MR. ZAPERT: My name is Brian Zapert.

12 MR. CHHATRE: Okay, okay.

13 MR. ZAPERT: I'll spell that, Brian, B-R-I-A-N, Zapert,
14 Z-A-P-E-R-T. I'm an Associate with the Law Offices of Fausto
15 Zappato.

16 MR. CHHATRE: Okay. Now, I'd like to go around the room
17 and have each person introduce themselves to you. Please state
18 your name, spelling of your name, your title and the organization
19 that you represent, and your business contact information. Let's
20 start from my right.

21 MR. NICHOLSON: Matthew Nicholson, spelled M-A-T-T-H-E-
22 W, N-I-C-H-O-L-S-O-N, I'm an Investigator with the NTSB. My
23 contact information is [REDACTED]

24 MR. EMEABA: I'm Kalu Kelly Emeaba, spelled K-A-L-U, K-
25 E-L-L-Y, E-M-E-A-B-A, I'm an Investigator with NTSB. My e-mail

■ address is ■

2 MR. GEORGELIS: Anastasios Georgelis, A-N-A-S-T-A-S-I-O-
3 S, G-E-O-R-G-E-L-I-S. I'm here accompanying Frank McCarton, the
4 New York City Party Rep. I work for the New York City Department
5 of Environmental Protection. My title is Director of Field
6 Operations. My e-mail is ■

7 MR. SINGH: Leonard Singh, L-E-O-N-A-R-D, S-I-N-G-H,
8 Chief Engineer of Gas Distribution. The NTSB Party Rep on this
9 team, ■

10 MR. STOLICKY: Chris Stolicky, S-T-O-L-I-C-K-Y. I am
11 the New York State Party Rep for this investigation. I work with
12 the New York State Department of Public Service. E-mail address
13 is ■

14 MR. MCCARTON: My name is Frank McCarton, I'm a Deputy
15 Commissioner for Operations here for the City of New York Office
16 of Emergency Management and I'm also a City Rep on the -- the New
17 York City Rep on the investigation ■

18 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Just to clarify, Roy, you're with
19 the State DOT or City DOT?

20 MR. CARLUZZO: City DOT.

21 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay.

22 INTERVIEW OF ROSARIO CARLUZZO

23 BY MR. CHHATRE:

24 Q. Mr. Carluzzo, for the record, please tell us your
25 formal, informal education, any training that you have received

1 over the years and your job description at DOT.

2 MR. ZAPERT: Pardon me, I'd just like to for our
3 purposes get in the record the nature of this interview. Is this
4 being conducted -- is this compulsory for Mr. Carluzzo or is it
5 voluntary?

6 MR. CHHATRE: Everything is voluntary.

7 MR. ZAPERT: All right.

8 MR. CHHATRE: I mean, of course, if General Counsel
9 decides we can always subpoena.

10 MR. ZAPERT: All right, thanks.

11 MR. CHHATRE: We prefer not to subpoena.

12 MR. CARLUZZO: Okay.

13 MR. CHHATRE: And let me clarify since --

14 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah, okay.

15 MR. CHHATRE: -- there was a concern. This interview is
16 really related to this accident that happened on Park Avenue.

17 MR. CARLUZZO: Yes.

18 MR. CHHATRE: And we are here to gather information.
19 Our objective at NTSB is to find out what caused the accident.
20 Our charter requires us to find a root cause by Congress. We are
21 not here to find fault, we are not here to -- we're not levying
22 anybody any fine in that sense. We are merely a fact finding
23 organization.

24 MR. CARLUZZO: Okay.

25 MR. CHHATRE: What we do in the end product will be a

1 short report, identify the probable cause and make safety
2 recommendations to various organizations to prevent something like
3 this happening again in the future. So that's our goal.

4 MR. CARLUZZO: True.

5 MR. CHHATRE: That's the reason for -- you are here
6 because we believe you have information that might help us
7 identify what happened. Okay. And you have my card if you
8 remember something else after the interview, let us know. If we
9 don't ask you the right questions but you have some information
10 that might help us, tell us that.

11 MR. CARLUZZO: Yes, sir.

12 MR. CHHATRE: (Indiscernible.)

13 MR. CARLUZZO: All right. I'm sorry.

14 MR. CHHATRE: No, that's okay.

15 MR. CARLUZZO: The information you requested --

16 BY MR. CHHATRE:

17 Q. Just give us some background information like your
18 training, your formal, informal education, what you do for the
19 City of New York.

20 A. Okay. Well, as far as training on the job, it's just
21 basic training in paving, pothole repairs, repairing road defects
22 as far as like wear and tears and depressions and trip hazards.
23 What else? I'm a supervisor for two years and eight months.

24 Q. Okay.

25 A. Prior to that I was a laborer, highway repairer from

1 1988 to January 2012.

2 Q. And as supervisor you said for the last two years and
3 eight months. As a supervisor what do you do?

4 A. I oversee all roadway maintenance for the night
5 emergency crew that I'm with --

6 Q. Okay.

7 A. -- for the past 18 years.

8 Q. Okay.

9 A. And just basic -- just repairing road hazards --

10 Q. Okay.

11 A. -- with trip conditions, anything like that.

12 Q. And you said you are the supervisor of the night crew?

13 A. Yeah, it's a night emergency crew.

14 Q. Okay. So what are the typical duties -- start us out --
15 for a night crew, when you start work and when you finish work?

16 A. My shift begins at 3:00 in the afternoon --

17 Q. Okay.

18 A. -- and it ends at 12:00 midnight.

19 Q. Okay. And that's your routine schedule or do you rotate
20 during the day shift also?

21 A. No, no, that's my basic --

22 Q. That's permanent?

23 A. -- yeah.

24 Q. And how many crew -- how many people do you have in your
25 crew?

1 A. It depends -- you know, on a daily basis -- you know,
2 sometimes you have call outs and it's not -- basically under me
3 there's anywhere from four to seven laborers.

4 Q. Okay. And are they also city employees or are they on
5 contract?

6 A. Yes, yeah, city employees.

7 Q. City employees. And are all of them classified as
8 laborers or do they have some other titles between them?

9 A. Yeah, no, they're just general laborers, yeah.

10 Q. Laborers, okay. So on a typical day -- describe a
11 typical work day for me.

12 A. Well, we come in, like I said, for 3:00 in the
13 afternoon.

14 Q. Okay.

15 A. I prepare my trucks with whatever tools I need for the
16 assignments given to me by my superior.

17 Q. Okay.

18 A. We leave the yard by say 3:40 in the afternoon and we
19 proceed to our work locations, whatever is assigned to me, whether
20 it be Brooklyn, Manhattan, Queens, Staten Island, the Bronx. And
21 I complete my job assignments to the best of my ability.

22 Q. Okay. So you cover the entire city of New York?

23 A. Yes, all five boroughs.

24 Q. Okay. All five boroughs?

25 A. Uh-huh.

1 Q. And who gives the assignments?

2 A. My supervisor, Michael Panarese.

3 Q. How do you spell it?

4 A. Michael Panarese, P-A-N --

5 Q. Okay.

6 A. -- P-A-N-E-R -- I can't even spell his name.

7 Q. E-S-E? Okay, that's fine.

8 A. P-A-N-A-R-E-S-E.

9 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: A-R-E-S-E.

10 MR. CHHATRE: Okay.

11 MR. CARLUZZO: Yes.

12 BY MR. CHHATRE:

13 Q. And how do you receive the assignments, the day before
14 or on the day of the work?

15 A. Yeah, when I arrive to the yard.

16 Q. Okay.

17 A. Yeah.

18 Q. And in what form are you given the assignments, verbal,
19 written?

20 A. Sometimes it's verbal; sometimes we pull it out -- pull
21 work out of the computer, which has assigned defect numbers and
22 the dates that they're called in.

23 Q. Okay. So are they the 311 call printouts or --

24 A. I always thought they were 311 calls but there's some
25 other things my supervisor told me that 311 is something different

1 from the assignments that we get.

2 Q. Okay.

3 A. It could be from Commissioner's Offices, could be from
4 other Borough Offices that requested we do the work, like it ran
5 too late they couldn't get to it.

6 Q. Okay.

7 A. So we just pickup other borough's slack.

8 Q. Okay. And so you take the work order and then proceed
9 with the assignments? Are you told which one to do first, which
10 one to do second or --

11 A. Well, I basically try and go to the furthest one first
12 and work my way back towards -- you know, my yard.

13 Q. Okay. So you had a flexibility as to which one to do?

14 A. Yeah, yeah.

15 Q. Okay. And typically how many assignments do you do a
16 day in a typical day?

17 A. Anywhere between 12 and 16 assignments a day.

18 Q. Okay. And what do these assignments involve? There's
19 no typical -- tell me. Give me some examples of what you do.

20 A. Well, basically on a daily basis it's usually just
21 potholes.

22 Q. Okay.

23 A. Or if I'm assigned like wear and tears or depressions,
24 whatever it may be.

25 Q. Okay.

1 A. Occasional cave-ins here and there.

2 Q. Okay, cave-ins. Okay.

3 A. Yeah.

4 Q. So how do you distinguish between a cave-in and a
5 pothole, what is the definition there?

6 A. A pothole is just a hole that has developed in the
7 roadway just like maybe a couple inches deep.

8 Q. Okay.

9 A. A cave-in is something that has broken through. You can
10 see the sub base and the dirt below that.

11 Q. Okay. So you said a size, it is what -- is it depth
12 that defines it?

13 A. Well, a cave-in, the roadway has to be broken through
14 where you can see undermining.

15 Q. Okay.

16 A. A pothole is just maybe a couple inches deep -- you
17 know, you just fill it with asphalt, whatever the procedures are
18 and --

19 Q. And what is the procedure? Do you carry the procedure
20 with you in the truck or do you just kind of remember?

21 A. No, it's just through experience -- you know, you just --
22 - it's standard SOP's -- you know.

23 Q. Okay. Learned on-the-job kind of on-the-job training on
24 that?

25 A. Yes, yes, yes. Everybody receives the same training.

1 Q. Okay. And how do you repair a pothole and how do you
2 repair a depression, not a cave-in?

3 A. Well, there's all different -- a pothole we would arrive
4 onsite. If there's any debris in the hole we sweep it clean of
5 all debris. If we -- sometimes it's very scarce, we apply
6 asphaltic cement, AC-20 to the hole and then we apply asphalt.

7 If it's really deep we do it in layers and we compact it
8 until we reach the top layer and it's compacted also, and then
9 sealed with the AC-20.

10 Q. Okay. And typically what would you consider a pothole
11 dimension wise, how long, how wide?

12 A. Well, there's all different. In the department we have
13 -- it's known as A's, B's and C's.

14 Q. Okay.

15 A. A holes, B holes, C holes.

16 Q. Okay.

17 A. An A hole -- excuse me, no pun intended. An A hole is
18 anywhere from one to two feet in diameter.

19 Q. Okay.

20 A. Depth -- it's just the diameter that matters.

21 Q. Okay.

22 A. It could be anywhere from one, three, four inches deep,
23 depends.

24 Q. Okay.

25 A. A B hole is anywhere from two to three feet in diameter.

1 Q. Okay.

2 A. A C hole is three feet or more -- over three feet and
3 larger.

4 Q. Okay. Okay.

5 A. And depressions vary -- you know. I've seen depressions
6 like one foot by one foot. I've seen depressions 15x20.

7 Q. Wow.

8 A. You know, yeah, I've seen everything in the city.

9 Q. Okay.

10 A. Cave-ins vary also -- you know. They could be 2x2 in
11 diameter going down four feet -- you know. I've seen cave-ins
12 eight feet by eight feet down seven feet.

13 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Are they still classified under
14 the A,B,C holes?

15 MR. CARLUZZO: No, the A,B,C's are just basically
16 potholes.

17 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay.

18 MR. CARLUZZO: All right. And same thing with wear and
19 tears -- you know, all different various sizes and dimensions.

20 MR. CHHATRE: Okay. What is a wear and tear?

21 MR. CARLUZZO: Wear and tear is a section of the roadway
22 that's worn away, that's like rough -- you know, it's not smooth
23 like a regular roadway. Like I said, they vary in sizes.

24 Sometimes there's wear and tears and are -- we call them
25 skimmers. They're like really, really -- not that deep -- you

1 know, and it's just -- it's rough all around and everything. We
2 try and repair them to the best of our abilities.

3 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Do you see like the concrete
4 underneath when they lift from the street?

5 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah, yeah, yeah, they're wear outs, wear
6 and tears, yes.

7 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay. All right.

8 BY MR. CHHATRE:

9 Q. And how do you work at night? Do you carry with you --
10 do you have like floodlights with you or -- how do you work at
11 night?

12 A. Well, we just -- no, we just -- we depend on street
13 lighting hopefully. Sometimes we come up to a street and there's
14 no lights -- you know, we -- sometimes we trip in the holes to
15 find them -- you know. But we have -- we usually go out with two
16 trucks every day.

17 Q. Okay.

18 A. The lead truck and the backup truck. Sometimes the
19 backup truck we use their headlights to see the road underneath
20 us.

21 Q. Okay. And with your experience do you feel the lighting
22 is enough to do the repair work?

23 A. Yeah, yeah.

24 Q. Now, do you recall working on Park Avenue where the
25 accident occurred?

1 A. Yes, yes.

2 Q. Do you recall when the date was?

3 A. I believe it was March 9th.

4 Q. March 8th?

5 A. March 9th.

6 Q. 9th?

7 A. No, no, I'm sorry. Yeah, yeah, it was March 9th.

8 Q. March 9th?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Okay. Okay. And can you tell me your day on March 9th?

11 If you remember, if not we can proceed further. Okay.

12 A. What the day consisted of?

13 Q. What, yeah.

14 A. I believe -- well, we had no work assignments that day
15 so my supervisor instructed me to patrol a certain area of
16 Manhattan and just do pickups. It's, we're driving down the
17 street and just find holes at random --

18 Q. Okay.

19 A. -- and just repair them and write down the time we got
20 there, the time we left, location.

21 Q. Okay.

22 A. And whatever potholes we did there -- you know.
23 Whatever work we did, everything's written down and documented.

24 Q. Okay. So when do you believe -- on the Park Avenue, was
25 there a work order for Park Avenue?

1 A. No, no.

2 Q. You had no work order?

3 A. I picked it up at random.

4 Q. Okay. Can you describe what you did on Park Avenue and
5 what time, if you recall what time you arrived, how did you
6 proceed, how big the repair work was and that kind of -- you know,
7 the general --

8 A. Yeah. As I recall, I remember looking at the crew sheet
9 for that day. It was later on in the evening and we repaired
10 three A size holes, I believe, at the corner of 117 and Park
11 Avenue. And then down further I remember I had seen earlier that
12 day a large depression and it had it all marked from like
13 undercarriages and oil pans and everything. So I figured I'm
14 doing some good -- you know, I've saved somebody's oil pan -- you
15 know.

16 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Can you use the map here and just
17 kind of locate for us where you saw it?

18 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah.

19 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: North would be to your left.

20 MR. CARLUZZO: Yes.

21 BY MR. CHHATRE:

22 Q. The three A holes?

23 A. Yes, 117, 116, this is Park.

24 Q. This is not, this is east.

25 A. Yeah. Yeah, it was -- yeah, it was approximately, yeah.

1 Q. This is the road.

2 A. It was, yeah.

3 Q. This is train track.

4 A. Yeah.

5 Q. Is the road on this side?

6 A. It was just north of 116th Street maybe about 60 feet
7 from 116th Street corner, the northwest corner, approximately
8 right here.

9 Q. Okay.

10 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: You can use a pencil maybe and --

11 MR. PANARESE: Oh.

12 MR. CHHATRE: Just 60 feet and just draw the --

13 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah, yeah.

14 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: If you need to extend.

15 MR. CHHATRE: See, this is the street right here.

16 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah.

17 MR. CHHATRE: This is the street.

18 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah, okay. All right.

19 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: He needs some light.

20 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: He needs light on there.

21 MR. CHHATRE: Here. (Indiscernible).

22 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (Indiscernible) to your pencil
23 there.

24 MR. CARLUZZO: All right. So this is the roadway here.

25 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay.

1 MR. CARLUZZO: Right.

2 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

3 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Road or a sidewalk?

4 MR. CALUZZO: Huh?

5 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Is that the sidewalk or the

6 roadway?

7 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah, you're actually on the

8 sidewalk.

9 MR. CALUZZO: Oh.

10 MR. CHHATRE: Yeah, this is the road back here.

11 MR. CALUZZO: Okay, all right. Sorry about that.

12 MR. CHHATRE: Yeah. Again --

13 MR. CALLUZZO: It's a little --

14 MR. CHHATRE: That's okay.

15 MR. EMEABA: Do you want to use mine?

16 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: There we go.

17 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Little bit.

18 MR. CHHATRE: I think it's moving here. Try a different

19 pencil.

20 MR. EMEABA: Take one, use mine.

21 MR. CHHATRE: Here, try this one.

22 MR. CARLUZZO: Okay.

23 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: NTSB better pencils.

24 MR. CHHATRE: (Indiscernible).

25 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Little bit.

1 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Federal pencils.

2 MR. EMEABA: Yes.

3 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay.

4 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: And what was that, I'm sorry, a
5 pothole?

6 MR. CHHATRE: No, depression.

7 MR. CARLUZZO: A roadway depression.

8 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Depression, okay.

9 MR. CARLUZZO: Yes.

10 BY MR. CHHATRE:

11 Q. Do you recall how big was it?

12 A. I believe from -- on the paperwork it was 28 square
13 yards.

14 Q. Can you estimate?

15 A. It was approximately -- it was like -- I think it would
16 be like something like 17x14.

17 Q. 17x14.

18 A. Somewhere in those dimensions approximately.

19 Q. Do you remember how deep was it?

20 A. It was anywhere from an inch to two inches.

21 Q. And so you used your procedure just grooming, making
22 this area clean and that kind of stuff?

23 A. I believe the roadway was fairly cleaned.

24 Q. Okay.

25 A. So we just proceeded to apply the asphalt to the roadway

1 and compact it.

2 Q. Okay. And did you see any holes in the roadway -- on
3 the road and asphalt, do you see any water?

4 A. No, no.

5 Q. No water on the road. And how do you compact? How do
6 you compact when you put the asphalt on?

7 A. I believe I had a hand roller.

8 Q. Okay. And how heavy the hand roller is?

9 A. It's -- well, the roller itself it's filled with cement
10 and the roller is steel and it's filled with cement and the handle
11 is also steel and it's approximately maybe four feet from the
12 handle to the roller.

13 Q. Okay.

14 A. Probably a four foot handle.

15 Q. And this person just walks over?

16 A. Yeah, yeah.

17 Q. Okay.

18 A. And we roll the edges first and then we cross roll it
19 back and forth -- you know, until we complete the job.

20 MR. CHHATRE: Okay.

21 BY UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:

22 Q. Now, do you use hot asphalt or cold patch?

23 A. Yes, yes, hot asphalt.

24 Q. Does the plant ever shut down in the winter in New York
25 City?

1 A. Excuse me?

2 Q. Do the asphalt plants ever shut down in the winter in
3 New York City?

4 A. Yeah, yeah, from time to time for repairs and stuff,
5 sure.

6 Q. But not because of cold weather?

7 A. Sometimes, yeah, because sometimes cold weather is a
8 factor.

9 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay.

10 BY MR. CHHATRE:

11 Q. The hot asphalt you pour it and you roll it, is that how
12 the process works?

13 A. Yes, yes. We shovel it out of the trailer that we carry
14 around and it's shoveled, it's raked, it's swept up, cleaned all
15 around the edges and compacted with a roller.

16 Q. And then that's done?

17 A. Uh-huh.

18 Q. You don't excavate anything?

19 A. No, no, no, no.

20 Q. Okay. Okay. And do you recall how long the job took?
21 If you don't recall you don't recall.

22 A. I think I was there about 45 minutes.

23 Q. Okay. Did you smell any gas when you were there?

24 A. No, not at all.

25 Q. With you pouring asphalt, can you still smell the gas?

1 A. Excuse me?

2 Q. Can you smell the gas with asphalt being poured?

3 A. Yeah, yeah, sure, absolutely.

4 Q. Would that odor mask it?

5 A. Yeah.

6 Q. Okay. Okay.

7 A. Actually if I would have smelled gas that would have
8 been a notification to Con Edison.

9 Q. Okay.

10 A. Or if I felt the need for the fire department --

11 Q. You would have had them there?

12 A. -- I would have definitely made a notification to have
13 them come check it out.

14 MR. CHHATRE: Okay.

15 MR. SINGH: Ravi, can I ask a question this time?

16 MR. CHHATRE: Sure.

17 BY MR. SINGH:

18 Q. What does natural gas smell like?

19 A. It has a distinctive odor. It's kind of like a stale
20 smell more or less, a very distinctive smell. You can't smell it
21 and say what is that? You'll know its gas right away.

22 Q. Okay.

23 A. I've smelt gas before. Actually about a month ago I
24 arrived on a location, I was doing pickups also. I believe it was
25 3rd Avenue and 112th Street. We arrived on location and we picked

1 up three holes, I believe it was. As soon as we got out of the
2 truck every single one of us smelt gas. We all smelt gas.

3 I called my Communications Operators, I told them that I
4 was on that location and I was filled a few potholes, and I had
5 the -- we all smelt the odor of gas. And they called Con Edison.

6 Q. Okay.

7 A. And we run around the block a couple of times. We can
8 back there and a Con Ed van was there.

9 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Thank you.

10 MR. CHHATRE: (Indiscernible) has a question then, can
11 you check and make sure there was a call made?

12 MR. SINGH: What was that location?

13 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 3rd Avenue and --

14 MR. CARLUZZO: And I approached them in the van and I
15 said, "Are you here for the gas smell?" They says, "Yeah." They
16 said, "It's been like that for a year. It's a Class 3 leak.
17 There's no need for repair."

18 MR. CHHATRE: Okay. Can you give the address again one
19 more time?

20 MR. CARLUZZO: Excuse me?

21 MR. CHHATRE: Can you repeat the address. Where were
22 you?

23 MR. CARLUZZO: We were exactly at the southwest corner
24 of 3rd Avenue and 112th Street.

25 MR. SINGH: And when was this?

1 MR. CARLUZZO: About a month ago.

2 MR. CHHATRE: Month ago today or month ago?

3 MR. CARLUZZO: About a month ago, yeah, about a month
4 ago today.

5 MR. CHHATRE: Okay.

6 MR. SINGH: So you said you called it in or someone from
7 your office called it in?

8 MR. CARLUZZO: No, I called it in.

9 MR. SINGH: Okay.

10 BY MR. CHHATRE:

11 Q. You called Con Edison? I thought you said you called --

12 A. I called our Communications Operators --

13 Q. Okay.

14 A. -- and they called Con Edison.

15 Q. You got it.

16 A. Yeah.

17 MR. SINGH: Yeah.

18 MR. CHHATRE: Okay.

19 MR. CARLUZZO: But like I said, gas is very distinctive.

20 MR. CHHATRE: Okay.

21 MR. CARLUZZO: Any one of us could notice the smell of
22 gas.

23 MR. CHHATRE: And so you know that you had to call Con
24 Edison?

25 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah, absolutely, sure. It's part of my

1 job.

2 MR. CHHATRE: Okay.

3 MR. SINGH: All right, the date that we're talking about
4 this work was done, what's the date again on it? I'm sorry I
5 missed that.

6 MR. CHHATRE: What's that, say that again?

7 MR. SINGH: The date that you're doing this work?

8 MR. CHHATRE: The Park Avenue work?

9 MR. SINGH: Yes.

10 MR. CHHATRE: The date I was given was March 9th.

11 MR. CARLUZZO: March 9th.

12 MR. SINGH: Thank you.

13 BY MR. CHHATRE:

14 Q. And you said roughly around 7:00 or was it 8:00, what
15 time?

16 A. No, let's see --

17 Q. Only if you remember or you can say it's ballpark.
18 That's fine.

19 A. I got my second load after 8:30 so I was -- I got the
20 load at Harper Street in Queens at 8:30 and I was back in the city
21 by maybe 20 after 9:00. And the first location I went to after I
22 got my second load was at Park Avenue.

23 Q. So around 9:30, 10:00?

24 A. Yeah, but, yeah, about 9:30, yeah.

25 Q. Okay. About, okay. And on that day did you have how

1 many people in your crew?

2 A. Well, it was myself and I believe five laborers, five
3 HR's.

4 Q. In two cars or one car?

5 A. Two trucks we have.

6 Q. Two trucks?

7 A. Yeah.

8 Q. So you prepared --

9 A. And a heated trailer.

10 Q. So two trucks and a heated trailer for asphalt?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And so did you use the headlights of your other truck to
13 see what you're doing or --

14 A. Well, I believe there were street lights there that --

15 Q. Okay.

16 A. -- that were functioning so we had pretty good lighting.

17 MR. CHHATRE: Okay. That's all I have. Thank you so
18 much. I appreciate it.

19 MR. CARLUZZO: Okay.

20 MR. CHHATRE: Kelly.

21 BY MR. EMEABA:

22 Q. The only thing I want to ask apart from this spot that
23 you made the patch, were there other things you observed in that
24 general area, previous patches?

25 A. I don't understand the question.

1 Q. Apart from the patch you made --

2 A. Okay.

3 Q. -- which is 17x14 feet, is that correct?

4 A. Yeah, the depression, yes. Okay.

5 Q. 17x14 feet. Were there other patches within that same
6 area consistently?

7 A. It looks like somebody attempted prior to my being there
8 -- it looks like there was a patch made already.

9 Q. Okay.

10 A. But I don't know who would have done that.

11 Q. Okay. From experience, how old do you think the patch
12 could have been?

13 A. It didn't look that new. It looks like it's been down
14 for a while -- you know, like maybe over a year or so.

15 Q. So more or less from what you observed your patch that
16 was made not (indiscernible) the previous one that was already
17 made?

18 A. Yes, yes, because the patch that was there prior to me -
19 - it was still low.

20 Q. Okay, it was still low.

21 A. It was still low and the surrounding area was higher.

22 Q. Okay, okay. Yeah. Was any of that adjacent patch other
23 than the one you repaved over?

24 A. No, I just noticed a patch that I overlaid on top of --
25 just one patch that I noticed.

1 Q. One patch. Do you have an idea, a little bit, of the
2 size of it? (Indiscernible)?

3 A. I think it was smaller than what I put down.

4 Q. Okay.

5 A. Maybe could have been like a 12x12, 12 foot by 12 foot.

6 Q. Okay. So more or less the 12x12 dropped in and you also
7 had (indiscernible)?

8 A. Yeah, it was still low. It was still low. You could
9 still see marks from like undercarriages and oil pans and stuff on
10 the -- just after the depression where cars came down and they
11 came back up and the undercarriage scraped the ground.

12 Q. Okay. So how -- after the patch has been made and you
13 rode over the roller, is there a means of testing the strength of
14 that patch that had been made in terms of being able to carry the
15 traffic and all that that goes through?

16 A. Testing the strength of --

17 Q. The patch?

18 A. -- of the patch that I laid down? Not really. No, not
19 that I would know how to strength of it.

20 Q. Yeah, I know that roadway construction -- you know, when
21 they make gas company (indiscernible) when they do backfill and
22 you have the tamper or the roll over, then they have to actually
23 stick in, is it (indiscernible)?

24 A. We don't carry any devices like that.

25 Q. You don't do that?

1 A. No.

2 Q. Okay. Prior to your patch over the existing one, do you
3 by any means have to push an instrument into the ground to see how
4 porous is it or how strong it is?

5 A. No, no. You mean -- I know what you mean -- you mean
6 like a core pouring test?

7 Q. Uh-huh.

8 A. Yeah, no, we don't do that.

9 Q. You don't do that?

10 A. No.

11 Q. Is that part of the process or it's not part of the
12 process?

13 A. No, no, no part of the process.

14 Q. Okay. Okay. You mentioned something which is good.
15 This is one of your pickups that (indiscernible)?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Normally how do your people receive your work requests,
18 your normal work requests other than the pickups?

19 A. Usually we pull work out of the computer. It's called
20 FITS, F-I-T-S. It's an abbreviation for Field Inspection Tracking
21 System. And we get the work from the computer. It has a defects
22 number assigned to them and the dates that the defects were called
23 in and that's it. It doesn't state -- it should state if it's a
24 pothole or a depression or a cave-in or whatnot.

25 Q. Okay. How does agency receive such information about

1 which you know pull from your database? How does it originally
2 come into your system?

3 A. See, like I mentioned before, I always thought it was
4 from 311 calls but I was told it's a little more. It's, 311 is
5 something different. My supervisor said it was TSB or something.
6 I don't even know what that is. It's, I'm not sure actually. I'm
7 not sure. I always thought it was 311 but it's not.

8 Q. Okay. And when you do your patrol -- you know, driving
9 around to look which you see these pickups -- are all pickups are
10 repaired immediately or could they be scheduled for future repair?

11 A. Well, sometimes I pick up like a cave-in or something
12 and if I'm not prepared to repair cave-ins I'll just barricade it,
13 put some cones around it, make them visible to motorists and
14 pedestrians, and then maybe we'll get to it like maybe the
15 following day or whenever I'm assigned to do cave-ins.

16 But if it's a pothole already if I'm prepared to repair
17 potholes, yeah, I'll do it right then and there.

18 Q. Okay, okay. I mean, it interests -- you know, just to
19 see how most of your works are generated in the system -- you
20 know. So you don't have any other idea how it actually comes in?

21 A. No.

22 Q. They just assign them to you?

23 A. Yeah, yeah.

24 MR. EMEABA: Okay. Thank you. That's it for me.

25 MR. CHHATRE: Go ahead.

1 BY MR. STOLICKY:

2 Q. Chris Stolicky, New York State. If I hit a big pothole
3 with my car, who would I call to get it fixed -- the pothole not
4 the car?

5 A. Through I would assume 311. You can call 311 then they
6 --

7 Q. So it's possible that someone could call 311 and it will
8 make it through that system into your -- the FITS System?

9 A. I believe it will. I believe, sure, definitely, because
10 I've called in. Like I hit a really big pothole one day and I
11 called 311 and they -- on the phone the operator gave me a repair
12 request number.

13 I don't know, it didn't sound like any of like the
14 defect number, like -- the defects, if it's in Manhattan, the
15 defect number would start DM -- means defect Manhattan. Then 2014
16 meaning the year, and then it would have six digits after that.
17 It's all sequential -- you know, where as they called in they have
18 -- they just keep the numbers and they just --

19 Q. (Indiscernible)?

20 A. Yeah, yeah. Started from like 1,2,3,4 -- you know, like
21 that.

22 Q. And so if you repaired one of those, do you close the
23 loop going back or would your supervisor just say -- well, you do
24 report to your supervisor that the work's done --

25 A. Yeah.

1 Q. -- because you had created the record, in and out and
2 location? So would your supervisor or whoever else close that
3 loop or --

4 A. Yeah. Well, all my paperwork I put down. We have
5 abbreviations like if I repaired a defect on my paperwork we put
6 down XCO, that's defect closed. And then at the end of the
7 (indiscernible) I hand in my paperwork and my supervisor goes back
8 into the computer and he closes out the defect.

9 Q. Okay. When you come across a -- we'll call it a cave-in
10 situation -- can you walk us through how that repair is made? I
11 mean, do you finish breaking up what's there or do you fill
12 (indiscernible)?

13 A. Well, usually we'll bring a compressor out with us with
14 jackhammers. We would square it off all around and if it's really
15 big we'll have a compressor and a backhoe with us. But prior to
16 our digging we would usually make a call to the utility companies
17 to see if there's anything crossing our path that we should know
18 about.

19 Q. So would you go ahead and do the work that night or
20 would you make the call and then wait a couple days, barricade it
21 off?

22 A. We would try to make the call the day before, let them -
23 - let the utility companies know that we're going to be digging
24 there, preparing a cave-in. If you can come there with your
25 schematics and just let us know if there's any pipes crossing the

1 hole -- you know, that we should know about.

2 And then we would come there on the assigned date, cut
3 out square all around the defect or the cave-in, and then the
4 backhoe would remove all the broken debris and concrete and
5 whatnot that's in the hole and we would backfill it with
6 screening.

7 Q. And what is that?

8 A. It's a type of dry cement. It's like grain cement.

9 Q. Like a flowable fill or a dry?

10 A. It's dry.

11 Q. Okay.

12 A. But if you add water to it it will just turn to
13 concrete.

14 Q. Okay.

15 A. But we usually fill with the screening. We'll compact
16 it either with a compactor plate or sometimes even we'll roll it
17 with the truck, get maximum compaction. And then after that's all
18 done then we would top it with hot asphalt, seal it, and the job
19 is done.

20 Q. Okay. Have you run across cave-in situations where
21 you've seen underground utilities in the hole (indiscernible)?

22 A. Yeah, yeah.

23 Q. Wires or (indiscernible)?

24 A. Pipes, cable, yeah, yeah, sure.

25 Q. Have you ever noticed anything leaking, whether it be a

1 gas or water or -- I guess when it's really shallow

2 (indiscernible)?

3 A. Sometimes, yeah, yeah. We've seen them and sometimes we
4 see water bubbling out of the hole. We call DEP right away.

5 Q. Okay. And then you guys just back off and let DEP come
6 in in that situation?

7 A. Yeah. Well, if -- yeah, if we see running water in the
8 holes, say, yeah, this is yours -- you know.

9 MR. STOLICKY: Okay. All right. I'm all set.

10 MR. CHHATRE: Thanks. Frank.

11 BY MR. McCARTON:

12 Q. Hi Roy.

13 A. Yeah.

14 Q. So in terms of this depression that you came across on
15 the 9th of March, was anything different from that one than you
16 ever filled -- I mean, you must have had thousands of holes
17 throughout your career. Thank you, by the way, I caught that
18 (indiscernible). But I mean how many -- was this any different
19 than any other depression that you seen?

20 A. Nothing out of the ordinary just seemed like a normal
21 roadway depression.

22 Q. Did anyone come out of their homes or come out to you
23 and tell you it's been there for months or this hasn't been fixed,
24 or anybody complain to you as far as people wise, come out when
25 you were there at 9:00?

1 A. No, there were just a couple of females. They came up
2 to us and asked us how they could get this job.

3 Q. Oh.

4 A. But that's about it.

5 Q. Yeah.

6 A. Yeah. That's it.

7 Q. And does anybody do like quality assurance like after
8 you're done with it, when you go back to the garage, you hand in
9 your paperwork, does anybody come around, or do they figure that
10 you're the (indiscernible) of like -- the supervisor, you're the
11 boss on the truck and it is what it is, or does somebody go back
12 and check your work?

13 A. No, usually it's just closed and that's it, yeah.
14 There's no follow-ups or anything.

15 Q. Okay.

16 A. Maybe sometime if I'm in the area later on I'll say,
17 let's see how that job held up -- you know.

18 Q. So go by again to check up on it?

19 A. Yeah, we'll check it out.

20 Q. When do you -- you know, like something like you just
21 said there, if you go by it again and you see it dipping again,
22 would you think to yourself there's a problem here?

23 A. I would say, yeah, there's possibly maybe a water leak
24 or something, call DEP and let them run a die test, maybe check it
25 out -- you know.

1 Q. But not in this case, this is the first time you went to
2 this one and you didn't see anything else?

3 A. Yeah, no, no.

4 MR. MCCARTON: All right. Thank you.

5 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (Indiscernible).

6 MR. CHHATRE: (Indiscernible).

7 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Go ahead.

8 MR. CHHATRE: Len.

9 BY MR. SINGH:

10 Q. Yeah. Leonard Singh, Con Ed, a couple questions. I
11 know Frank asked you about this location and you (indiscernible)
12 lots of hole in your career. Is a 28 square yarder typical in a
13 day's job?

14 A. Yeah, I've done bigger.

15 Q. Well, I'm saying in a typical day, you do 20, 30 holes.
16 I mean, most of them are probably onesie, twosies, right?

17 A. Uh-huh.

18 Q. This particular -- do you have -- this particular
19 location, do you ever remember being there prior to the 9th?

20 A. No. In the area, yes, but not on that specific
21 location.

22 Q. That particular location?

23 A. I can't remember, no. I don't think so.

24 Q. September 2013, September 2013?

25 A. September 20 --

1 Q. '13?

2 A. Not that I know of. I don't -- I'm not sure.

3 Q. 9/6/2013 was the -- I see your name on a route sheet
4 that said you were there. Your crew were there. I mean, you're
5 listed as part of the crew for that same location. And that one
6 seems to --

7 A. Really then that's -- (indiscernible).

8 Q. Yeah. And that same one goes back to as far back as --
9 not necessarily with you -- 2004. Is there anything in your
10 procedural process as the multiple calls to a same location would
11 take any further action, and it seems like progressively over from
12 2004 to 2014, the hole got progressively bigger, because of the
13 amount of asphalt you put down every time.

14 So, I mean, from my prospective a 28 yarder doesn't seem
15 to be typical and would probably require some further action in
16 your procedural guidelines. Is that something that would require
17 attention?

18 A. I would think so but really there's another date there I
19 was there?

20 Q. Well, your name is on the route sheet.

21 A. Oh.

22 Q. Yeah, or the close out from [REDACTED].

23 A. Yeah.

24 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Why don't you show it to him so
25 maybe he could educate us?

1 MR. EMEABA: Yeah.

2 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I'm not sure (indiscernible).

3 MR. CARLUZZO: Honestly I don't even recall this.

4 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: What's the date on it?

5 MR. SINGH: 9/6/2013.

6 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Can you share that with
7 (indiscernible)?

8 MR. SINGH: It came from your folks.

9 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: It came from our folks?

10 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah, we have that. I know what
11 he's talking about.

12 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

13 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: But does it say what kind of work
14 was done on those dates?

15 MR. SINGH: I think it said wear and tear.

16 MR. CARLUZZO: It says wear and tear.

17 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay, so --

18 MR. SINGH: It's very generic.

19 MR. CARLUZZO: Closed work order.

20 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: So you really don't know if it's
21 in the same place as the depression?

22 MR. SINGH: It refers to the same address, I believe,
23 1646?

24 MR. CARLUZZO: I picked a bad day to forget my glasses.

25 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Here. Try these.

1 MR. CARLUZZO: Wow. Right on cue.

2 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (Indiscernible).

3 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah, these are good.

4 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 99 cents.

5 MR. CARLUZZO: CVS? Yes, yeah. Wow, I don't see. I
6 mean, it says -- my name is there but I just --

7 BY MR. SINGH:

8 Q. I think my point is, I guess, in your procedure with the
9 New York City DOT --

10 A. Yeah.

11 Q. -- if there's multiple cause, multiple responses to a
12 single location, which seems to be getting progressively worse, is
13 there any action for further follow-up would be necessary -- you
14 know, is there something going on under the street that requires
15 an excavation, rebuilding of the roadway --

16 MR. CHHATRE: My question though, how do you know it's
17 progressively getting worse?

18 MR. SINGH: It seems like the amount of asphalt that's
19 being put down increasingly has gotten worse. That last time was
20 28 square yards.

21 MR. CARLUZZO: I don't know.

22 MR. SINGH: It was 9.7 before.

23 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: So he's got a report here from
24 2004 and then another from 2013.

25 MR. SINGH: There's one here from -- there's one from

1 `04, says depression restored. There's one from June of 2013 that
2 says an XEL of 9.7 square yards.

3 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: So 11 years later you revisited
4 it. And so the question is in 11 years --

5 MR. SINGH: Well, I (indiscernible).

6 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: -- would they have a procedure
7 that would --

8 MR. SINGH: No, no. I'm saying if this is June of 2013
9 to March of 2014.

10 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay, so between 2013 --

11 MR. SINGH: Right, correct.

12 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: -- then it --

13 MR. SINGH: Went from 9 to 20 square yards.

14 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (Indiscernible).

15 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah.

16 MR. SINGH: I'm just trying to frame it from -- you
17 know, many, many years, but --

18 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Sure.

19 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah. I understand. I don't recall this
20 but I mean if it's in black and white it has to be.

21 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

22 MR. CHHATRE: Well, if you don't recall you don't
23 recall.

24 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (Indiscernible) generic wear and
25 tear take less material than say a pothole?

1 MR. CARLUZZO: Should we?

2 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: If it's classified as a wear and
3 tear, could that be a pothole or could that be what we talked
4 about before where it's going to scrap off (indiscernible)?

5 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah, well, a pothole is usually -- it
6 would have depth (indiscernible) -- you know. Wear and tear --
7 you'll just feel like a little roughness -- you know, but it
8 wouldn't be like an impact.

9 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Sure.

10 MR. SINGH: I guess my point in that is two things, that
11 one is over time we see multiple close of a location and it seems
12 to be getting --

13 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Gotcha understood the question.

14 MR. SINGH: -- (indiscernible) what is the guidelines.

15 MR. CARLUZZO: And this -- the '04 date is that --

16 MR. SINGH: Way back, yeah.

17 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah.

18 MR. SINGH: It's way back. That's June of '04.

19 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah, okay.

20 MR. SINGH: But there's also one in June of 2013.

21 MR. CARLUZZO: Do they have the address, the same
22 identity thing?

23 MR. SINGH: Yeah.

24 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Does it say how it came in?

25 MR. SINGH: My next question. Getting to my next

1 question.

2 MR. CARLUZZO: Go ahead.

3 BY MR. SINGH:

4 Q. So on the day in question you said you were doing
5 randoms?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. You said -- then you mentioned a computer system called
8 FITS?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. So do you -- when you find something do you cross-
11 reference to see if it was called in and close it out?

12 A. No, I would just -- no, I'd just pull the work out of
13 there and just go repair it. I don't --

14 Q. But does someone go back in and cross reference it
15 (indiscernible)?

16 A. Yeah, my supervisor would close out the job in the
17 computer.

18 Q. Okay. Because one of the things we found was there was
19 a --

20 A. I pull the work out but my boss closes it out.

21 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Ticket already in the system for
22 that.

23 MR. SINGH: It was already in the system.

24 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

25 MR. SINGH: So what would prompt you to do randoms

1 versus something that's been in your backlog?

2 MR. CARLUZZO: Thank you, Frank.

3 MR. MCCARTON: You're welcome.

4 MR. CARLUZZO: Sorry, sorry.

5 MR. MCCARTON: That's all right.

6 BY MR. SINGH:

7 Q. What would prompt random locations versus something
8 that's in the backlog? What determines whether you do randoms
9 versus -- we have -- you know, 50 potholes?

10 A. Well, it depends. Sometimes there's no work in the
11 system.

12 Q. Okay.

13 A. There's no work on the computer so we'll just go out and
14 just do pickups.

15 Q. Okay. But there was work on the system, right? There
16 was a call at that location on 3/3/2013, which was a few days
17 before the night.

18 A. 3/3/2014.

19 Q. Again, I don't know if it's your system or it's the
20 city's system.

21 A. I, yeah, I don't know.

22 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: The 311?

23 MR. SINGH: I don't know which system this comes from.
24 It might be 311.

25 MR. EMEABA: (Indiscernible) might be able to help.

1 MR. SINGH: Yeah. No, he wouldn't know it. I think
2 Frank might know.

3 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (Indiscernible).

4 MR. CHHATRE: (Indiscernible) I get to look at the
5 assigned to him, right?

6 MR. SINGH: Right. That's what I'm saying, right. What
7 I'm saying -- you know, my question was more around the randomness
8 of doing versus -- you know, a backlog of work and addressing
9 that, right?

10 MR. CARLUZZO: Uh-huh.

11 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Can't tell if this is actually 3
12 -- well, the source came from the 311 system.

13 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 311, uh-huh. And it was sent to
14 -- and it says "rough pit in cracked roads."

15 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Right.

16 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: And this is 3/19.

17 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Not 3/3, 3/19 was closed.

18 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: When it was closed.

19 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

20 MR. SINGH: So my question's again more around the
21 procedural process, right?

22 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Well, again it's described as
23 what, a rough road?

24 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: It's a rough pit in a cracked
25 road. It doesn't say --

1 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Is that the same as what he
2 found?

3 MR. SINGH: It's the same location, right.

4 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Well, it's Park Avenue, East
5 116th Street, right. It doesn't give an actual street address.

6 MR. SINGH: Right.

7 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah, it could be on 116th, it could be
8 in the intersection, yeah.

9 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: It could be on (indiscernible).
10 Right. It might not be in front of 1642 or (indiscernible).

11 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah, because there's no specific.

12 MR. SINGH: I thought he referenced (indiscernible)
13 somewhere.

14 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: It doesn't. It does not
15 reference that, 116 Park Avenue.

16 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

17 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: So that could be the middle of
18 that road. It's a pretty big intersection.

19 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

20 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Right? And there was a lot of
21 work that was being done in those intersections. You guys were
22 just doing gas work over there too, right?

23 MR. SINGH: In 2014?

24 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah, you did. Didn't you
25 replace the mains over there?

1 MR. SINGH: No, that was 2011.

2 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: That was 2011?

3 MR. CHHATRE: Okay. Len, it's still your time.

4 MR. SINGH: That's it, I think.

5 MR. CHHATRE: Okay. Matt.

6 BY MR. NICHOLSON:

7 Q. I've got a follow-up (indiscernible) just a few and
8 keeping in line with sort of what Lenny was getting at. I was
9 curious, if these were pickups what made you go to Park Avenue,
10 was that a -- why was that on that route?

11 A. Well, we had done two loads that day. We finished one
12 load, we emptied out the trailer and we were making our way back
13 to go back to Queens and get our second load and I saw it.

14 Q. So it's just on the way --

15 A. It was on the way back to Queens to get my second load.

16 Q. Okay. I see.

17 A. I just passed by there and I saw it. I said, "Wow, look
18 at this -- you know."

19 Q. Okay, good. Is Park Avenue a two lane or is it a one?
20 Is it a one lane or --

21 A. It's, yeah, one lane in each direction north and south.

22 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: North/south, three lanes.

23 MR. NICHOLSON: So, just to be clear, which lane -- was
24 it the north or the south?

25 MR. CARLUZZO: There was a parking lane too, yeah, yeah.

1 MR. NICHOLSON: Which lane was the defect in, was it in
2 the northbound or --

3 MR. EMEABA: Going south.

4 MR. CARLUZZO: Southbound.

5 MR. NICHOLSON: Well, let's let him tell us, Kelly.

6 MR. EMEABA: I'm sorry.

7 MR. CARLUZZO: Southbound.

8 MR. NICHOLSON: It was in the southbound lane?

9 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah, in the driving lane, yeah.

10 MR. NICHOLSON: Okay.

11 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Which one of those lanes? Which
12 one, which lane? You have a parking lane, curb lane and you have
13 two going south, right?

14 MR. CARLUZZO: Well, it's actually in between both
15 lanes.

16 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: In between both lanes?

17 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah.

18 MR. NICHOLSON: So there's two southbound lanes, is that
19 what you're saying?

20 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah.

21 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: There's an L, right, there's an L
22 train that goes --

23 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Right, right, right.

24 MR. CARLUZZO: Uh-huh.

25 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: And then there's a parking lane

1 and then there's two southbound, two northbound on either side.

2 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay.

3 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Uh-huh.

4 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: So my question to you is --

5 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah, this dead center of both lanes.

6 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Right, dead center both lanes?

7 MR. CARLUZZO: Uh-huh.

8 MR. NICHOLSON: Both lanes. Okay, terrific. I'm
9 actually looking at your --

10 MR. CARLUZZO: The parking lane was affected.

11 MR. NICHOLSON: I'm looking at the driver's trip sheet
12 for that evening and I'm just curious, on the times on the driver
13 trip sheet, do you record those times as the work's being
14 performed?

15 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah, the time we arrived, the time we
16 left.

17 MR. NICHOLSON: Okay. So it's not something you do
18 after your shift, you're doing it as you --

19 MR. CARLUZZO: No, no, no, as we're there, yeah, I
20 document the times, arrival, departure, yes.

21 MR. NICHOLSON: Okay. And on this same sheet would you
22 have noted the size of that depression on your worksheets here?

23 MR. CARLUZZO: On my day sheet.

24 MR. CHHATRE: Show it to him.

25 MR. NICHOLSON: Yeah.

1 MR. CHHATRE: Take a look.

2 BY MR. NICHOLSON:

3 Q. Yeah, just tell me, is this -- because I see here 59
4 holes, one cut and it looks like depression right here.

5 A. Yeah, that's my totals. On the back of that I would
6 have the dimensions and square yards.

7 Q. On the back of that sheet?

8 A. On the back here.

9 Q. So the 33 -- well, it looks like 33 square yards next to
10 that. That's -- you might need your glasses -- Frank's glasses
11 again.

12 A. You know, it says one cut and one depression. I
13 probably did a cut sometime earlier that day.

14 Q. Different location?

15 A. Yeah. And I just add the square yards together.

16 Q. Okay. That's a total.

17 A. Total square yard, yes.

18 Q. So that's not the one depression?

19 A. No, no.

20 Q. Okay.

21 A. I believe that one depression was 28 square yards total.

22 Q. Okay.

23 A. So that was -- mostly of the square yards was that
24 depression.

25 Q. But if we really wanted to know, we would need the back

1 of that --

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. It doesn't look like --

4 A. On the back it's itemized -- you know, locations and --

5 Q. Okay.

6 A. -- work performed.

7 MR. CARLUZZO: Thanks again, Frank.

8 MR. MCCARTON: (Indiscernible).

9 MR. NICHOLSON: Okay. All right. That's all I've got.

10 Thanks. I'm done.

11 BY MR. CHHATRE:

12 Q. I just have previous, several, I guess, team that
13 everybody's asking you, if you had to go to the same location, do
14 you -- the depression is really significant or do you see water,
15 do you report to somebody that, hey, I've been here the last three
16 months twice?

17 A. Yeah. I would make a notification for HIQA.

18 Q. And whom would you tell that?

19 A. I would call our operators of Central Communications.

20 Q. Okay. Telling them about it?

21 A. And I'd say, "Listen -- you know, I've been here quite a
22 few times. Notify DEP, HIQA -- you know, have somebody check this
23 out. How many times do you got to do the same job -- you know?"

24 Q. Okay.

25 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Just for the record, just who

1 HIQA is so everybody knows.

2 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah, thank you.

3 MR. CHHATRE: Yeah.

4 MR. CARLUZZO: Its Highway Inspection and Quality
5 Assurance.

6 MR. CHHATRE: Okay.

7 MR. CARLUZZO: They're inspectors. They OR check, they
8 go out to contractor sites to check their permits and everything -
9 - you know, and make sure the jobs are done right -- you know.

10 MR. CHHATRE: Yeah. You would have told them.

11 BY MR. CHHATRE:

12 Q. And following maybe Matt's or Kelly's question, the 17
13 feet by 14 feet that you did, was it on the old previous patch or
14 it was next to it or do you remember anything?

15 A. I believe I covered a previous patch that was there, I
16 believe, yes.

17 Q. Partially or entirely or --

18 A. I think I covered most of it, yeah, like over three-
19 quarters of it.

20 Q. Okay, over. Okay. And with your assignments you don't
21 worry as to what caused the depression or what caused the sinkhole
22 when you repair it?

23 A. No, I try and leave that up to HIQA and DEP.

24 Q. Okay. So you just --

25 A. Yeah.

1 Q. -- do your job and --

2 A. I just repair the road and that's it. If I need to make
3 -- notify somebody I'll do it because, like I said, it's part of
4 my job.

5 MR. CHHATRE: All right. Thanks. Anybody have any?

6 MR. EMEABA: Yes.

7 MR. CHHATRE: Okay.

8 MR. EMEABA: One just. Before you applied the asphalt
9 what -- on this particular one over the existing patch -- what
10 preparations did you make or made before you apply your asphalt?

11 MR. CARLUZZO: You mean like steps, what --

12 MR. EMEABA: Yeah. Did you have to cut into the
13 existing one a little bit then pour your own to make it --

14 MR. CARLUZZO: No, just overlay the new asphalt right
15 over top.

16 MR. EMEABA: And then level it with the roadway?

17 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah, with the road. We'll rack it out -
18 - you know, sweep it, all the crumbs on the side and roll it.

19 MR. EMEABA: Thank you very much.

20 MR. CHHATRE: Tasos.

21 MR. GEORGELIS: Roy, so typically -- I'm with the DEP.
22 So the typical job you would call the DEP if you had a problem.
23 You'd come and lay a patch down and then you'd see it sticking
24 again within a week or two, a month?

25 MR. CARLUZZO: Well, if I feel it's a condition that

1 needs attention from DEP or something, I'm not going to do
2 anything.

3 MR. GEORGELIS: Yeah.

4 MR. CARLUZZO: Maybe I'll put a barricade on it so you
5 see -- you know, that there's a defect there or whatever.

6 MR. GEORGELIS: So if you patch something you would see
7 it keep sinking right away, you wouldn't six month later, if it
8 would sink six months later, would you think there was a problem
9 with the road sinking or --

10 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah, definitely, definitely.

11 MR. GEORGELIS: Okay.

12 MR. CHHATRE: Len.

13 MR. SINGH: I'm going to try to use a visual so we can
14 understand.

15 MR. CHHATRE: Map.

16 MR. SINGH: You're estimating 60 foot. Just so the tape
17 recorder -- this is a Google map picture of -- go back -- of the
18 area in front of the buildings. So you can point to us where you
19 remember being, that's all. Let me get it to load. All right.

20 I don't know when the picture was taken. I don't see
21 the information on there so I can't point to any particular patch.
22 But you see that this is the corner building then you have 1642,
23 1644, 1646.

24 MR. CARLUZZO: Okay.

25 MR. SINGH: Where do you remember being in that?

1 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah. Yeah, I believe we were right by
2 the column, yeah.

3 MR. SINGH: Okay.

4 MR. CARLUZZO: We were right -- yeah, like right around
5 here.

6 MR. SINGH: Okay. So not -- I mean, this picture is a
7 couple years old that we know.

8 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah.

9 MR. SINGH: And I know that you see evidence of a patch
10 over here and a patch over here.

11 MR. CARLUZZO: Right.

12 MR. SINGH: But you remember more being closer to that
13 column?

14 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah, I think we were closer to the
15 column. I remember being by the column.

16 MR. SINGH: Okay.

17 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah.

18 MR. CHHATRE: More toward the cylinder and the column?

19 MR. CARLUZZO: Because two of my guys were over there
20 waiting for the guys to finish shoveling. We were leaning against
21 the column.

22 MR. SINGH: Okay.

23 MR. CHHATRE: So, let's go back here and see if you can
24 see the column here. Do you hear what I'm saying --

25 MR. SINGH: Yeah.

1 MR. CHHATRE: -- there may be another column.

2 MR. SINGH: Get the exact spot on there.

3 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Chris, can I ask you a question?
4 Do you see the patch for 1642 where the water and sewer
5 (indiscernible)?

6 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yes.

7 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: And that --

8 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: But that's there too.

9 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: But this patch is further north
10 from that patch?

11 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yes. There you go, you can see
12 it there.

13 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Adjacent to it or is it
14 significant --

15 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah, see it in the middle of the
16 street.

17 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: The column, that column is near
18 the corner.

19 MR. CHHATRE: (Indiscernible).

20 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

21 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Or the intersection. See if I
22 can get it in here.

23 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: You're saying there's another
24 column closer to the --

25 MR. CHHATRE: Another column --

1 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Column but it's over by the
2 intersection there.

3 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: No, but --

4 MR. CHHATRE: (Indiscernible). Good.

5 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (Indiscernible).

6 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: In this column.

7 MR. CHHATRE: Okay, good.

8 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay.

9 MR. CHHATRE: So for the record for the (indiscernible)
10 it is the second column from the intersection?

11 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Correct.

12 MR. CARLUZZO: Yeah.

13 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay. That helps. Thank you.

14 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: All right.

15 MR. CHHATRE: Any other questions? If not, thank you
16 very much for coming.

17 MR. CARLUZZO: No problem.

18 MR. CHHATRE: I appreciate your help. Off the record.

19 MR. CARLUZZO: Any way I can be of assistance. It's a
20 pleasure.

21 (Whereupon, the interview was concluded.)

22

23

24

CERTIFICATE

This is to certify that the attached proceeding before the

NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD

IN THE MATTER OF: NATURAL GAS DISTRIBUTION PIPELINE
 LEAK AND MULTISTORY STRUCTURE
 EXPLOSION IN HARLEM, NEW YORK
 MARCH 12, 2014
 Interview of Rosario Carluzzo

DOCKET NUMBER: DCA-14-MP-002

PLACE: New York, New York

DATE: August 5, 2014

was held according to the record, and that this is the original,
complete, true and accurate transcript which has been transcribed
to the best of my skill and ability.

Cheryl Farner Donovan
Transcriber