U.S. Department
of Transportation
**Federal Aviation
Administration**

Aviation Safety

Farmingdale Flight Standards District Office
7150 Republic Airport
Administration Building, Suite 235
Farmingdale, NY 11735
[redacted]FAA.GOV

March 5, 2024

Accident ATQA number: A-EA-11-24-002
NTSB number: ERA24LA116

FARMINGDALE, NY (FRG): N33667, P28A, REPORTED ENGINE FAILURE WHILE ON SHORT FINAL AND MADE AN EMERGENCY LANDING ON SOUTHERN STATE PARKWAY, ABOUT 1/4 MILE FROM THE APPROACH END OF RUNWAY 1. THE PILOT AND THE PASSENGER TRANSPORTED TO THE HOSPITAL. POB: UNKNOWN, INJURIES: UNKNOWN, DAMAGE: EXTENT UNKNOWN. 02/20/2024 1643Z

- Type/purpose of operation (Part 61 training)
- Aircraft: PA-28-180, N33667 SN: 28-7505166
- Phase of Operation: Approach Runway 1
- Location: 40.71814°N, 73.40784°W/ Route 109 & Southern State, Farmingdale, NY FRG
- PIC was CFI: Anthony Quirino Lanni
- Student Pilot: Benson Varughese Mathew
- Passengers: None
- Weather conditions: Clear
- Status of pilot cert: CFI First Class medical Cert
  - Total flight hours as per pilot 500
  - Student Pilot has 20 hours
- Other qualified pilots aboard: None
- FS IIC info: John Harris is FAA/ NTSB not traveling to the accident: Ralph Hicks
- Pilot Incident/enforcement history: None

Sequence of Events:
02/20/2024 1145: Received notification of aircraft crash landed on Southern State Parkway and Route 109. Responded to the accident. Aircraft landed on Highway; right wing hit the "Wrong Way" sign partially breaking off the wing and spinning it in the opposite direction. First responders saw fuel leaking out of the right wing, and it lasted approximately 30 minutes. Foam was sprayed to contain the fuel leak. Pictures were taken. At this time there were no other evidence of any fuel leakage. The FAA inspected the aircraft:
1. Right wing was partially removed from the fuselage. Hole and tear under outboard wing
2. Right wing leading edge severely damage.
3. Right wing Flaps and aileron severely damage.
4. In cockpit, fuel tank selector valve located on the left side by area where pilot would be seated was selected to the left tank position.

5. Throttles and fuel mixture fully retarded.
6. Battery switch off.
7. Left and Right fuel tank indicators read zero.
8. When turned on battery Engine monitor(EDM 830) indicated 11.3 REM (Gallons of fuel remaining)
9. No visible damage to cockpit interior.
10. Removed engine cowl in inspected engine and compartment
11. Firewall intact.
12. Engine oil filled to required capacity.
13. No visible damage to engine, linkages, fuel lines or belts. Note: 1 belt was missing from A/C pump.
14. No obstruction to throttle or mixture linkage all move freely
15. Left wing was fully intact, no evidence of fuel leakage. Attempted to drain remaining fuel out of wing. Lifted and tilted aircraft to the left to verify fuel in tank. no evidence of fuel was in the tank we were only able to drain approximately ½ gallon.
16. Aircraft has a fuel capacity of 50 gallons, 25 in each wing.

Interviewed Pilot (CFI) at hospital. See CFI interview.

After the interview, the FAA went back to the aircraft to verify that:

1. Engine throttles moved freely.
2. Fuel Selector valve move from left tank to right tank and back to off position.
3. Watch as the towing representatives drain the fuel and prepare the aircraft for moving.
4. The FAA verified the Left wing only had about ½ gallon of fuel.

The student pilot who is also the owner of the aircraft at FRG where the aircraft was being towed too. Interview the Student Pilot (See SP interview). Also retrieved the maintenance logbooks for the aircraft for review.

2/22/2024: The FAA conducted a second interview with the student pilot (See SP interview) and returned the maintenance logs. The student pilot answers did not change during the second interview. He added a few more details and confirmed his answers. The FAA decided to look at the cockpit of the aircraft and verified their findings with the student pilot. The FAA also check the EDM 830 indicator which showed the last reading of fuel when the aircraft crash landed. It showed 11.3 REM (Fuel remaining on board). This indicator does not directly read the fuel from each tank. Its data is inputted by the pilot when the aircraft is refueled to its max capacity.

2/27/2024: The FAA interviewed the CFI a second time at the FAA office (See CFI interview). His story changed as to the quantity of fuel in the fuel tanks.

During the FAA interview of both the CFI and student pilot, they both stated that they flew the aircraft the day before on a training flight for .9 hours. The aircraft performed normal with no problems. Both did not remember how much fuel was on the aircraft after the flight that day. They did not refuel the aircraft after the flight.

2/27/2024: A pilot that flew the same aircraft on 2/16/2024 contacted the FAA. He stated that he flew from FRG to Watertown NY and back to FRG. He stated that the aircraft had no performance problems and operated normally. He top off the fuel tanks at Watertown NY, then returned to FRG. The FAA asked if he remembered how much fuel was on the aircraft when he landed. He stated approximately 30 gallons. He did not refuel the aircraft at FRG.

Conclusion:

[redacted]