

MEMORANDUM FOR RECORD

Brian C. Rayner Senior Air Safety Investigator Eastern Region

Date: November 5, 2023

Person Contacted: Noor Muzammal – Flight Instructor

NTSB Accident Number: ERA23FA137 Farmingdale, New York

Narrative:

Ms. Muzammal was a flight instructor for Danny Waizman Flight School. She was interviewed at the airport where she was employed and the following is a summary of the interview. Ms. Muzammal was a commercial pilot with ratings for airplane single engine land, multiengine land, and instrument airplane. She held a flight instructor certificate with a rating for airplane single engine. She had 1,170 total hours of flight experience of which 900 hours was in the accident airplane make and model.

Ms Muzammal was the accident pilot's coworker and close friend. She had experience in the accident airplane and offered to provide insight and context regarding the working environment, the safety culture, and the maintenance posture of the flight school and its fleet.

- How long have you been employed at this flight school?

"Since June 2022."

- How are mx squawks handled?

The first thing you do is record the time on the airplane and then you tell Danny or Khabir (office manager) and report, say, a brake problem. They would go to the plane and test it for themselves and if they were satisfied, they would say, 'it's fine.'

On one particular flight (January 2, 2023) with two customers, we were on short final and experienced smoke in the cockpit. My front seat passenger was coughing, and I exclaimed "Is that smoke???" We landed, I informed my boss, and he dismissed it with 'we just changed the cylinder, what do you expect.?' There was no troubleshooting or maintenance performed, and Mr. Waizman immediately scheduled the airplane for another instructor. Literally. Like seconds after."

- What is your impression of how the flight school airplanes are maintained?
- "Really bad. Very poorly. Some of the other instructors would take maintenance concerns directly to Mr. Gainor (mechanic), and he would yell at them. Really bad. Once, during preflight with a student, Fayzul was checking the horizontal stabilizer when 'the cable snapped.' When he reported it to Mr. Gainor, Mr. Gainor exploded. It was unprofessional and embarrassing. It was very, very rude."
- Describe the safety culture at the flight school.
- "Non-existent. Once when flying N3071D, I experienced a partial power loss, extreme engine roughness, returned to the school, and reported my experience with the airplane. It was immediately dispatched to another instructor who experienced backfires that sounded like gunshots, an abnormal mag check, and he too returned the airplane to the school.
- Are pilots/CFIs encouraged to report safety issues (mx or otherwise)? No, and once Mr. Waizman told us never to report difficulties with the airplane over the radio because 'ATC can get your license taken away'

What is the process for doing so? "We would report directly to Mr. Waizman, or the mechanic, Mr. Gainor, or the office manager."

- How many "introductory flights" have you conducted? "Over 100?" What percentage of total flights became students? "about 35 percent."
- What is SOP for these flights? (duration, route, topics covered?) Usually Ms. Muzammal flew out to Captree Bridge, and performed climbs, descents, and turns. The flights lasted about 35-45 minutes. .6 or .7 hours.
- Is there usually a camera onboard the aircraft during an intro flight? What kind? Are you in charge of operating it? "No, there is a GoPro option which is 100 dollars more."

Ms. Muzammal estimated the accident pilot had accrued 550 total hours of flight experience.

END OF STATEMENT



From: Sylvanna Polito

Sent: Sunday, March 19, 2023 10:28 PM

To: Rayner Brian

Subject: N8149R Jan 7

[CAUTION] This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click any links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

January 7,2023 10:30am

I got into the aircraft after preforming standard pre-check procedure. Then got clearance to go to Bravo run-up At 10:40am. After run up was complete I proceeded with grounds' instruction to taxi via B6, runway 1, G7, A to hold short of runway 32. I then requested touch and gos and was permitted clearance to do so. I completed 1 complete traffic pattern. Then as I climbed back up for my next touch and go (11:06AM) there is smoke near my feet. My instructor took controls asking me to open the little window on my side. He then told tower that we have an emergency situation with smoke in the cockpit. He then asked and received clearance to land runway 1. Which he then slipped into the runway landing us back down at 11:08am. We taxied B4, B where the republic fire truck followed us and took my instructors CFI information.

I got all the specific times and locations from my ForeFlight log which I have attached the link to here:

If there's any more information you need from me please do not hesitate to ask

Thank you,

Svlvanna Polito

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE - THIS E-MAIL TRANSMISSION MAY CONTAIN INFORMATION THAT IS PRIVILEGED, CONFIDENTIAL, PROPRIETARY, SUBJECT TO COPYRIGHT, AND/OR EXEMPT FROM DISCLOSURE UNDER APPLICABLE LAW. IT IS FOR THE USE OF INTENDED RECIPIENTS ONLY. If you are not an intended recipient of this message, please notify the original sender immediately by forwarding what you received and then delete all copies of the correspondence and attachments from your computer system. Any use, distribution, or disclosure of this message by unintended recipients is not authorized and may be unlawful.

From:

Re: N8149R Jan 7

Subject:

Date: Monday, March 20, 2023 1:05:16 PM

Attachments: image001.png

[CAUTION] This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click any links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

- 1. I occupied the seat furthest from the door so when sitting in the plane it's the left hand side
- 2. The smoke was a mix gradient of grey
- 3. It was thin at first but began getting a little thicker and darker
- 4. It had a more oil odor

Thank you, Sylvanna Polito

On Mar 20, 2023, at 10:10 AM, Rayner Brian <raynerb@ntsb.gov> wrote:

Good morning, Ms. Polito,

Thank you again for your detailed statement. Would you be kind enough to answer a couple of clarifying questions?

- 1. Which seat did you occupy?
- 2. What color was the smoke?
- 3. How dense was it? Could you see through it?
- 4. Could you describe its odor? Oily? Electrical? Plastic?

Please share only what you remember. I'm not trying to talk you into anything, I'm only interested in what you remember.

Thank you again for being so helpful.

v/r

Brian

Brian C. Rayner Senior Air Safety Investigator National Transportation Safety Board AS-FRA 490 L'Enfant Plaza East, S.W. Washington, DC 20594

Talwinder Singh

Date: 03/07/2023

Dear Sir/Madam,

My name is Talwinder Singh. I started working with 2BAPilot flight school in March 2022. Danny Waizman was in charge of overall operations. During my entire 11 month journey in this school I had only two negative experiences. One personality related, and one mechanical. The first incident was in summer of 2022. I had a student who did not want to follow the rules and had a nasty attitude with me in the plane. I calmly landed the plane and ended the lesson and told Danny I will not be flying with this student again for safety reasons and that was the end of that. Danny in response told me it's okay everyone's different and agreed with my decision.

The second incident was on January 7th in N8149R. I was with a private pilot student Sylvanaa Polito (details attached below). We were practicing landings on runway 32 in republic. During the 2nd touch and go on upwind approximately 800 FT MSL, we saw faint and light smoke. As soon as I saw the smoke, I took the controls, performed the proper emergency procedure and made a priority landing right away. However as soon as I saw the smoke, my first reaction I reduced power and leveled the plane causing the smoke to dissipate almost instantly. We landed safely without any issues and reported the problem to the office. The office took the plane out of service and put a note on the binder detailing out what happened and handed the situation over to the mechanic.

After a few days I see Danny in the office and ask him more info regarding what the mechanic said. Danny told me that smoke was due to the mechanic using some type of spray in the engine and that's residual smoke off that spray substance. He proceeded to tell me the mechanic checked the plane out and he (Danny) flew it after and it was perfectly good. After that incident I decided to stay away from that plane for 2-3 weeks. Meanwhile that plane was being used by other CFIs and to the best of my knowledge the regular inspections and maintenance was being done on that plane.

On March 5th, 2023 around approximately 9Am, I flew N8149R with another student Kahor (student details attached below). We conducted a regular pre-flight procedures, inspection and performed a good thorough rup-up - there were no issues at all. We had full fuel before takeoff. We flew for 2.1 hours flight and we did 8 landings at KBDR and returned to KFRG without incident.

Overall I felt comfortable working at Danny Waizman flight school before this accident because I saw firsthand the maintenance was done and recorded and I personally never had issues with the planes or any of the staff. I was never ever pressured to fly. There were several instances when I canceled a flight due to weather or personal reasons and was never put under any external pressure. However from what I heard I can't say the same about Farhan. I have heard that few days before the accident Farhan heard a squeaky noise checking the rudder during the pre-flight and the mechanic Bob yelled at him just to take the "Fu**ing plane." However, Farhan and his student came back and did not go on that flight. This was for N2185B. I then told Farhan when I saw him that he did the right thing and I would have done the same assuring him he made the right decision.

I personally am affected by this accident, the loss of life and the injuries suffered is horrible. I truly regret being part of Danny's team and having to witness this up close and on such a personal level. I pray for everyone involved because it could have been any one of us cfi's or worse our students. The best part about working at 2BAPilot Flight school was the culture between us CFI's. We feel as a team/family working there and have a great relationship between us.

Sylvanna Polito: student:
Kahor Valiev: student :

Please feel free to contact me anytime, Thank You -Talwinder Singh



MEMORANDUM FOR RECORD

Brian C. Rayner Senior Air Safety Investigator Eastern Region

Date: April 3, 2023

Person Contacted: Robert Gainor - Mechanic

NTSB Accident Number: ERA23FA137 Farmingdale, New York

Narrative:

- -Mr. Gainor was a mechanic for Danny Waizman Flight School. He was interviewed at the airport where he was employed and the following is a summary of the interview. Mr. Gainor was a mechanic with ratings for airframe and powerplant. According to Mr. Gainor, "I am an A&P mechanic. We have 5 other airplanes in the school besides the accident airplane."
- -Do you work for Mr. Weizman?
- "That's a debate, but he's my only employer. His lawyer wants to consider me an independent contractor, but I don't consider myself as such and neither does Mr. Weizman."
- How are aircraft squawks recorded?
- "The squawks are recorded in the red folder of each plane. If the airplane is 'deadlined' they put the folder off to the side. If I deadline the airplane I keep the folder in my car with the keys."
- What is the procedure for returning aircraft to service following a mx squawk?
- "I would make a corrective action in the logbook and remove the squawk from the red folder."
- Are pilots/CFIs encouraged to report safety issues?
- "I like them to tell me, but I want them to officially report it to the office manager."
- -What is the process for doing so?
- "It would be written in or on the book with a post-it, and the office manager would control it."

- How did you become aware of the report of smoke in the cockpit involving the accident airplane?

"Mr. Waizman was on vacation. I had just put a #4 cylinder on the airplane, and we had to wait a month for the cylinder, and I replaced the cylinder, returned the airplane to service after doing a ground-test run. Somebody flew the airplane and reported smoke in the cockpit.

I inspected the engine exhaust, and found nothing visual wrong with the airplane, but then none of the pilots would fly with me, so I had to wait for Danny to come back. We did several touchand-goes and flew it around and found nothing wrong.

I ran it up, did mag checks, but I did not turn on radios or instruments. Did not replace any electrical parts or switches. I put a scat hose on the shrouding from the mufflers to the heater box. The airplane did not fly at all between the 7th and the 16th.

I got a wiff of the smoke and thought it might be a solvent that was used to clean the engine and cowling. But in retrospect, it couldn't have been the solvent because that was used a long time prior to that. And, it had neither and oil or electrical smell."

Mr. Gainor said he could not duplicate the problem.

- Did you speak with the pilot who made the report? Did they describe the event? (Mr. Gainor could not remember.)
- Describe your troubleshooting actions (*systems that come to mind here are battery/electrical, oil, fuel...*) (Previously discussed above)
- Were you able to reproduce the issue? "No."
- Did you find any anomalies? "The scat hose had holes so I replaced it."
- What sort of corrective actions did you take before returning the airplane to service? (see above)
- Were there any subsequent issues between return to service and the accident flight? (none reported by Mr. Gainor)
- Describe the safety culture at the flight school. Mr. Gainor took a minute to answer, and then said, "It's safety first." There was no debate between Mr. Waizman and his pilots.

Were there debates between Mr. Waizman and himself? "No, if I tell him we need something, he'll get it."

When asked about fire extinguishers, Mr. Gainor said, "most of the airplanes have them, but I can't remember which ones." When asked about how they were mounted, he said, "They weren't. they were tucked in the seat-back pocket."

"My impression was that it was a discovery flight. Find out if they want lessons, or somebody might buy the flight as a gift and give it to someone else."

END OF STATEMENT