П	
IINTTED	STATES OF AMERICA
NATIONAL TRAN	ISPORTATION SAFETY BOARD
* * * * * * * * * * * * *	* *
Investigation of:	*
	*
FIRE ONBOARD SPIRIT OF NORFO	
NEAR NORFOLK NAVAL STATION, VIRGINIA ON JUNE 7, 2022	* Accident No.: DCA22FM022 *
	*
* * * * * * * * * * * * *	* *
Interview of: ROBERT ENLOE,	Chief Mate
City Cruises	
	Virginia Beach, Virginia
	Virginia Deach, Virginia
	Friday,
	January 27, 2023
	CATE REPORTING, INC. Porting Transcription
D.C.	Area 301-261-1902
Balt. &	Annap. $410 - 974 - 0947$

APPEARANCES:

CDR RANDY WADDINGTON, Lead Investigating Officer Chief of Analysis and Compliance Division United States Coast Guard

LCDR Inspections & Investigations Oversight United States Coast Guard

LCDR Staff Member Fifth Coast Guard's District Inspections United States Coast Guard

MICHAEL KARR, Safety Program Manager National Transportation Safety Board

Traveling Marine Investigator United States Coast Guard

CHRIS ABELL, Representative Bay Diesel

ERIC DENLEY, Counsel City Cruises

<u>ITEM</u> Interview of Robert Enloe:	<u>index</u>	PAGE
By LCDR		4
By Mr.		28
By Mr. Karr		30
By Mr. Denley		33
By LCDR		37
By Mr. Karr		39

	4
1	INTERVIEW
2	(2:32 p.m.)
3	CDR WADDINGTON: The time is 2:32. The hearing is now in
4	session. At this time I call Mr. Robert Enloe, Chief Mate, Spirit
5	of Norfolk. Lieutenant will administer your oath and ask
6	you some preliminary questions.
7	LCDR Mr. Enloe, please stand and raise your right
8	hand. A false statement given to an agency of the United States
9	is punishable by fine and/or imprisonment under 18 U.S. Code §
10	1001. Knowing this do you solemnly swear that the testimony you
11	are about to give will be the truth, the whole truth and nothing
12	but the truth, so help you God?
13	THE WITNESS: Yes.
14	LCDR Please be seated.
15	INTERVIEW OF ROBERT ENLOE
16	BY LCDR
17	Q. Sir, please state your, state your full name and spell your
18	last name.
19	A. Robert Gerald Enloe, last name E-n-l-o-e.
20	Q. Please identify counsel or representative, if present, and
21	have them state and spell their last name as well as your firm or
22	company relationship.
23	MR. DENLEY: Good afternoon. I'm Eric Denley, D-e-n-l-e-y,
24	deputy general counsel for City Cruises Hornblower Group,
25	designated party in interest to this investigation.
	FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

BY LCDR

Q. Please tell us what is your current employment and position?
A. My current employment is Hornblower City Cruises and I'm
considered the first mate, although it's kind of an honorary title
of Chief Mate.

6 Q. What are your general responsibilities in that job?

7 A. I'm mainly in training sessions with all of our new people.
8 That's one of our main responsibilities. Also I do set up
9 schedules for routine maintenance on the boat. I am on -- during
10 cruise days if I am a senior mate I will be the mate on duty as
11 far as being there, being there for the cruise.

12 Can you briefly tell us your relevant work history? Ο. 13 Thirteen years U.S. Navy. I've spent a year with MSC (ph.) Α. 14 out of Singapore. I've been with the Jamestown Surry Ferry. I've 15 been with the Virginia Responder out of Little Creek, oil spill 16 cleanup ship. I've been with numbers of smaller companies like 17 Tracker Boat in Hampton. And now I've been with Hornblower City 18 Cruises going into 16 years.

19 Q. And what is your education related to your position? 20 A. High school, some college, electronics in the Navy for my 21 whole 13 years, and I do -- up until 2021 I carried a 100-ton 22 Master's license and I have a Navy certificate.

Q. Do you currently hold any professional licenses orcertificates related to your position?

25 A. Not for this. I, I let, let my 100-ton elapse in 2021,

FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

1 especially after 2020 thinking I probably wouldn't be coming back
2 to work.

Q. Thank you, sir. All of my questions are related to the period up to June 7th, 2022, unless I specifically ask you about a later, a later or earlier day. Thank you for being here, and we ask you if you have any questions. We will take breaks. If you need a break just let me know.

8 There is an exhibit binder available in front of you, and I 9 will put up any exhibits or the chief will put up any exhibits in 10 -- on the monitors for your viewing. I please ask that you try 11 and refrain from using any acronyms.

We're going to break your testimony up into a couple main parts, the first being the events that took place on June 7th, 2022, the second your role as the Chief Mate aboard the Spirit of Norfolk, and lastly, the events specifically between the 15th of May until the beginning of June 7.

17 A. Okay.

18 Q. To understand your role in the City Cruises organization, who

19 do you directly report to?

20 A. I'm sorry?

- 21 Q. Who do you, who do you directly report to?
- 22 A. My direct --
- 23 Q. Yes.
- 24 A. -- person is Captain Ryan Nadeau.
- 25 Q. Is that in all cases?

FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

Anytime we're on the boat that's -- he's the one I report to 1 Α. 2 unless we have a cruise with another captain. And briefly, who reports directly to you? 3 Okav. Ο. 4 We have approximately during a cruise three, maybe four Α. 5 deckhands. 6 Do you work on any other vessels other --Ο. 7 No, sir. Α. -- than the Spirit of Norfolk, or not Spirit of Norfolk, with 8 Ο. 9 City Cruises? 10 No. We have a freedom, freedom to leave, but I, I'm more or Α. 11 less involved with the Spirit of Mount Vernon now. 12 Okay. Please take a moment to collect your memories from the 0. 13 events of the 7th, Tuesday, June 7th, 2022, and I'd like for you 14 to talk about that day starting from when you prepared the Spirit 15 of Norfolk for the day trip. Please provide me as much detail as 16 you can and recounting the day until you departed to Pier 4 later 17 that day -- until the vessel departed Pier 4. That was a 11:00 to 1:00 two-hour cruise so at 7 18 Okay. Α. 19 o'clock I arrived. My job is to come in and open up the boat, make sure we get the AC going, especially in the summer, check 20 lights. Within 15 minutes I'm down in the machinery room or the 21 bow thruster getting those -- that equipment online. Usually my 22 23 first job is to get in, start the generators and engines, make 24 sure that everything is working there. I'll look for anything 25 abnormal, leaks, anything that is not under the normal auspices of

my job. Once I do the machinery space for the engine and
 generators I go to the bow thruster and repeat the same thing
 there. I check it.

By that time usually my crew who was going to be there for the day has come in, and then I have to sit with those guys, make sure that they know what we're coming up to for the day, what we're going to be doing, what our responsibilities are, who is going to be cruising with us. Just getting them -- putting them into the, into the know of what to expect.

And after we do that we did put fuel on that day. That morning probably the truck arrived 8:30 to 9 o'clock. Made sure we had fuel onboard. My responsibility also was to put -- make sure we have adequate water onboard. Normal days unless we've had rain it's also my job to wash the boat down outside, third deck both port and starboard side.

16 Once I get through doing that I go down and get the guys ready. I check the, check the, the heads to make sure that all 17 18 the normal things have been done in the heads for the day, getting 19 them ready. Once we finish that we're expected to get up to the 20 wheelhouse. Usually an hour and a half prior to leaving the pier we will have everybody ready there, what we call a suit out, get 21 22 your cruise clothes on. Sometimes we'll have what we call a 23 tabletop session where we talk about something that may or may not 24 have happened in the last week or what we're looking forward to. 25 Once we get everything done and set up there hour and a half

> FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

1 before we're out on the pier getting it set up, make sure that 2 we're all ready for the customers when they arrive. Usually, if it's a 11:00 to 2:00 or 11:00 to 1:00, by usually 11:00 or 10:30, 3 4 10:45 most of the people are there. We get then onboard. This particular day, right around 11 o'clock, the captain was ready to 5 6 go. We had our people onboard. We had a, we had a group of young 7 people, young kids with either one or two of their parents with them which makes it easy, makes our job easier to have their 8 parents there that can kind of help look out for them. 9 After 10 everybody was onboard we got underway.

11 We did our first engine check. When I say we, Jeremiah Perry 12 is one of our older deckhands. When I say older, older in terms 13 of time on the boat. So he was in charge of taking one of our 14 brand new people, a guy, a person that had only had one -- I think that was his first real cruise on the boat, taking him down and 15 16 just spending time showing him what we do to do engine checks. 17 Not to have the guy do it but to let him oversee what he's doing. That's how we do a lot of our training over the months and years 18 19 that people are with us. And so approximately 11:30 we did our first engine check. Everything was fine. 20

Approximately 20 minutes later I had just asked two of our deckhands to go down to have lunch. Within three or four minutes I hear a message from the captain saying, "I'm getting some kind of alarms." I don't know if it's a smoke alarm or just what kind of alarm it was, but he said, "I'm getting some, some alarms up in

> FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

1 the wheelhouse. Someone go down and check the engine room." So 2 immediately I ran down to the engine room, went through the galley to the door. We have one of our experienced deckhands and another 3 4 new deckhand standing there at the door, and they had just opened 5 up the door and then closed it again. When I got there I said what's going on? He said, "Well, we've got a lot of smoke. 6 Ι 7 said, "There's, there's fire coming in." That's why I need to see 8 more than that. So we open up the door again and you get nothing 9 but hot gassy air, smoke coming out. So I knew it wasn't 10 something that we were going to have to just use the fire 11 extinguisher on. My feeling is if I couldn't breathe to get into 12 it, I couldn't fight it.

13 So at that point in time I notified the captain that, hey, 14 there's no way that we can get in with what we have to fight a 15 fire of this type, this size. And from that point I sent my 16 deckhands back upstairs. I made sure that everyone was out of the 17 galley, cleared it, went upstairs. Checked the heads to make sure 18 there was nobody there.

Jeremiah Perry was on the, on the first deck. He asked me at the time, said, "What should we do about our emergency fuel shutoffs?" I said let me call captain to find out. I mean I knew at that time everything was stopped on the boat. I mean, nothing was going on. I did call Captain Ryan and I said, "Look, what, what, what do you -- else do you want us to do beside right now shut this off?" He said, "You all go ahead and shut, shut the

1 fuel shutoffs off."

2	One of my deck hands that already went to the bow, Captain
3	Ryan had already called for a tug to come over to attempt to tow
4	us away from the Navy base because we were drifting in that
5	direction. The towline that they, they handed over to the tug was
6	not a real towline. It was just one of our dock lines. And as
7	soon as the tug started to take a strain on it the, the line
8	parted at the where at the tug itself, so I go out. Of course,
9	we're being drowned. The tug at the bow was just dumping water on
10	us like crazy. I told the deckhand to go on back inside. No
11	sense both of us here we're getting drowned. I don't want anybody
12	to get hurt if something should happen with one of the lines out
13	here.

14 So I did get the line in that broke. Called the tug back. he handed me a big, huge towline. I put it over our cleat, gave 15 16 him the thumbs up and they started to tow us out. At that time I 17 ran back in and assisted in getting PFDs to help, help the, the wait staff get the people ready to get over. They had most of 18 19 them already upstairs, but they were bringing them down when the 20 Rover came over so we could start to get them over, over the side. 21 From that point on once we started doing that I started 22 trying to make sure we cleared the boat, make sure no one was 23 around or available or that was in our way trying to do our job. 24 We have had people hide out in bathrooms and in other closets and 25 so we ran through and made sure everything was, was cleared.

1 I called the captain, told him what we were doing and what, 2 what, what was going on with everything. And I said, "Do you need me to do anything else?" He said no, so I ran upstairs real 3 4 quick, told him that we'd verbally gave him the, the direction 5 that we, we had gotten everyone cleared down below. We were 6 getting them off on the Rover boat. Did he want me to do anything else at that time, and he said no. You're going to be the last 7 8 person off. Tell them when you get on the boat and you're, you're it and myself and, and C.J., the other captain, we will remain on 9 10 the boat. So that was my, that was my time up until I cleared the 11 boat and got on the Rover. 12 Thank you. Can you please walk me through the light off 0. 13 (ph.) process that you did in the morning of the 7th for the

14 | engines?

A. Our process in the morning as we go through, I've, I've tried 15 16 to focus or get people to focus on the fact look around. Don't 17 just walk in with blinders on and do one little simple thing. Check everything, the bilges mainly. We do a lot of that. 18 We 19 always check our AC pumps, make sure the AC pump lines are good, 20 that they're working. My pet peeve is oil on the deck or in the 21 bilges. It bugs the heck out of me to, to have to see that so my 22 job is to make sure everyone's aware that goes in there to clean 23 up after yourself if you're using something. But we watch 24 everything to make sure there's no oil leaks, water leaks, fuel 25 leaks, anything.

1 I -- my -- the way I usually turn everything on is I went --2 I go through the port generator, turn the battery switches on, get it all set up to make sure it's ready. Start, start it. 3 Then I 4 go to my port main do the same thing. When I first get in to look at all this and get ready, one of the main things I do is check 5 6 our dipsticks, make sure we've got plenty of oil in the system. 7 Go through do my port generator, port main, starboard main, 8 starboard generator, get them up and running. We'll check our 9 gauges and make sure everything is working right, not just on the, 10 on the engines and generator but also on our control board, the 11 control panel that shows you what everything is doing there so 12 that when we do switch power from shore power to generator power 13 everything should be the same, should be normal.

14 Once I get all that done, I spend usually about 10 to 15 15 minutes in the engine room in the mornings checking everything 16 that you can think of on engines and generators to, to make sure 17 that when you leave that they're working good. We made a mistake many years ago in thinking that we could wait until right before 18 19 the cruise to start up our engines and generators. We got burned, 20 so that's why we start in the morning, crank everything up as soon 21 as we come in to make sure everything is working.

Once I've finished all my checks in the engine room I leave and go immediately to the bow thruster, do the same thing with the bow thruster. Make sure it's up and running, that you check the oil, all your fluids, make sure there's no leaks. Once I get

> FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

	14
1	through that in the morning then I'm back ready to do the rest of
2	the other checks.
3	Q. On the 7th did you conduct the pre-underway check yourself or
4	did you have anybody with you?
5	A. Yes, I did well, the, the underway check itself as far as
6	during the cruise no. We always try to have our people that are
7	experienced try to, try to maintain those. I've, I've done it a
8	lot. People that have been there four or five years I sometimes
9	say, hey, I want you to do the checks and I want you to take our
10	new people so they can see what you're doing. That particular day
11	it happened to be Jeremiah Perry along with a person that was
12	it may have been the first, first cruise he was on.
13	Q. So Mr. Perry he did not conduct the pre-underway check with
14	you.
15	A. He did the, did the first underway check.
16	Q. Underway check.
17	A. Right
18	Q. Right.
19	A which was approximately 11:00, about 11:30.
20	Q. Okay. And did you give him any kind of pass down prior to
21	his underway check?
22	A. In the mornings when we when they're my, my group comes
23	in I tell them, hey, everything's been cranked up, everything's
24	running, no problems. Just keep your eyes open when you're making
25	your rounds today. And that's generally what we do every day we,
	FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

we do a cruise if to make sure people are aware to keep their eyes
 open.

3 Q. And did you train Mr. Perry?

A. Part. I helped to train him. The captains do some training.
I do training. We have some new people. When I say new people,
when new people come in some of our people that have been there
three, four, five years they help train them. So we're all in the
training phase all the time.

Can you walk with me -- walk, walk me through how you 9 Ο. 10 actually train people in conducting underway rounds? 11 When we first start training people we let them come in and Α. 12 ride along just to see what we're doing. That's, that's the big, 13 that's the big thing. We hire people with the understanding that 14 we'd like you to see our work and then you can decide if you think you want to be part of this team, part of this group. Once 15 16 they've decided that and they've done their job for, maybe for a 17 week or two, we will elect to take people down as we're doing our 18 checks in the machinery spaces. We don't want those people 19 thinking that they're going to be doing those checks right away so 20 we make sure that they know you're just down here to see how we do 21 it because if you stay with us very long you'd best be -- you're 22 going to be given more responsibility. And part of that 23 responsibility will be monitoring the engine room, monitoring the 24 bow thruster. That's on top of their of their other duties, but I 25 try to make sure that when I put one of our new people with

1 someone that's been there for a while that I'm watching all of 2 them, not just one person, but monitoring what they all do. And 3 that's part of how I train is to oversee and don't just forget 4 about them and say, okay, they've done it for a couple times so 5 they're good. It's an ongoing program. I can pull somebody out 6 anytime and say, well, I'm going to do an engine check but you're 7 doing it. I'm going to watch. That's, that's how we -- that's 8 how we do our training.

9 Q. And after a member of the crew would conduct an engineering 10 round onboard the Spirit of Norfolk, is, is there a standard or 11 protocol that you guys have implemented to which you do a pass 12 down to the captain prior to completing your round or after 13 completing your round?

14 We do our -- used to do our pass downs at the end of the Α. 15 cruise if there's something that we need to pass down. Obviously, 16 if it's a -- an emergency sister situation then the captain 17 wouldn't know about it right, right away, but during our cruises 18 if it's normal usually at the end of the cruise we get together 19 and say everything went like it's supposed to. We had no 20 problems, no issues. The check sheets that we do come back up to 21 the wheelhouse. We also have a pass down log. We have a daily 22 log. So there's a number of places that we can put things in that 23 shows either training, maintenance, any kind of a situation that 24 might come up where that -- that needs to be noted.

Q. What types of items are on the check sheet that you just

25

FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

1 || spoke of?

2	A. The one for the engine room asked you to look at all the, the
3	gauges for engines and generators, such as oil pressure, fuel
4	pressure, RPMs. We also have a big compressor down there, air
5	compressor we have to check. We also have our steering system
6	which most of the time at least when I try to train people and
7	make sure they don't overlook it. We do have a side gauge on it
8	as well as a gauge to tell you what your pressure is. That's,
9	that's some of the main things.

10 We also make sure they understand they need to look around 11 and check our, our AC pumps, make sure the strainer baskets are 12 okay. They're not leaking. This is all on our check sheet. And 13 even though I do an engine check one way and someone else who does 14 it maybe a little different, the end result is what we're looking 15 for is that they check everything. I'm -- I start, I start 16 portside and work to the right. Somebody else might do starboard 17 to port, but it's the idea is to get everything on the check sheet checked off. 18

19 And on the 7th of June did Mr. Perry complete a check sheet? Q. 20 We have a check sheet that we fill out. Α. Yes. If it's two cruises a day then you have two checks sheets. First check sheet 21 22 is the, the half hour checks for the first cruise, so Jeremiah 23 would fill out that. We have it clipped up right next as you come 24 in the door so all you got to do is walk in the door, pick it up 25 and start your check.

> FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

	18
1	Q. And from previous testimony I believe that Mr. Perry was not
2	scheduled to conduct the second round of the engine room?
3	A. On the first cruise he was scheduled to do three checks.
4	Q. The same person was going to do three checks.
5	A. Right. And what I usually do if it's something like that
6	I'll try to have him team up with another one of our new people to
7	see how he does it.
8	Q. Okay. Do you have any, any engineering training in your
9	background?
10	A. Not formal training for engineering, no.
11	Q. And how long have you been conducting these rounds on the
12	Spirit of Norfolk, work on the Spirit of Norfolk you said?
13	A. I started in May of 2007. I became, even though I had a
14	captain's license, I started like everyone else. I started doing
15	senior deck deckhand duty at about four months in, and six
16	months after I was promoted up to junior mate, first step into the
17	mate's position.
18	Q. Now, this training that you provide to the, the prospective
19	engineer not engineer, prospective crew members to be
20	designated as engineers, is this a formal training or is there a
21	company that
22	A. It's, it's the policies that's developed over the years I've
23	worked on the Spirit boats. I'm not sure if the company has put
24	anything in, in a format saying this is, this is what we do. But
25	this was ever since I've been there we've had the sheets with all
	FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

1 the same types of information on it. And, of course, we're not 2 considered engineers. We're, we're all deckhands starting out. With my background military, different ships and the time, and 3 4 time and grade that I've been there that's why I've wound up being 5 -- becoming what they say is first mate. 6 Is there a requirement on how many rounds somebody should do Ο. 7 with another qualified person before they're seen as being 8 designated? 9 Α. It could be to designate -- so designate someone as a senior 10 deckhand or mate it, it could be two months, it could be six 11 It's according to their ability, their aptitude, their months. 12 attitude about it. There's just a lot of, a lot of different 13 factors that we look at in making sure that someone can do the 14 job. 15 Q. As the lead trainer for engineering tasks, rounds and 16 maintenance do you make the determination on who's capable of 17 completing the task required to conduct maintenance and/or rounds? 18 I'm part of that. Captain Ryan also is involved with that. Α. 19 In fact, Captain Ryan is the one that says with my back, my 20 background, my information to him about the people plus our other 21 part-time captains, other mates he takes that into consideration 22 when he moves these folks into a higher position of 23 responsibility. 24 Does your training that you provide does it also include Ο. 25 people to, to be able to identify hazards in an engine room? FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

1 Most of the time we try to make sure people understand that Α. 2 this is a boat is not like a car and there's a lot more things to a boat you have to worry about it and look at and take, take a 3 4 good look at. We took -- we do talk a lot of maintenance on 5 general stuff. We talk security. We talk flooding, I mean, we're 6 always talking about it. That's part of what we do. There's no 7 formal quideline that says that these are the topics that we have 8 to hit with these people when they're brand new. We try to, we 9 try to cover our bases with the new people as much as we can with 10 the number of people that we have there. I'm not the only person 11 that's involved with training. I try to cover what I feel is 12 important and the other senior mates or our part-time captains and 13 Captain Ryan they do the same thing.

14 Do you provide training on engine nomenclature and systems? 0. I, I, I do that plus our part-time captains and Captain 15 Α. Yes. 16 Ryan. My part of it is when we do the, what we call routine 17 maintenance, is I take them through the engines and generators showing them the basics, explain what you have to do to maintain 18 19 them as far as keep them running. I'm also the one mainly in 20 charge of setting our schedule for oil changes. I do most of the training for the oil changes. I do most of training on showing 21 22 how to check batteries, how to replace batteries, how to replace 23 strainer baskets, AC pumps. Generally that's, that's my job on, 24 on maintenance.

25 Q. So just quickly with -- when you're conducting a light off of

1 the engine and you turn on the battery, you turn on the generator 2 and you, you, and you go to start up the engine, do you start it 3 up from the engine itself?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Okay. Is there a way to start the engine from the pilot 6 house?

7 A. Yes. The engines can be started -- we have local and remote 8 on the engines so we have to leave them in the remote position so 9 captain can crank them up anytime he wants to. The generators are 10 a different story. You crank these up in the machinery space and 11 you shut them down there.

12 Q. Now, prior to you starting, so prior to you bringing or 13 starting the, the port main or the starboard main diesel engine, 14 is there -- when you bring them online is there an alarm that goes 15 off in the pilot house prior to them starting up?

A. I don't know about starting them, but there will be an alarm that goes off in the engine -- in the wheelhouse once you, once you crank them up; lets the, the captain know or somebody know that's up there that your engines are running. When I see an alarm it's, it's on the display panel up there showing that it's flashing lights. Then you know, hey, my engines are online or they're running.

Q. You had mentioned that you had heard alarms in the -- I don't know if you, if you stated you heard them in the pilot house or you heard them coming over maybe over the walkie-talkie as Captain

> FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

1 Nadeau was, was giving orders. Were those alarms similar that 2 you've heard before?

A. I -- there was a lot of noise. I remember hearing some
beeping in the background, but there again I have a earpiece
hooked up to my phone. A lot of things happened at the same time.
I just knew something was going on in the wheelhouse. As far as
what alarm was going off, I don't know.

8 Q. And Captain Nadeau had stated that he had experienced a loss 9 of port control. Do you know what that means? Alarm -- loss of 10 port control alarm?

11 No, I'm not familiar with what, what he means there. Α. I mean, 12 if he said he, he, he lost propulsion I would know what he meant 13 by propulsion or if he told me, hey, I just lost my port pain or 14 my starboard main or, or whatever I would know it. If I'm down there and the power goes off I figure he's probably lost the 15 16 generator. But that's -- I'm usually not up in the wheelhouse 17 when -- I mean my -- the big job I have is trying to take care of 18 all the people down below and make sure our people do their job. 19 So when you went down to the engine room after Mr. Bracey, Q. 20 were the engines running at that point?

A. They appeared to be running to me, but I did not go in because like I say, we opened the door we had a lot of pressure from the engine room out. Bryan had informed me, yes, the fire is back in the, the port quarter, the stern. I know in my mind anytime you open up a door to a enclosed area like that with a

> FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

1	fire you're, you're feeding it, and my job was to, A, the safest
2	thing right now we know we have a fire. We don't have OBAs. I
3	don't have a face mask. I don't have any protection to get in
4	there to check it, let alone fight it. And we've, we've had
5	numbers of Norfolk fire department people work with us and over
6	the years they've told us if you, if you have an enclosed space, a
7	confined space fire that you have no way to get in, what you want
8	to do is try to maintain that in one spot and block it off. And
9	the second time we opened up the door I told Bryan, I says,
10	"Bryan, just dog the door down. That's all we can do right now is
11	close it."
12	Q. Prior to you getting to the door and opening the door, in a
13	normal situation can you hear the engines running outside of the
14	engine space?
15	A. Normally not, but not and especially not if you have
16	ventilation fans running.
17	Q. And prior to your entering in did you don hearing protection?
18	A. No. We have, we have no protection outside of the engine
19	room.
20	Q. Prior to entering into the engine room do you normally put on
21	hearing protection before you go in?
22	A. Oh, hearing protection.
23	Q. Yes, yes.
24	A. Yes sir.
25	Q. And on the 7th prior to you going in to, to look into the
	FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

	24
tion?	
down there and they	were
t down there I asked	him,
he had already opene	d
ire back into the por	t
to put ear protection	on
?	

9 A. Was what?

at that time.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

Ο.

Α.

10 Q. Do you remember if Mr. Bracey and the other individual with 11 him were wearing hearing protection?

And

12 A. I don't remember if they had it or not.

engine room did you put on hearing protec

already at the door. And as soon as I go

the door and told me, told me we have a f

quarter. There was no, no reason for me

I said what, what the situation was.

I didn't because I was second person

Were they wearing hearing protection

13 Q. During the evacuation what orders did you receive from the 14 captain?

15 A. What words did I --

16 Q. Orders, orders did you receive from the captain?

17 Oh, receive. The captain put the word out that we needed to Α. 18 make sure we started getting our, our guests off the main decks. 19 I was out on the bow for a while getting the lines hooked up, so I 20 wasn't -- and the tug was spraying water on us. I lost radio real 21 quick, so I don't know what may have transpired at that point. Ι 22 just remember when I came back in that the word had already gotten 23 out that the wait staff to get the people up to the third deck and 24 Candi (ph.) had already, had already started that process. 25 You also mentioned earlier in your, in your previous Ο.

testimony, Exhibit 72 which was your previous testimony back in
 June, that you were also responsible for ordering parts for
 maintenance.
 A. Normal what we call routine maintenance like oil. I don't do

5 anything as far as ordering parts for breakdowns on mains and generators. I order things like filters for the AC units, our 6 7 filters for the, for the generators for instance. I order those 8 things. That's the extent of my ordering on, on machinery blame. 9 Ο. (Indiscernible) on that exhibit. It was 71 so it's the 10 transcripts. So you, just to paraphrase what you just said, you, 11 you only order -- you're responsible for ordering parts for 12 general maintenance, correct?

- 13 A. Yes, sir.
- 14 Q. And how do you know when to order those parts?
- 15 A. How do I know when to order them?
- 16 Q. Yep.

A. We have a set schedule at 250 hours on oil changes, on generators and, and mains. And we keep a tab of that up in the, up in the wheelhouse and also in the engine room so that when we get to a particular point in our cruising schedule we get within, say, 10 or 15 hours that's when we start making sure we have all of our parts to do our 250-hour check.

Q. So you guys are pretty standard on when you want to do yourmaintenance to your engines.

25 A. Yes, sir.

	26
1	Q. Is there ever a time that you do it just as a precaution, do
2	it earlier?
3	A. Yes. Couple of years ago we had training with the US Navy,
4	and we were going to be out, like, three or four days and it was
5	getting close to a certain point in time while we're out there we
6	may need to, so I did the oil changes early.
7	Q. Okay.
8	A. This was with the captain's knowledge, asking him, you know,
9	"You think it's going to be okay to do?" He said, "Yeah, I would
10	rather us do it then than be out there during our training session
11	and not being able to do it.
12	Q. Okay. Have you ever ordered parts that is not for
13	maintenance? Have you ordered parts that is for a replacement
14	part?
15	A. No. Usually those things are done by the captain.
16	Q. And as the lead, I'd use the term engineer, as the lead
17	person in charge of maintenance and taking care of the engines
18	does he make you aware of when he's ordering parts?
19	A. Oh, sure. We, we, we Ryan and I have worked close
20	together for quite a few years so he, he keeps me involved with
21	things that, that he may have to order just to let me know that
22	it's been that he's doing his part. And when I need to order
23	my stuff I'll let him know that I've ordered things.
24	Q. Okay. With regards to the recent overhaul of the engine
25	where the a recommendation was made to replace the inboard
	FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

1	turbocharger, were you ever made aware of when he ordered the
2	turbocharger?
3	A. No. I was there when they were doing the breakdowns and I
4	did hear them say something about turbos, but that's way out of
5	my, my jurisdiction. Once they get to the part of breaking down
6	engines and generators my, my job is pretty well over.
7	Q. Is the ordering in your experience has the ordering of
8	parts ever been significant say, six days after a
9	recommendation was made to order the part?
10	A. I'll have to admit that with two operation captains, or maybe
11	three we've had, normally when things are told us that we, that we
12	need to get it it's done as expeditious as we can. And I don't
13	know that anyone says, well, I'm not going to worry about it.
14	We'll do it later. Our reputation amongst a lot of the ships in
15	the Hornblower Group is that we have always really taken care of
16	making sure we maintain our gear, that we don't slack off on it.
17	Q. Were you aware of the work that was conducted on the port
18	main engine from the 15th through the 26th by Bay Diesel?
19	A. Only time I heard about it was when I came back on Monday and
20	they had, they had already started working on it. So I know they
21	were working on the port main, but that's just that's as much
22	as I knew.
23	Q. On the 26th, Bay Diesel had made a recommendation on their
24	technical report to have the crew keep the eye on the right bank
25	turbo until the replacement has come in.

FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

	28
1	A. Word had come down that they wanted us to just maintain our
2	watchfulness on all of, on all of them, but anytime we've had
3	problems with mains or generators it's, at least for the senior
4	people, we know we're going to watch it anyway. They don't have
5	to tell us. We're going to, we're going to be watching it because
6	you can say today it's fixed but it doesn't mean it's going to be
7	working tomorrow. So we're always in the mode of, of checking
8	every day.
9	Q. And that, that would come from who?
10	A. (Indiscernible).
11	Q. Understood. Did you receive an order to specifically keep an
12	eye on the right bank turbo after the 26th of
13	A. No, we didn't receive anything saying keep your eye on the
14	right turbo, no. The thing that came to me was I reported on, on
15	Monday this episode with the coolant happened somewhere over the
16	weekend. I wasn't there. And the word was they would just
17	we'd just watch and make sure everything's all right on the
18	engines since we've had work on it.
19	Q. Thank you. I have no further questions.
20	CDR WADDINGTON: Okay. Mr. do you have any questions
21	for this witness?
22	MR. I do, Commander.
23	BY MR.
24	Q. Mr. Enloe, so you were there when they, they had already
25	started the rebuild?
	FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

1 Yes, sir. I was there when they got it up and running, and Α. 2 I'm pretty sure I was there when the -- when we took it out for 3 sea trial. 4 Were you there when they refitted the engines previously from Ο. 5 the 3400 CATs to the Skandias? 6 Yes, sir. Α. 7 Was there anything particular that you guys kept an eye on 0. 8 after they did that change out? We had been told that these were a lot more horsepower 9 Α. No. 10 engines, not that they might have been more reliable but just said 11 that we were going to have stronger engines and that there was no 12 word given to us on, hey, keep an eye on anything. We were just 13 glad we got new engines. 14 So after they did the rebuild did you guys do anything in 0. 15 addition to what you normally do for your engine room rounds after 16 that? 17 No, sir. It made things a little bit easier because of these Α. engines being different, completely different than our CAT --18 19 Caterpillar engines we had. Made it a little bit easier on the 20 guys doing some of our checks, but we still did the same. In 21 fact, we probably wound up getting a few more additional checks 22 because of those new engines we got. 23 So you'd consider doing a rebuild let's say a major, major Ο. 24 maintenance or a major repair for the engine? 25 The, the rebuild --Α. FREE STATE REPORTING, INC.

Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

30 MR. DENLEY: I'm going to object. I think --1 2 THE WITNESS: I wasn't --3 I think I want to object to the question. MR. DENLEY: Ι 4 think the testimony has been pretty clear that Captain Nadeau was 5 responsible for the, for the overhaul. And Mr. Enloe testified 6 that he wasn't, wasn't part of it, so I guess I would object based 7 on relevance and the testimony is already in the record. 8 CDR WADDINGTON: Objection noted. Mr. can you either 9 rephrase or continue on it? 10 MR. DENLEY: And it also calls for him to speculate on 11 something that he wasn't -- that he's already testified that he 12 wasn't involved in, so I guess we can throw that in there as well. 13 BY MR. 14 Again, so after Bay Diesel came in and did the rebuild 0. Okay. 15 on the engines did you do anything differently in your rounds than 16 you had done previously before they did the rebuild? 17 No, sir. Α. 18 That's all the questions I have. Thanks, Mr. MR. 19 Enloe. 20 THE WITNESS: Okay. 21 NTSB, do you have any questions for this CDR WADDINGTON: 22 witness? 23 MR. KARR: Yes. Thank you, Commander. 24 BY MR. KARR: 25 Mike Karr with the NTSB. Mr. Enloe, back on June 7th when Ο. FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

1 you peered into the engine room can you describe -- and if you saw 2 any flames at either time you opened up the doors or someone 3 opened the doors? 4 I, I did not you see it because when we opened up the door 5 all I got was a blast of hot, smoky air in my face. Heat was just 6 coming right out. I had asked Bryan, who was there at the door 7 first, and he said, "Oh, I saw it." He said -- well, I guess he 8 opened up the door wider. He said it's back in the port, the port 9 quarter. 10 All right. And how far behind him were you standing when you 0. 11 got hit with that heat? 12 I was right behind him when I first came down to the engine Α. 13 room, so within a foot or so of where he was at. 14 All right, thank you. Ο. He was, he was at the, the door, had already had the door 15 Α. 16 undogged and everything when I got down there. 17 All right, thank you. On the engine -- on the round that you Ο. did in the morning of June 7th, did you by chance check the oil 18 19 level in the port engine? 20 Α. Yes, sir. We check, we check oil and transmission level. 21 All right. And where is the oil level dipstick or -- and the Ο. 22 transmission oil located? 23 Well, the dipstick for the oil is on the inboard side about Α. 24 halfway down. The transmission dipstick is on the back behind the 25 engine on top of the transmission. FREE STATE REPORTING, INC.

Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

	32
1	Q. All right. So when you said on the inboard side so it would
2	the dipstick was on the center, more towards the center line of
3	the vessel rather than on the outside of the, outside of the port
4	engine?
5	A. It, it would be about half and half on top of the
6	transmission casing is where your dipstick is for your
7	transmission.
8	Q. And what about the lubrication oil?
9	A. Lube oil is, is about halfway back from the front of the
10	engine down about maybe a foot and a a foot or so off the deck.
11	Q. Off the deck but if I'm facing the bow
12	A. Yeah, it's on the inboard side.
13	Q. And, and when you say inboard so towards the keel?
14	A. Yes, sir.
15	Q. All right, thank you. And I would ask that we put up Number
16	84, Exhibit 8 Coast Guard Exhibit 84? And the, the bottom
17	picture if you could expand that? So Mr. Enloe, these are this
18	photograph I'm showing you is from a surveyor's photograph of the
19	day before and there are cardboard boxes and totes in that
20	picture. Can you remember if they were there on the morning of
21	the 7th when you did you round in the engine room?
22	A. Yes, sir. The box right in the front is a water pump. The
23	box over on the right that you see is also a water pump. We have
24	couple of different sizes of water pumps and we don't have
25	anywhere on the boat other than stacking them outside somewhere
	FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

	33
1	that we can maintain these. We don't have a big warehouse or
2	anything so a lot of our spares are put down into the engine room
3	in an area where at least we can get by the engines and generators
4	to, to look at them.
5	Q. Yeah. And those shelves all have those shelves for
6	containers always been there?
7	A. About five years ago we replaced the shelving itself, but
8	we've always had shelves there and we've always kept our spares
9	there.
10	Q. All right, thank you. That's all I have.
11	CDR WADDINGTON: Bay Diesel, do you have any questions for
12	this?
13	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: No (indiscernible).
14	CDR WADDINGTON: City Cruises?
15	MR. DENLEY: I do.
16	BY MR. DENLEY:
17	Q. I've I have a couple of questions for you, Mr. Enloe. You
18	commented that you have some firefighters that are part of the
19	ship's crew?
20	A. Right now we only have one part-time firefighter as a, as a
21	part-time captain, and we have a part our other full-time
22	captain is a retired firefighter.
23	Q. And in years past you've had firefighters that have been part
24	of your crew?
25	A. We have always tried to have firefighters as part of our
	FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

1	crew, but to, to my knowledge that's very, very, very rare that
2	you can get a firefighter to become part of it. We have another
3	young guy that's a firefighter, and I understand he may be coming
4	back to work for us again.
5	Q. And is this part of
6	A. And it's
7	Q. Mr. Enloe, excuse me, I'm sorry to interrupt. Can you just
8	move closer, the speaker closer?
9	A. I'm sorry.
10	Q. Thank you very much.
11	A. Yes, sir.
12	Q. And so if it I guess it doesn't really matter who they
13	are, if they're firefighters or not. They're, they're part of
14	training.
15	A. We train on how to get into open spaces. It's hard to do
16	real world training on an enclosed space if there's nothing in
17	there. I mean, you can take an extinguisher in there or you can
18	drag a fire hose in there, but it's not real world. And to me,
19	being aboard two aircraft carriers in the Navy, we trained on
20	trying to do enclosed space firefighting even though we weren't
21	firefighters. But they, they made sure you had your oxygen
22	breathing apparatus. We had glass. We had helmets. We had
23	everything.
24	Q. Sure.
25	A. And that's, that's the difference.
	FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

1	Q. So as part of your Navy training you've obviously done some
2	training in, in shipboard firefighting, and I believe you talked
3	about it. What is the concept of containment when it comes to
4	fighting fire onboard a ship?
5	A. Well, to me containment is to make sure the fire doesn't
6	spread. You, you, you want to try to hold it in one spot until
7	actual firefighting people, professional firefighting people can
8	come in there and, and take over.
9	Q. And if you contained it in one spot you could presumably cool
10	the boundaries?
11	A. If, if yeah. If everything's hot that's when you could
12	use your, your wash down or your firehose to really keep it warm.
13	But we, we checked. There was no, there was no residual heat
14	coming through our, our bulkhead there.
15	Q. And so the concept is, you know, essentially you, you, you
16	contain it in one space so that it doesn't spread to the rest of
17	the ship. Is that true?
18	A. That was, that was the idea. We had a lot of little people
19	and along with their parents, and my idea was, hey, I'm not sure
20	what it's going to take to put it out, but the main thing is is to
21	try to control it just so we don't have to worry about it while
22	we're dealing with our, our guests on here.
23	Q. And did you actually see that the watertight door between the
24	galley and the engine room, did you actually see that door close?
25	A. The door between the engine room and the galley was locked
	FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

when they first got down there. It was not -- it wasn't locked. It was, it was dogged when we got down there. And when we got, got ready to come out of it I made sure that the galley door or the engine door was dogged back down.

5 Q. Fully dogged.

6 A. Mm-hm.

7 Q. Which means -- what, what does it mean if it --

8 A. Well, we have a, we have a big wheel with about six or eight 9 spokes, about six or eight spokes and you take and you turn it as 10 tight as you can and that seals the, the room off.

11 I believe it was Lieutenant was asking you Ο. Okay. 12 about preventive maintenance and preventive maintenance programs 13 and preventive maintenance items. So going back to the engine 14 rebuild on the port main diesel engine, after that engine had been 15 rebuilt and put back into service at the end of May were there any 16 preventive maintenance items to do in between the engine being put 17 back, back into service and the, the fire on June 7th? Once, once it was put back into service and we were 18 No. Α. 19 operating as normal the only things we did was to keep an eye on 20 it for our oil changes. That's every 250 hours. It doesn't 21 matter if you've had the engine rebuilt or not. We still maintain 22 our, our operational readiness program for oil changes and keep an 23 eye on coolant, keep an eye on anything that you feel maybe that 24 need to be looked at every, every day.

25 Q. And kind of going back to the, the date of the incident, did

FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

	37
1	you actually see the, the transfer of, of guests from the Spirit
2	of Norfolk to the Victory Rover?
3	A. I was up on the first deck after I came back off of the, the
4	bow and helped to get the PFDs, the flotation devices handed over
5	so that the people waiting at the door could make sure our guests
б	had them on prior to them stepping over to the Rover.
7	Q. And then you, you actually got on the Rover as well.
8	A. Yes, sir. I, I was the last person off the boat.
9	Q. And as unfortunate as this incident was, are you aware that -
10	- of anybody being hurt or injured during that process?
11	A. No. I wasn't aware of anyone getting hurt. No one seemed to
12	be overexcited. I think our wait staff did a great job of keeping
13	the calm. And the, the kids, of course, I think thought it was a
14	big adventure.
15	MR. DENLEY: I don't have any further questions, thank you.
16	CDR WADDINGTON: Lieutenant do you have any follow-up
17	questions?
18	BY LCDR
19	Q. I just have one follow-up question. Earlier I asked you
20	about hazards in the engine room and when you, you know, training
21	your members to become designated as senior crew members. What
22	type of hazards do you teach them about in the engine room?
23	A. Tripping. It's a very big hazard entering a machinery space.
24	Being cut. We do have things down there that, you know, you, you
25	hit it just right you're going to hurt your hand, your foot, kick
	FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

1 it, your knees, whatever. The main thing is we try to make sure 2 people understand that you've got to look at every part of the engines and generator when you're checking them. You can't just 3 4 look at your gauges and turn and walk off. Hazard-wise from that 5 there's not a lot that you can get yourself tangled up with on the 6 engines and generator because any belts are out of the way. 7 There's nothing really that you can catch yourself on. I, I do 8 tell them about leaning back checking your bilges, your sump pumps where your shafts are. There have been cases I understand where 9 10 people with long hair have somehow managed to get their hair 11 caught in something. That's, that's a general hazard, not just 12 the hair but your clothing. You don't want to wear a lot of loose 13 clothes when you're working around shafts that may be turning. So 14 those are, those are just the general things that I go through 15 when I'm down there.

16 Those are all very, very important. What about hazards for 0. 17 vessel safety and fire prevention? Are there any things that you discuss with them regarding fire prevention and vessel safety? 18 19 We, we talk about safety and preventing things is, is Α. No. 20 one of the big deals we, we look at every day of a cruise we have 21 people in now that, that machinery space. And the idea is to get 22 them to look at everything. There can be five or ten things that 23 might possibly have caused a problem if you're not aware of what 24 you're doing, but we don't let people go down there if they don't 25 know what they're doing. And we certainly don't let them go down

	39
1	there by themselves, especially when they're new people.
2	Q. Thank you very much.
3	CDR WADDINGTON: Mr. Karr, do you have follow-up?
4	BY MR. KARR:
5	Q. Yes. Hi, Mike Karr with the NTSB. Mr. Enloe, with regard to
6	hazards can you describe any hotspots that you recall on any of
7	the main engines on the Spirit of Norfolk?
8	A. The only ones that I do on the Norfolk are you don't want to
9	reach and grab hold of the turbos. And that's (indiscernible)
10	them. That's the only thing as far as hot. You can put your
11	hands on parts of the engine and they may be warm, but you're not
12	going to it's not going to burn you there. I think the big
13	thing is that as long as you show people and make them understand
14	that engines are not playthings, that they have to watch when
15	they're around them, that should you know, people are clueless
16	as to what not to do. We don't try to beat up on things in the
17	engine room on mains or generator. We try to do, do whatever we
18	can to, to make sure that we don't contact them in the wrong way.
19	I don't think there's anyone gets mad or anything about something
20	that they feel maybe they had a problem with, but that's part of
21	our overall training is to make them understand that they're part
22	of a big team. If you got a problem, talk about it. And we
23	don't, we don't take it out on our machinery spaces.
24	Q. All right. Thank you, sir.
25	CDR WADDINGTON: Mr. Enloe, you are now released as a witness
	FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

	40
1	at this formal hearing. Thank you for your testimony and your
2	cooperation. If I later determine that this team needs additional
3	information from you, I will contact you through your counsel. If
4	you have any questions about this investigation, you may contact
5	the investigation recorder, Lieutenant Constant The time is
6	3:33. We will reconvene at 3:45. Thank you.
7	(Whereupon, at 3:33 p.m., the interview was concluded.)
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
	FREE STATE REPORTING, INC. Court Reporting Transcription D.C. Area 301-261-1902 Balt. & Annap. 410-974-0947

CERTIFICATE

This is to certify that the attached proceeding before the

NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD

IN THE MATTER OF: FIRE ONBOARD SPIRIT OF NORFOLK NEAR NORFOLK NAVAL STATION, VIRGINIA ON JUNE 7, 2022 Interview of Robert Enloe

ACCIDENT NO.: DCA22FM022

PLACE: Virginia Beach, Virginia

DATE: January 27, 2023

was held according to the record, and that this is the original, complete, true and accurate transcript which has been transcribed to the best of my skill and ability.

110

Teresa Holevas Transcriber