

MEMORANDUM FOR RECORD

Douglass Brazy Air Safety Investigator Eastern Region Aviation

March 15, 2022

Subject: NTSB investigation ERA22LA138, N7943Y, Piper PA-30, February 28, 2022, Farmingdale, New York

Information provided by Pilot Warren Wylie and Designated Pilot Examiner David Windmiller

On February 28, 2022, Mr. David Windmiller provided the following information to FAA Inspector Mahesh Gupta, in an email:

Dear Gentlemen.

As per request the following is what took place today regarding N7943Y.

Approximately two weeks ago I was contacted by a gentleman from New Jersey, Warren Wylie, looking for a Checkride for a Multi add on to a Commercial certificate in a PA-30. I agreed to do this provided I was emailed the last 2 annual inspections on the aircraft in order to see the history on a 50+ year old airplane. The records looked good and I scheduled the checkride for this morning out of Atlantic ay FRG. The Plane looked quite good on my quick walk around after the recommending instructor and the applicant arrived. We proceeded to start the checkride. He did very well on the oral, maybe even above average. We went out to the airplane and did a complete preflight, with nothing abnormal. The flight was quite good again better then average. We completed all of the required tasks out east and had made one landing after the instrument approach to RWY 06, with a circle to land on Rwy 24 at HWV, (33 was notamed closed). We had cycled the gear numerous times during the checkride. Unfortunately the only gear down indicator on this older aircraft is one green light to the left of the gear handle. It is not visible from the right seat. Warren would hold his hand on the lever each cycle then say gear down. We were nearly complete with the checkride missing a short field and normal landing. He asked the tower at FRG for 1 touch and go followed by a full stop. We were cleared for a T&G with left traffic. Warren used the before landing checklist, then once again put the gear handle to the down position blocking the light but said gear down then removed his hand from the knob. The landing was right on par with a touchdown on the 1000' marker right on the centerline. At touchdown it was quite obvious that the landing gear was not down. Upon reaching a stop on the runway there was some smoke coming through the floorboards on the pilot's side. Warren was extremely upset and kept saying but I put the gear down! Upon opening the door and realizing the smoke stopped, I took out my phone and took a number of photos. The gear lever

was in the down position. It took a while to find the circuit breaker for the gear as it is buried under a floor panel, and the Landing Gear Motor 30 amp breaker was tripped. I will include the photo with this email. There were no injuries and we stayed with the airplane until it was recovered, then went back to Atlantic to meet with the FAA inspectors.

Sincerely,

David Windmiller





On March 15, 2022, the pilot, Warren Wylie, provided the following statement to the NTSB in an email attachment:

Warren J Wylie III 3/2/2022

Montague, NJ 07827

Certificate number

To whom it may concern,

This is my statement regarding the gear up landing incident that occurred during my multi engine checkride on 2/28/2022.

Reason for flight: Multi engine add on check-ride Designated Practical Examiner: David Windmiller

Date of check ride: 2/28/2022

Location: Farmingdale Airport KFRG, Runway 32

Aircraft: 1966 Piper PA-30 Twin Comanche N7943Y S/N 30-1036

On the morning of the check ride, I arrived at KFRG with my instructor David Cardadeiro in the 1966 Piper PA-30 Twin Comanche. We met with the DPE, Mr. Windmiller at the Atlantic Aviation FBO at about 0930. After the oral examination was completed, Mr. Windmiller and I walked out to the airplane and after preflight we started up. I then obtained the ATIS at KFRG and asked for a taxi clearance. Once cleared, I taxied to the run-up area and performed a normal, preflight engine run-up. Everything checked out. We then departed KFRG on runway 1 and after a simulated loss of engine on takeoff roll, I recovered and continued the flight to the southeast. Once enroute to Brookhaven KHWV, we performed a single engine approach to runway 6. We then entered the left downwind for runway 24 and made a crosswind, full stop, single engine landing and taxied back to runway 24. Next, I was asked to perform a soft field takeoff on 24 with heavy crosswind from the right. We climbed up and performed some maneuvers including several gear cycles to simulate different stages of flight. We did these maneuvers over and between KHWV and Calverton before heading back to land at KFRG.

While enroute to KFRG, I obtained ATIS Delta and called the tower while over the Twin Span Bridge. KFRG tower advised that there were aircraft in front of us and we were #2 to the field and requested that we join final for a straight in runway 32. I told Mr. Windmiller that we were going to be approaching too fast and this would conflict with traffic ahead. I said I would like to do a 360 for spacing.

Mr. Windmiller advised that this was not a good idea because there was traffic behind us. He said "if it were him, he'd be doing s turns". So, I started to make "s turns" to create spacing for the landing traffic ahead of us. During these "s turn maneuvers" I also ran through the normal landing checklist:

Fuel pumps on

Fuel on the main tanks

Called out "gear down" as I switched the landing gear selector to down position

Flaps down

Mixtures full forward

Props full forward about 500agl

Mr. Windmiller then continued by saying, "I wouldn't reduce the power that much, we're going to get behind the power curve and sink." I heeded his direction.

During this unstable approach, my attention was divided between obliging the DPE's

advisements, slower traffic ahead of us, traffic behind, and listening to be possibly given a go around due to poor spacing. In addition, due to the flight being a check ride, I was expecting at any moment to get a simulated engine loss as well.

During the entire approach I never saw the amber "gear up warning light". This is possibly due to - from what I've been told - an intermittent issue with the light extinguishing during low power settings. We regularly test this light in the preflight procedure and on this flight, it was found to be operational. I also never heard a "gear warning horn".

I then reduced throttles from near idle to full idle and landed. Upon touchdown, it became apparent that the landing gear did not come down. In disbelief, I exclaimed to Mr. Windmiller "THE GEAR IS DOWN, I KNOW I PUT IT DOWN!" He agreed and said that he too verified the switch was in the down position on final.

After the aircraft came to rest on runway 32 at KFRG, I shut the master switch off, fuel pumps off, and mixtures to cut off. Mr. Windmiller and I then exited the aircraft. After verifying our safety, we looked in to see why the landing gear had not come down. Mr. Windmiller was looking for the location of the breakers. I told him that the circuit breakers for the gear are located below a panel to the left of the copilot's feet. He lifted the cover and we both saw the tripped breaker. My first reaction after touchdown was that "the gear is down, I know I put it down, what the...."

Mr. Windmiller agreed that he too saw the switch was in the down position on final approach. My thoughts are that the gear may have overheated during the cycles we did over KHWV. These gear cycles occurred about 5-10 minutes prior to our approach into KFRG. I am not certain on the number of gear cycles, but it was more than would be in a normal flight around a traffic pattern.

In conclusion, I am confident beyond any shadow of doubt of the following:

I tested the amber and green lights during preflight.

I put the gear lever down during the approach

I checked that the gear lever was down prior to landing.

I did not see the amber warning light on short final.

I never heard a gear warning horn during the approach.

Respectfully,

Warren Wylie

