Attachment 24

To Operations Group Factual Report

DCA15FA085

Crew Statements of Preceding Flights

Statement regarding United Airlines Flight 694
ORD-LGA, March 5, 2015

At the request of the NTSB I am providing the details of our approach and landing at LGA in reference to the Delta incident of the same day. I was the Captain and pilot flying for flight 694. We departed ORD for LGA with marginal conditions forecast at LGA and enough fuel for holding and two alternates, BOS and ALB. Both alternates were experiencing good weather and LGA was forecast for low visibility (1/4 mile), with snowy and windy conditions. Before the arrival we contacted Dispatch via ACARS to get surface conditions and RVR readings for all runways. Dispatch sent us a surface conditions report with good braking action and visibility better than 1/4 mile. We reviewed the approaches and airport information as well as analyzing the landing performance data for multiple runways including the landing runway, 13. We were sent to holding while the field was closed due to deteriorating weather conditions, and the need for plowing, sanding and preparing the runways. We entered holding with approximately 12,200 pounds of fuel and determined our bingo point for ALB at 8,0000. We later informed approach that we were approaching bingo fuel and either needed to land soon or divert to ALB. Approach contacted Tower and we were told they were opening the field and received vectors for the approach. Another United Airbus declared minimum fuel and was placed ahead of us on the approach.

We commenced the approach with tower reports of 6000 RVR touchdown and 3500 RVR roll out. Briefed and planned an ILS 13 approach, full flaps, medium auto-brakes, using the flight directors and autopilot to minimums or breakout of weather. Previous Airbus reported braking as medium on touchdown and poor at roll out. We planned to touchdown firmly at 1000-1500 feet down the runway and exit at taxiway M. We encountered a quartering tailwind of approximately 25 knots until 1000 ft AGL and then a crosswind from the left at 12-15 knots. Tower delayed our landing clearance until approximately 500 ft. AGL because a vehicle was inspecting the runway. Obtained ground contact at around 500 ft. AGL, and broke out at 300 ft. AGL. Disconnected the autopilot upon runway acquisition and landed firmly approximately 1200 feet down the runway on center line, de-crabbed. The thrust reversers were deployed, spoilers extended and the auto-brakes became activated and engaged. I disconnected the auto-brakes at approximately 80 knots and tested the braking action which was good. We experienced normal deceleration and directional control during the landing rollout. Exited at taxiway M and tower requested a braking report. We reported good braking. Exiting the runway we encountered poor braking on the taxiways and proceed slowly to the gate. Overall, it was a routine and safe approach and landing in challenging weather conditions.

Captain Steve Sanner

Statement regarding United Airlines Flight 694
ORD-LGA, March 5, 2015

At the request of the NTSB I am providing the details of our approach and landing at LGA in reference to Delta flight #1086 of the same day. While at the gate I made a comment to the Captain that this flight should probably be cancelled. We looked at the forecast again and decided that the weather looked like it would improve as the day progressed and felt it would be a safe operation. This was the Captain's leg and we departed ORD for LGA with marginal conditions forecast at LGA and enough fuel for holding and two alternates, BOS and ALB. Both alternates were experiencing good weather and LGA was forecasted for low visibility (1/4 mile), with snowy and windy conditions. Before the arrival we contacted Dispatch via ACARS to get surface conditions and RVR readings for all runways. Dispatch sent us a surface conditions report with good braking action and visibility better than 1/4 mile. We reviewed the approaches and airport information as well as analyzed the landing performance data for multiple runways including the landing runway, 13. We were sent to holding while the field was closed due to deteriorating weather conditions, and the need for plowing the runways.

We entered holding with approx. 12,200 pounds of fuel and determined our bingo point for ALB at 8,000. We held for approximately 45 minutes and informed approach that we were approaching bingo fuel and either needed to land soon or divert to ALB. During the hold we talked at length about planting the aircraft on the runway at 1000-1500 feet down the runway to get the tires spinning. I told the Captain my history of owning a flight school in Michigan and flying freight and charter in the Midwest. We both shared stories about landing on icy runways and technique. It was apparent that we both had extensive winter operations experience well before being hired by United. Approach contacted Tower and we were told they were opening the field and received vectors for the approach. Another United Airbus declared minimum fuel and was placed ahead of us on the approach. We were happy about this as they would give the braking action since they were the first landing after the airport was reopened. We commenced the approach with tower reports of 6000RVR touchdown and 3500RVR roll out. Briefed and planned an ILS 13 approach, full flaps, medium auto-brakes, using the flight directors and autopilot to minimums or breakout of weather. Previous Airbus reported braking as medium on touchdown and poor at roll out. Once cleared for the approach we knew that it was going to be a challenging landing but felt it was nothing we could not handle. We encountered a quartering tailwind of approximately 25 knots until 1000 ft AGL and then a crosswind from the left at 12-15 knots. Tower delayed our landing clearance until approximately 500 ft AGL because a vehicle was inspecting the runway. Obtained ground contact at around 500 ft AGL, and broke out at 300 ft AGL.

The Captain disconnected the autopilot upon runway acquisition and landed firmly approximately 1200 feet down the runway on center line, de-crabbed. The thrust reversers were deployed, spoilers extended and the auto-brakes became activated and engaged. The Captain disconnected the auto-brakes at approximately 80 knots and tested the braking action which was good. We experienced normal deceleration and directional control during the landing rollout. Exited at taxiway M and tower requested a braking report. I noted that we could have made the earlier high speed L had it been a dry day. The high speeds looked like they were snow covered and would not have the braking action that the runways had. I gave two reports to the tower, braking action good in the touchdown and good in the roll out. Exiting the runway we encountered poor braking on the taxiways and proceeded slowly to the gate. During the taxi in, we commented on the weather deteriorating even since our landing. It appeared that the snow intensity was increasing and visibility was coming down. Overall, it was a safe approach and landing in challenging weather conditions, the Captain did a fantastic job!

First Officer Eric Braun

[redacted]

Tuesday, March 10, 2015 Home / New Debrief | Logout

[redacted]

[redacted]: +Delta 1086 Accident

Flight #	**3647**	Phase of Trip	**At the Gate**	Pilot	**EGGEN RA, ROBERT**
Flight Date	**3/5/2015**	Affected STA	**LGA**	Employee #	[redacted]
DEP Time	**07:09 AM**	Diversion?	**No**	Pilot Data	**JFK-CA-CRJ-D**
DEP STA	**STL**	ARV STA	**LGA**	Debrief Type	**Pipeline**
DEP Gate	**C12**	ARV Gate	**C8**	Sub-Type	**COMPLIANCE**
Tail Nbr	**N518**			Workflow	**Pipeline**
Fleet Type	**CRJ**			Reply Requested?	**Yes**

Status

NEW ▸ FYI ▸ PLEASE REPLY ▸ **REPLIED** ▸ AUTO-CLOSED ▸ CLOSED ▸

[redacted]

One Line Summary +Delta 1086 Accident

Event Description

ENY3647
STL-LGA
7:09am-11:02am
My name is Robert Eggen and I was the Captain on ENY3647 on 3/15/15. As we approached LGA we were instructed to hold at PROUD intersection as published for runway snow removal. We entered the hold at PROUD and held there for several circuits. I would estimate our holding time to be about 45 minutes. While in the hold we were given multiple different EFC Times and we were continually evaluating our fuel situation. When it became apparent that we were about 15 minutes from our 'bingo' fuel, we advised ATC of our situation. About 5 minutes later ATC advised us that LGA was open and we were given a vector for ILS 13. Shortly after we were given our vector, ATC called us to advise that braking action was poor and wanted to know if we could accept. At this point we advised ATC to standby while we evaluated our landing performance charts. After reviewing our performance the FO and I decided to decline an approach with poor braking action. Shortly after we advised ATC of this, they came back and said that braking action had been reported as good by a previous landing aircraft. With a report of good braking action we decided to continue with the approach.
We were then cleared for the ILS approach to RWY 13 via radar vectors. As I recall, we got the runway in sight at around 400 feet. The runway had a light dusting of snow, but was clearly visible. We experienced a normal touch down with a slight crosswind from the right. I quickly applied medium braking and maximum thrust reverse. The ground spoilers were in AUTO and deployed normally. I never experienced any skidding or loss of directional control of the aircraft. At around 80 knots I reduced the thrust reverse from maximum to idle. Braking action appeared to be GOOD as was reported by the previous arriving airbus. If I recall correctly the RVR was greater than 6,000 on touch down and 3,000 on roll out.
We exited RWY 13 at taxiway V. The taxiways were not as clear as the runway but braking was still okay. We then taxied the aircraft to the gate where we parked normally.
Robert Eggen
CA Envoy Airlines
[redacted]

[redacted]

[redacted]

Message History

Internal Admin Notes

Internal Memorandum

Date: 3/09/2015

To: Captain Chris Frederick, Managing Director and Chief Pilot – ATL

From: Captain Luke Calvin Hagler, ATL MD88

Subject: II15-038 – DAL1526 MD-88 05MAR15 MCO-LGA,
CAP: HAGLER, L.C., [redacted], FO: KLUSE, M.B., 0[redacted]

This statement is provided at the request of the Chief Pilot's Office.

We were holding at RBV on the KORRY arrival for about 45 minutes while the runway was being plowed. Air Traffic Control (ATC) cleared us back on the arrival for the ILS to 13. ATC then advised us that the braking action was poor. We informed ATC that we needed vectors to our alternate KBDL. As we were turning to the assigned heading, ATC said that an AIRBUS had just landed and reported braking action good. We told ATC that we would fly the approach.

The First Officer was flying the aircraft and handling appeared normal. The visibility was about 1 mile and the runway was snow covered. At touchdown, braking action was good. Further down the runway, the brakes anti-skid system was cycling. We used flaps 40, auto spoilers, thrust reversers, and max autobrakes. We landed in the touchdown zone and exited on M.

I acknowledge this statement may be release to the National Transportation Safety Board.

Regards,

Captain Luke Calvin Hagler
[redacted]
(Signature on file)

Internal Memorandum

Date: 3/10/2015

To: Captain Chris Frederick, Managing Director and Chief Pilot –ATL

From: First Officer Michael Bradley Kluse

Subject: II15-TBD – DAL1526 MD-88 05MAR15 MCO-LGA,
CAP: HAGLER, L.C., [redacted], FO: KLUSE, M.B., [redacted]

This statement is provided at the request of the Chief Pilot's Office.

On Thursday 5 March 15, I was operating as the First Officer on Delta Flight 1526 into LGA. We were flying the KORRY 3 arrival when we were told to hold at Robbinsville while Runway 13 at LGA was being plowed.

After approximately 45 minutes of holding, Air Traffic Control (ATC) told us that they were finished plowing the runway. At that point, they asked us if we could accept the runway with poor braking action. The Captain responded no and told ATC that we would like to divert to our alternate. ATC came back and told us the braking action was reported good. We then told ATC we would take vectors for the approach. ATC proceeded to vector us for the ILS to 13 at LGA.

I was pilot flying and I flew an autopilot and auto throttle coupled approach. We used flaps 40, armed the auto spoilers, and used max auto brakes. The visibility was approximately 1 sm. When we broke out of the weather, visibility was not an issue and we proceeded to land in the touchdown zone using max auto brakes, reverse thrust, and the auto spoilers. The landing was uneventful and the braking action was good in the touchdown zone. I had no controllability issues, the aircraft slowed as the max auto brakes, auto spoilers, and thrust reverses were applied.

As we slowed to make our turn off the runway to the taxiway, I came on the brakes manually at which time I felt the anti-skid cycling. At that point, I exchanged aircraft control with the Captain and he came on the brakes and steered the aircraft off the runway onto taxiway Mike and we proceeded to the gate. We did not use auto land, the runway was snow covered, and no unusual events occurred during the approach and landing.

I acknowledge this statement may be released to the **National Transportation Safety Board**.

Regards,

First Officer Michael B. Kluse
[redacted]
(Signature on file)