

Investigation Report

N31743 (DOA-5/24/2013@ 1710 local time)

On Sunday, May 26, 2013, this inspector interviewed Joan Dudley concerning the above referenced accident. According to Mrs. Dudley, she was outside her place of business at "Granny's Ice Cream Parlor" located at 2948 State Highway 29, Johnstown, NY 12095 which is actually positioned in the town of Ephratah, when at approximately 5:15pm she observed a twin engine airplane at a low altitude heading in a southwesterly direction toward the Garoga Reservoir. She indicated that the plane was missing the left wing and was banked with the missing wing toward the ground. She stated that she was able to identify the missing wing because the aircraft was at a steep bank. While observing the aircraft from her driveway, she heard a loud noise that sounded like an explosion that sounded like a "pop, pop, pop" as she watched it disappear behind the tree line at the rear of the neighbor's house across the street owned by Mr. Scott Orr. After observing the aircraft disappear behind the trees, she motioned for one of the workers in the ice cream parlor to call 911 and immediately ran across highway 29 to render aid to any possible victims. She mentioned that she is an EMT and thought she would be able to render assistance. Once across the road, she indicated she paused behind Scott Orr's house and yelled if anybody needed help. She stated that she thought she heard a female's voice, but could not be sure. Within a few minutes, first responders arrived on site and she returned to her business location.

Mrs. Dudley remembers that the aircraft was about 1000 feet above the ground and observed the missing wing on the left side of the airplane because of the unusual attitude of the aircraft. She further stated that she initially thought the aircraft was circling her business-Granny's Ice Cream Parlor.

Statement Taken by: Ronald J. Borrell, IIC, FAA Supervising Aviation Safety Inspector, Albany FSDO-01 on 5/26/2013.

Supporting Deposition

Fulton County Sheriff's Office
State of New York
County of Fulton
City of Johnstown

Case # FC-00761-13

Date: 5/31/13 Place: 2712 State Hwy 29 Time Started: 11:34 AM
I, Daniel Conrad am 51 years of age being born on 8/31/1961 at Alliance, OH. I reside at [REDACTED]
[REDACTED] Johnstown, NY. I am giving this statement to Investigator Bryan P.
Novak, a member of the Fulton County Sheriff's Office of my own free will without threats of
promise or favor.

Ques/BPN: Daniel, were you on the Garoga Dam on 5/24/13?

Ans/ DC: Yes, I was there with Randy Cossellman fishing from a canoe.

Ques/BPN: Did you witness anything while you were on the dam?

Ans/ DC: Yes, the plane blowing up.

Ques/BPN: What do you mean by "blowing up"?

Ans/ DC: It wasn't an actual explosion, there were no flames or smoke. We heard a loud whining noise like an engine at full throttle. I looked up and I could see an airplane. It looked like it was flying level at a constant height. At first we thought it was a radio controlled plane because it looked so small. As we were watching the plane, there was a loud bang and I saw the plane break apart. We were watching the plane and as it got closer, I knew it was a real plane. We reeled in our gear and I started rowing towards where the plane was going to come down. I saw the fuselage coming down but not where it landed. I saw an engine coming down and it hit land. Bolts and other small parts started falling near us so I rowed in the opposite direction to get out of the area so we wouldn't be hit by falling parts. Once the small parts finished hitting the ground, I could still see the fuselage still coming down so I rowed back towards where it was going to hit. We were in the area of the dam and were rowing back towards the point. The fuselage sounded like it hit the water around the point but we didn't see it hit. When we got around the point, we didn't see the plane or any bubbles in the water. There were about four kids on the bank across from the point. I told them to call 911 and then I heard the sirens.

Ques/BPN: Did you see anyone falling from the airplane?

Ans/ DC: No.

Ques/BPN: Did you see anyone in the fuselage as it got closer to you?

Ans/ DC: No, but it looked pretty much intact.

Ques/BPN: Is there anything else you can tell be about the plane crash.

Ans/ No. [REDACTED]

█

Ques/BPN: Is everything you told me here today the truth?

Ans/ DC: Yes. █

I have had this statement read to me consisting of 2 pages and the facts contained herein are true and correct. I have been advised and I understand that making a false written statement is punishable as a Class A Misdemeanor pursuant to Section 210.45 of the Penal Law of the State of New York.

Time Ended: 11:58 AM

Affirmed under the penalty of perjury
this 31st day of May , 2013

█

Witness

█

Witness _____

STATE OF NEW YORK
COUNTY OF Fulton
TOWN OF Ephraim

SUPPORTING DEPOSITION

DATE 5/24/13 PLACE 4948 St Hwy 29 TIME STARTED 6:50 [AM] [PM]
I, SCOTT E. CASE, am 51 years of age being born on [REDACTED]
at Gloversville, NY I reside at [REDACTED] St. Johnsville
I am giving this statement to Law Bryan Novak a member of the
Fulton County Sheriff's Department of my own free will without threats or promise of favor.

Q- Scott, ARE you camping AT the Royal Mountain Campsites on St Hwy 29.

A- Yes, Site #11

Q- Who are you camping with?

A- My wife Becky and my son Joel in my camper. My brother, Doug and his wife, Elizabeth and there 7 month old

Q- While camping, did you see or hear anything unusual?

A- Yes I did.

Q- What did you see and hear?

A- I was under the canopy of my camper because it was raining out. I heard a buzzing noise above me like a souped up weed wacker. I stepped out from under the canopy and looked up. As I looked up, I heard an explosion. I saw pieces of the plane moving away from the plane and then falling to the ground. The biggest parts of the plane were drifting Southeast and I saw a body come out of the plane and fall to the ground.

Q- Did you see the plane prior to the explosion?

A- No I did not. I just heard it.

I have [read this statement] [~~had this statement read to me~~] consisting of 3 page[s] and the facts contained herein are true and correct. I have been advised and I understand that making a false written statement is a Misdemeanor pursuant to Section 210.45 of the Penal Law of the State of New York.

TIME ENDED 7:37 [AM] [PM]

Affirmed under penalty of perjury this 24th day of May, 2013

Sworn and subscribed to before me this _____ day of _____, 20 _____

WITNESS [REDACTED]

-OR-

WITNESS _____

Q- Did you see any flames or smoke coming from the plane before or after the explosion?
A- No I did not.

Q- What did you do after you saw the plane explode?
A- I yelled to my wife and brother, call 911 there is a body falling from the sky.

Q- Then what did you do?
A- My wife Becky, my brother Doug and a guy named Cody ran across the road into the field to look for the body. As I was in the field I saw a white mass that looked like insulation from a house and I went past it. The four of us spread out and walked south and into another field. We went to the edge of the woods and I heard Becky who was east of us yelling to come to her. As Doug, Cody and I were going to Becky, she was on her way back to us. Becky told us that there were 2 guys in a canoe that said they saw remnants go on the other side of the lake. The four of us spread out and went north back towards St Hwy 29. Doug and Cody yelled that they found the body and told me not to come over there. I went back into the parking lot of Grand Ice Cream. When I looked back across the road I saw Becky and Cody standing next to the body.

Q- Can you tell me how loud the explosion was that you heard when you first saw the plane?
A- It sounded like a 12 gauge shot gun going off.

Q- About how high do you think the plane was when you first saw it?
A- About 1500-2000 ft. I can remember seeing the ~~do~~^{body} SEC

I have had [read this statement read] [had this statement read to me] consisting of 3 page[s] and the facts contained herein are true and correct. I have been advised and I understand that making a false written statement is punishable as a Class A Misdemeanor pursuant to Section 210.45 of the Penal Law of the State of New York.

Time Ended 7:37 [AM] (PM)

Affirmed under the penalty of perjury
This 24th day of May, 2013

Witness _____

Witness _____

Clearly falling from the plane. The body was falling back
first, with the arms and legs pointing back towards
the plane.

Q- Other than the one body and parts of the plane, did you
see anything else falling from the plane?

A- No I did not.

Q- At the time of the explosion, you said it was raining out.
Did you see any lightning or hear thunder?

A- No, it was lightly sprinkling out at the time

Q- Did you see where the ^{BY} plane had crashed?

A- No, I just looked like it was drifting towards the
south east. The only thing I heard was the thud of the
1st body hitting the ground.

Q- Is there anything else you can tell me about what you
saw today?

A- No.

Q- Is everything you told me here today the truth? SEC

A- Yes.

I have had [read this statement read] [had this statement read to me] consisting of...3.....page[s] and the facts contained herein are true and
correct. I have been advised and I understand that making a false written statement is punishable as a Class A Misdemeanor pursuant to Section
210.45 of the Penal Law of the State of New York.

Time Ended...7:37.....[AM] [PM]

Affirmed under the penalty of perjury

This...24th day of...MAY....., 2013.

Witness [Redacted]

Witness [Redacted]

State of New York
County of Fulton

Supporting Deposition

Town of Ephratah

Date 5/24/13 Place 4948 S Hwy 29 Time Started 6:07 [AM] [PM]

I, Cody R. Bly, am 20 years of age, born on [REDACTED]

at Little Falls, NY I reside at [REDACTED] Dotyville

I am giving this statement to Inv Bryan Novak a member of the Fulton County Sheriff's Office of my own free will without threats or promise of favor.

CB

Q- Were you on State Hwy 29 this evening in the area of Granvilles Ice Cream?

A- Yes At about 5:00 PM

Q- Did you see anything unusual occur?

A- Yes

Q- What did you see?

A- I was travelling West on 29 when I observed a small aircraft in a tailspin. I saw pieces of the plane falling to the ground as I was coming around the corner just east of Granvilles. I didn't see any parts of the plane impact the ground. I stopped at Granvilles and went across the street with a group of others. We went into the woods about a 1/4 mile and we reached the water. I observed a lot of pieces of the plane floating in the water. There were two men in a canoe on the water. The lady that I was with and I both spoke to the men in the canoe. They told us other pieces of the plane were on the other side of the reservoir. When we went back to Granvilles we came out in a field just west of where we went in. We noticed a white mass in the field with large crater

I have had [read this statement read] [had this statement read to me] consisting of 2 page[s] and the facts contained herein are true and correct. I have been advised and I understand that making a false written statement is punishable as a Class A Misdemeanor pursuant to Section 210.45 of the Penal Law of the State of New York.

Time Ended 6:34 [AM] [PM]

Affirmed under the penalty of perjury

This 24th day of May, 2013

Witness [REDACTED]

Witness [REDACTED]

ABOUT 2 FEET AWAY FROM IT. I OBSERVED THAT THE WHITE MASS WAS ACTUALLY A WHITE MALE. AT ABOUT THIS TIME EMS ARRIVED AND THE LADY I WAS WITH (A NURSE) CHECKED FOR A PULSE AND THERE WAS NONE. WE STOOD BY THE BODY UNTIL EMS AND SHERIFF'S DEPUTIES CAME OVER.

Q - Did you see the person come out of the plane?
A - No.

Q - Other than the tail spin did you see anything else like flames or smoke?
A - No. Just pieces falling off.

Q - Do you know the name of the lady that you were with?
A - No, but I can find out.

Q - Do you know who the 2 men are in the canoe?
A - No.

Q - Can you describe the plane that you saw?
A - A small single engine plane. I was mostly white in color and it looked like it could hold about two people maximum.

Q - Are you a Sea department member?
A - Yes, Hilltop Sea department

Q - Is there anything else you can tell me about this incident?
A - No.

Q - Is everything you told me here today the truth?
A - Yes.

I have had [read this statement read] [had this statement read to me] consisting of 2 page[s] and the facts contained herein are true and correct. I have been advised and I understand that making a false written statement is punishable as a Class A Misdemeanor pursuant to Section 210.45 of the Penal Law of the State of New York.

Time Ended 6:34 [AM] (PM)

Affirmed under the penalty of perjury
This 24th day of May, 2013

Witness [Redacted]

Witness [Redacted]

STATE OF NEW YORK
COUNTY OF Fulton
Town OF Epheatah

SUPPORTING DEPOSITION

DATE 5/24/13 PLACE [REDACTED] TIME STARTED 9:40 [AM] [PM]
I, Charles R. Berry SR., am 75 years of age being born on [REDACTED]
at Epheatah, NY I reside at [REDACTED] Johnson
I am giving this statement to Inv. Bryan Novak a member of the
Fulton County Sheriff's Department of my own free will without threats or promise of favor.

C.R.B

Q- Charles, were you home today?
A- Yes, I was outside carrying in firewood.

Q- Did you see or hear anything out of the ordinary today?

A- Yes. Around 4:30-5:00 PM tonight, I was outside and I heard an airplane circling a few times. It sounded like it was coming out of the south to the east to the north and then to the west. The plane sounded like it was having problems, the engine was revving up and then down. I then heard an explosion and saw large parts falling to the ground. I then heard a loud thud when the big parts hit the ground. I then called 911 from my cell phone. I just looked at my cell phone and I called 911 at 5:12 PM today.

Q- Did you ever see the plane before you saw the parts falling to the ground?

A- No. I just saw the engine fall just west of my house.

Q- Do you have anything else you can tell me about this incident?

A- No. [REDACTED]

I have [read this statement] [~~had this statement read to me~~] consisting of 1 page[s] and the facts contained herein are true and correct. I have been advised and I understand that making a false written statement is punishable as a Class A Misdemeanor pursuant to Section 210.45 of the Penal Law of the State of New York.

TIME ENDED 9:50 [AM] [PM]

[REDACTED]

Sworn and subscribed to before me
this 24th day of May, 2013

Affirmed under penalty of perjury
this 24th day of May, 2013

WITNESS: [REDACTED]

-OR-

WITNESS: