

1  
RECEIVED  
U.S. DISTRICT COURT  
WASHINGTON, D.C.  
2010 SEP 27 A 11:06  
COPY

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD

\* \* \* \* \*

Investigation of: \*

PACIFIC GAS & ELECTRIC COMPANY \*

SEPTEMBER 9, 2010 ACCIDENT \*

SAN BRUNO, CALIFORNIA \*

Docket No. DCA-10-MP-008

\* \* \* \* \*

Interview of: JOAQUIN GENERA

Anaheim Room  
Marriott Hotel  
San Francisco Airport  
1800 Bayshore Highway  
Burlingame, California 94010

Thursday,  
September 16, 2010

The above-captioned matter convened, pursuant to  
notice, at 4:06 p.m.

BEFORE: KARL GUNTHER  
Accident Investigator

## APPEARANCES:

KARL GUNTHER, Accident Investigator  
National Transportation Safety Board  
490 L'Enfant Plaza East, S.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20594

RAVINDRA M. CHHATRE, Investigator-in-Charge  
National Transportation Safety Board  
490 L'Enfant Plaza East, S.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20594

LAWSON F. NARVELL, JR., Investigator  
Human Performance Group  
National Transportation Safety Board  
490 L'Enfant Plaza East, S.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20594

SUNIL K. SHORI, Engineer  
California Public Utilities Commission

TOM FINCH, State Liaison  
PETER J. KATCHMAR, Senior Accident Investigator  
U.S. Department of Transportation  
Pipeline and Hazardous Materials Safety  
Administration

ROBERT FASSETT, Director  
Integrity Management and Technical Services  
Pacific Gas & Electric Company

GEOFF CALDWELL, Police Sergeant  
City of San Bruno Police Department

DEBBIE MAZZANTI, Business Representative  
International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers  
Local 1245

JOSHUA SPERRY, Senior Union Representative  
Engineers and Scientists of California  
Local 20

DANE B. JAQUES, ESQ.  
(Counsel for Mr. Genera)  
Dombroff, Gilmore, Jaques & French  
1676 International Drive, Penthouse  
McLean, Virginia 22102

I N D E X

<u>ITEM</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
Interview of Joaquin Genera:	
By Mr. Gunther	5
By Mr. Katchmar	7
By Mr. Shori	14
By Ms. Chhatre	18
By Mr. Fassett	24
By Mr. Shori	25
By Mr. Fassett	26
By Ms. Chhatre	26
By Mr. Fassett	27
By Mr. Chhatre	27
By Mr. Shori	32
By Mr. Katchmar	36

I N T E R V I E W

(4:06 p.m.)

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. GUNTHER: I'm Karl Gunther, from National Transportation Safety Board. We're investigating an accident on September 9th, 2010, in San Bruno, California. It's our number DCA-10-MP-008.

I'd like to advise you at the beginning that you can have anyone you want with you as a -- you know, counsel or assistant or whatever. Have you chosen someone?

MR. GENERA: Yes.

MR. GUNTHER: And who is that?

MR. GENERA: This man here.

MR. JAQUES: Dane Jaques, on behalf of the witness.

MR. GUNTHER: Okay.

And I'd like to begin by asking everyone -- we'll go around the room -- to go ahead and give your name and your affiliation.

MR. CALDWELL: Geoff Caldwell, City of San Bruno.

MR. FASSETT: Bob Fassett, PG&E.

MR. CHHATRE: Ravi Chhatre, NTSB. I'm the investigator-in-charge of this accident.

MR. SHORI: Sunil Shori, California Public Utilities Commission.

MR. KATCHMAR: Peter Katchmar, U.S. DOT, Pipeline and Hazardous Materials Safety Administration.

1 MR. GUNTHER: Karl Gunther, NTSB.

2 MS. MAZZANTI: Debbie Mazzanti, IBEW Local 1245,  
3 Business Rep.

4 MR. SPERRY: Joshua Sperry, Engineers and Scientists of  
5 California, Local 20, the union for the professional and technical  
6 staff.

7 INTERVIEW OF JOAQUIN GENERA

8 BY MR. GUNTHER:

9 Q. Okay. I'd like to get your name, address, and phone for  
10 the record.

11 A. My name is Joaquin Genera. My address is [REDACTED]  
12 [REDACTED]. That's in [REDACTED]

13 THE REPORTER: Sir, could you spell your name for the  
14 record, please?

15 MR. GENERA: It's J-o-a-q-u-i-n. The last name is G-e-  
16 n-e-r-a. And my phone is [REDACTED]

17 BY MR. GUNTHER:

18 Q. And what is your -- who do you work for and what is your  
19 job title?

20 A. I work for PG&E. My job title is Transmission  
21 Coordinator.

22 Q. Thank you. What I'd like you to do is describe all of  
23 the actions you took and everything you saw September 9th, 2010.

24 A. Well, it was a normal workday for me. I came in the  
25 morning around 6:00 a.m. I did my normal duties throughout the

1 day, which included monitoring the transmission pipeline,  
2 responding to alarms, making and receiving phone calls. And then  
3 in the afternoon, or early evening, we had the incident in San  
4 Bruno occur.

5 I worked with the people in the room to respond to it as  
6 best as we could, and make several phone calls -- or, actually,  
7 made some phone calls, received a lot of phone calls. And just  
8 worked with my team to try and resolve the issue as best we could.

9 Q. Okay. What kind of formal training do you have?

10 A. In terms of -- for my current position or?

11 Q. Well, high school diploma, college, courses?

12 A. As far as my education background, I have a high school  
13 diploma. I have a bachelor's in science from UC Berkeley,  
14 environmental science. I have a master's in business from Cal  
15 State University, East Bay. And then I received several types of  
16 on-the-job training for my current position.

17 Q. And could you list the types of on-the-job training you  
18 received?

19 A. I have received operator qualification training, which  
20 we do at least once a year, if not two or three times a year. And  
21 we -- we have different types of group trainings that are offered  
22 to us for our role as operators.

23 Q. Okay. And you're covered under operation qualifications  
24 for Pacific Gas?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. All right.

2 MR. GUNTHER: PHMSA?

3 MR. SHORI: We'll go ahead and defer PHMSA for first  
4 line of questioning first.

5 BY MR. KATCHMAR:

6 Q. Good afternoon, Joaquin. Thank you for coming in today  
7 to talk to us.

8 When were you first made aware of -- when and how were  
9 you first made aware of the situation in San Bruno?

10 A. I believe that one of my counterparts in the control  
11 room had mentioned that he had received a call. I don't remember  
12 exactly who it was, but one of them had mentioned that a call had  
13 been made to the control room that reports of a fire or explosion  
14 had been witnessed in the San Bruno area.

15 Q. Can you explain the different types of communications  
16 you have at your disposal as a controller and when you use each  
17 one?

18 A. We have a -- what's called a gas logging system, which  
19 we commonly refer to as the GLS, which is an electronic format of  
20 communicating within the control room between the gas system  
21 operators and the transmission coordinators, as well as  
22 communicating with the manned stations that we have throughout the  
23 transmission system, which includes compressor stations and  
24 storage facilities -- underground storage facilities.

25 We also use the telephone frequently throughout the day,

1 and those are really our primary methods of communicating, other  
2 than inter-office through e-mails and things of that nature.

3 Q. Okay. We were told of something called e-page. Do you  
4 know what that is?

5 A. Yeah. That is a other form of communication that we use  
6 to broadcast information to other employees in the company.

7 Q. And you would use that for -- like if you want to talk  
8 to everyone?

9 A. There's certain groups of people who are on specific e-  
10 page group lists and depending on what the situation is, we select  
11 specific e-page groups to communicate to.

12 Q. Are you aware of any other -- are you aware of any other  
13 alarms of fire or house fire, meter fire, regulator station  
14 fire -- anything like that other than at San Bruno that occurred  
15 on that night?

16 A. Related to fires? No.

17 Q. All right. I have a text of the <sup>GLS</sup>~~GLPs~~, and I read  
18 through it last night, and there was actually an issue somewhere  
19 with a fire -- a fire at a house or a -- I forgot what it was. I  
20 have to find it here real quick.

21 It was a false alarm.

22 A. Okay. We do from time to time receive reports from call  
23 centers of house fires and --

24 Q. I'll find it here pretty soon and I can ask you about  
25 it.



1 A. Okay.

2 Q. Could you tell me what a "PLS -- lower PLS 5-A,  
3 downstream to 470 psi and lower PLS 4-B, downstream to 635" might  
4 mean?

5 A. Yeah. There was -- that would mean that we  
6 would -- that the transmission coordinator is asking a gas system  
7 operator to regulate or put a control into the SCADA system to  
8 have a valve operate so that the pressures downstream of those  
9 valves target those pressures.

10 Q. So "PLS 5-A" and "PLS 4-B" are valves?

11 A. Those are actually -- those are locations of a station  
12 and the "A" and "B" refer to one of the two pipes that run through  
13 each of those stations.

14 Q. Do you know where those are?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. What -- can you tell me where they're at?

17 A. They are somewhere in the Central Valley, upstream of  
18 our Kettleman compressor station. And usually, but not always, we  
19 operate those valves to raise or lower pressure for gas that we're  
20 delivering to Southern California, at that site.

21 Q. That answers that.

22 Okay. Is there -- when this event occurred, do you  
23 remember using the gas logging system at all?

24 A. I don't remember using it, but it's possible that I  
25 could have.

1 Q. Okay. And -- well, just to let you know, it appears no  
2 one did, except for, like at 4:00 in the morning, I have  
3 a -- 4:42, actually, on September 10th, in the  
4 morning -- 0400:42 -- "Have changed high, high alarms from 378 to  
5 340 and high alarms 373 to 330 on stations requested on GLS  
6 message," 4:16 -- "0416 due to line 132 incident. Oscar Martinez  
7 at Milpitas talked to, to change monitors for lines 109, 132, 101,  
8 on outgoing lines to 347, PSIG. Okay on PLS 4-B and 5-A orders."

9 So, I guess I'm asking -- I went through this whole day  
10 and that's the first real indication that you guys used this  
11 system to -- to exchange orders to raise and lower pressures.

12 Does that make sense to you?

13 A. If we were <sup>to</sup> lower the MOPs on a line, it does make sense  
14 that we would have documented that on the GLS.

15 Q. Okay. All righty.

16 Do you know if the e-page and the telephone systems are  
17 recorded or somehow or another documented, physically?

18 A. I believe that the phone conversations on most of the  
19 lines in the control room are recorded. And the e-page system has  
20 an option of requesting that a receipt of the message to all of  
21 the people that are supposed to receive it either received it or  
22 didn't. Similar to what you would have if you were to send a fax  
23 and you print out a confirmation that the --

24 Q. You don't think that --

25 MR. JAUQUES: Let him finish his answer.

1 MR. KATCHMAR: I'm sorry.

2 MR. GENERA: -- that the communication was successful or  
3 not.

4 BY MR. KATCHMAR:

5 Q. Okay. You don't think it's just automatic?

6 A. I'm not sure I understand the question.

7 Q. Sort of like a telephone is recorded automatically, is  
8 the e-page -- do you only have the ones that you clicked receipt  
9 requested?

10 A. I don't -- I don't know that much about the e-page  
11 system to answer that question.

12 Q. That's fine.

13 Were you aware of the work going on at Milpitas?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Were you working directly with the people down there?

16 A. No.

17 Q. Do you know who was?

18 A. In terms of communicating with the people who were  
19 working there, it was likely one of the gas system operators.

20 Q. Okay. You're a transmission coordinator, so, I  
21 guess -- I guess we were already told that.

22 So, the senior transmission coordinator goes through you  
23 to get to the -- and then you go to the gas system operators?

24 A. Usually, the senior transmission coordinator and I will  
25 agree on what operations are to take place. And then, typically,

1 we will use the GLS to send those commands or those orders to the  
2 gas system operators.

3 Q. Okay. And then they get it done? And they're the ones  
4 talking to the people?

5 A. Correct.

6 Q. Okay. All righty.

7 So you weren't directly involved -- do you give out the  
8 clearances or do the gas control guys give out the clearances?

9 A. Well, I am part of gas control. Do you mean the gas  
10 system operators?

11 Q. I'm sorry. The -- yes, the gas system operators.

12 A. They receive requests from the field when a clearance is  
13 to begin and end. And then that information is logged in the GLS.

14 Q. And do you oversee the GLS, then, on all of that?

15 A. We acknowledge on the GLS that the job -- that a  
16 clearance is starting or ending or at specific stages of the  
17 clearance.

18 Q. Who's "we"?

19 A. Transmission coordinators.

20 So the gas system operators, on the other side of the  
21 room, are in direct communication, usually by phone, with the  
22 field techs or mechanics. And then that information is placed on  
23 the GLS by the gas system operators, and then typically the  
24 transmission coordinators acknowledge on the GLS that the job is  
25 starting or ending.

1 Q. Okay. Is there -- can you explain to us why this is set  
2 up the way it's set up? And I'll ask -- I'll give you a much more  
3 detailed kind of scenario question.

4 Do the senior transmission coordinator -- I don't know  
5 if there's more than one -- and the transmission coordinators, of  
6 which you are one -- you say you're on one side of the room. Do  
7 you have so much to do that you're just at a computer terminal  
8 working and you don't -- and then you just document things and  
9 shoot them off, orders, to the guys across the room?

10 A. That's one of our responsibilities.

11 Q. But is it the fact that you're too busy to walk over and  
12 tell them that or --

13 A. No. A lot of our communication is done verbally across  
14 the room to each other. But for documentation purposes, we use  
15 the GLS.

16 Q. Okay.

17 A. Also, the gas system operators had been located at  
18 another facility for several years, and we recently consolidated  
19 into one control room. And the pattern of using the GLS to  
20 document commands and operations has continued, even though we're  
21 in the same room.

22 Q. Okay. Now, that makes more sense. That's where I was  
23 going with that. All righty.

24 So when did you consolidate?

25 A. I think it was April 13th of this year, somewhere around

1 that time of the month.

2 Q. Okay. We understood that they installed this new SCADA  
3 system in 2006. Is that correct?

4 A. That sounds about right. I don't know exactly what  
5 time, but it was about, maybe three, four years ago.

6 Q. All right, sir. Thank you very much.

7 MR. GUNTHER: Sunil, California PUC?

8 MR. SHORI: That's the second time you've done that.

9 BY MR. SHORI:

10 Q. How much clearance are you provided to work as  
11 you're -- is there a certain advanced -- how long in advance do  
12 the clearances need to be provided for scheduled work? Is there a  
13 set policy for that?

14 A. Yeah, we usually ask that the clearances be submitted  
15 somewhere about 10 days in advance. So that's -- that's generally  
16 what -- when we receive a clearance before the job starts.

17 Q. Okay. And what's provided -- you talked about within  
18 the room a lot of things being done verbally. But how was the  
19 information provided to you as far as any clearance being issued?  
20 How is that -- who issues a clearance, first of all, but then it  
21 needs to end up with you folks?

22 A. The way it happens is that the person in the field works  
23 with their supervisor or foreman in drafting a description of the  
24 work that's going to take place and the clearance. And a  
25 form -- a template form is used for them to provide the details of

1 the work.

2           That clearance is then submitted electronically to our  
3 department and reviewed by someone who specifically deals with  
4 reviewing clearances. And then the clearances are approved, if  
5 they -- if they are adequately written and all of the safety  
6 requirements are met. And then the clearances are issued ~~by~~ to  
7 the people in the field for -- with an approval. And we -- a copy  
8 of the clearances are kept on file in the control room, so that  
9 when the work begins, they're readily available for us to refer  
10 to.

11           Q.    So it's a formalized process and you have to -- and what  
12 kind -- you've seen the forms. You've used -- you've review the  
13 clearances. What kind of questions or what kind of items are  
14 generally covered on that form?

15           A.    There's usually a synopsis description of the work on  
16 the cover page, as well as an indication of whether any alarms  
17 would be required to be changed for the work. There's usually a  
18 section dedicated to contact people with phone numbers. If alarms  
19 are required to be changed, those are listed in the clearance with  
20 the normal set points -- pressure set points -- and what the  
21 clearance set points are.

22           There's also a space provided for the date and time at  
23 which the alarm set points are actually changed and placed back  
24 into normal. And then there's a step-by-step description of the  
25 work, with location and valves that might be operated. And

1 that's -- that's basically it.

2 Q. So it's a pretty extensive -- pretty decent amount of  
3 information that needs to be provided, not a two or three-line  
4 type situation. It's a formalized form for every clearance?

5 A. There's a formalized form for every clearance.

6 Q. Okay. And part of that, I think you had indicated, you  
7 had to provide a start and stop time?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And do some of these clearances -- I mean, is there any  
10 limitation on how long a clearance can be? Or is there -- let me  
11 just put it this way:

12 So is there any limitation in the length of the  
13 clearance? Do they have to specify to you what the date and time  
14 or what's the longest -- what's the maximum length specified for a  
15 clearance?

16 A. There is no maximum length for a clearance. All  
17 clearances vary.

18 Q. But they do have to give you a specific start and stop  
19 time and date?

20 A. The times and dates are -- are to the best of their  
21 knowledge, of the people in the field, of when they think the work  
22 will start. Sometimes jobs are postponed or they don't actually  
23 start when it's indicated on the clearance, as initially written.  
24 But once a job starts, a clearance starts, there is -- it's normal  
25 practice to document that on the GLS, as well as handwriting on



1 the clearance hard copy.

2 Q. Okay. So just that I'm clear, so the form itself would  
3 specify some sort of a start and stop date and time, but it could  
4 change, and if it does change, a verbal -- or how is that  
5 communicated to you? In other words, "We didn't start at this,  
6 we're starting now, instead," how is that communicated to you?  
7 And I think you said you log it onto the GLS?

8 A. That's right. Most of the time, it's logged onto the  
9 GLS.

10 Q. For the particular clearance that was in place on line  
11 132, on September the 9th, are you familiar if it had any kind of  
12 a stop date or what the stop date and time was on that clearance?

13 A. I don't know the details of that clearance. That was  
14 probably an emergency clearance, which are issued when there are  
15 emergencies. And so I don't know the details of the start and  
16 stop times.

17 Q. Let me clarify. I'm not talking about after the event.  
18 I'm talking about the -- some of the work that was going down in  
19 Milpitas in regard to the -- in regard to the work that they were  
20 doing prior to the event.

21 A. Um-hum. The Milpitas clearance, I don't remember the  
22 details of what the start or stop times of that clearance were.  
23 Sometimes clearances -- because of scheduling and manpower  
24 availability -- might just have a "to be determined" for the date  
25 and time. And so I'm not sure if that particular clearance had

1 specific date and times for it to start.

2 Q. But that's certainly -- was that any kind of an  
3 emergency clearance?

4 A. That wasn't an emergency clearance, as far as I  
5 remember. It was a normal, planned clearance.

6 Q. Okay. And with regard to the -- some of the work going  
7 on at the SF gas control, what -- what's your familiarity with  
8 what was -- was there some work going on in regard to some -- at  
9 the control center itself?

10 A. Yeah, we -- the control had been undergoing some  
11 renovations in the last several weeks, and it was scheduled to  
12 finish the weekend following the event. And so we had planned to  
13 relocate our group -- our operations to our alternate site in  
14 Brentwood, which was to take place at the end of the shift that  
15 day.

16 MR. SHORI: That's it for me. Thank you.

17 MR. GUNTHER: Okay. PG&E?

18 MR. FASSETT: No questions.

19 MR. GUNTHER: City?

20 MR. CHHATRE: I have questions.

21 MR. GUNTHER: All right. Do you have any questions,  
22 City?

23 MR. CALDWELL: No. Thank you.

24 MR. GUNTHER: All right. Go ahead.

25 BY MR. CHHATRE:

1 Q. Okay. What is your title, please?

2 A. My job title is Transmission Coordinator.

3 Q. And what does that mean in layman's terms? What do you  
4 do?

5 A. We're basically responsible for monitoring the  
6 transmission pipeline.

7 Q. And how do you accomplish that?

8 A. Primarily we use SCADA.

9 Q. Okay.

10 A. And we -- we work with the gas system operators and the  
11 senior transmission coordinator to remotely operate the valves or  
12 compressor stations, in order to manage the inventory of gas in  
13 the pipeline.

14 Q. And what is your work location?

15 A. 77 Beale Street, 16th Floor.

16 Q. Is that the control room that we visited the other day?

17 A. That's the control room, yeah.

18 Q. When you say you monitor the work, what do you do? What  
19 do you actually monitor? Obviously, monitor and controls.

20 A. Well, basically, we -- we ensure that the -- we try to  
21 ensure that the pressures in the transmission system are high  
22 enough to meet the minimum demands of the customers. And we also  
23 try to prevent over-pressurization of the valves -- I mean of the  
24 pipes.

25 We -- the SCADA provides us with volumes of gas in the

1 different segments of the network of pipes, and depending on what  
2 our operating targets might be for any given day, we may choose to  
3 activate compressors to move gas from one location to another.

4 We also communicate with other pipeline operators, which  
5 we are receiving gas from or we are delivering gas to. That's --

6 Q. With your counterparts in other locations?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. No -- now are your lines pretty much back? Who's  
9 backing the lines?

10 A. I'm not sure that I understand your question.

11 Q. Gas being compressible, how much of backing -- if you  
12 were to lose compressor stations, how long would your gas would  
13 supply -- continuous supply in it, do you know that? If you  
14 don't, then that's fine.

15 A. I think your question is too general to give a specific  
16 answer to.

17 Q. That's fine. And how do you control -- I think you said  
18 control volumes in the places. How do you control that, actually?  
19 Control, you mean, what do you do?

20 A. Well, the volumes -- well, we depend on the compressor  
21 stations to provide higher pressure gas, to move gas from one  
22 direction to another. We also operate valves to either lower  
23 pressure, in order to allow gas to move from another location to  
24 the lower pressures.

25 Basically, it's just using the valves at compressor

1 stations to create high or low pressures in order to move the gas  
2 to the demands of the customers.

3 Q. Now, are these valves all that you can control from  
4 remote locations or do you ask somebody to open or close?

5 A. Some valves are able to be operated remotely from the  
6 control room. In other situations, we may have to communicate  
7 with people in the field to operate manual valves.

8 Q. So on line 132, between Milpitas and -- Martin? Is it  
9 Martin? On that pipeline, do you know the rough length of that?

10 A. I don't know -- I don't know specifically how long. But  
11 I know it runs the length of the peninsula.

12 Q. In that -- do you call it segment? What do you call it,  
13 segment?

14 So in that segment, how many valves are there?

15 A. I don't know specifically, but the --

16 Q. Okay.

17 MR. FASSETT: Point of clarification, we have provided  
18 the entire line drawing system from Milpitas to the end of this  
19 pipeline. All of that valve spacing information is there. Can we  
20 defer to that, please?

21 MR. CHHATRE: And does that also provide the remote  
22 control versus manual, that map?

23 MR. FASSETT: We've also provided all of the valve  
24 cards. If any of them are remote-controlled, it would be stated  
25 on the valve cards.

1 MR. CHHATRE: Okay. That's fine.

2 BY MR. CHHATRE:

3 Q. So on the day of the incident, were you on duty at the  
4 time?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Can you describe the events -- meaning usual and  
7 unusual -- an hour prior to the event and maybe after about 30  
8 minutes after the event? From, let us say, from the fire blast  
9 until 7:00 that evening.

10 A. One unusual event which occurred before the event were a  
11 number of high-high alarms in the San Jose area and along the  
12 peninsula.

13 Q. And what does that indicate to you? And where did that  
14 happen?

15 A. I don't recall the specific locations, but I remember  
16 that they were in the general vicinity of the San Jose area and  
17 the peninsula, which are fed from Milpitas. A high-high alarm  
18 tells us that the pressure has reached a level above the maximum  
19 operating pressure.

20 Q. And that would be, over 500 or 400? Actually, the MOP  
21 in your system, is what I'm asking.

22 A. I believe the MOP for Milpitas is 375 or 378, somewhere  
23 around there.

24 Q. So it was a 378 was a high-high alarm that came in and  
25 that's unusually high?

1 A. To have a number of high-high alarms in a general  
2 vicinity is unusual.

3 Q. Do you recall how many of those?

4 A. No, not specifically.

5 Q. If you don't, that's fine.

6 A. No, I don't remember. I know there <sup>were</sup> several.

7 Q. And do you know at what time it happened?

8 A. I don't remember the time. I know it was before reports  
9 of an explosion.

10 Q. Okay. And after that high-high alarm, what other  
11 unusual events did you notice?

12 A. I think the high-high alarms were probably the only  
13 unusual thing I remember occurring before the -- we reported the  
14 explosion.

15 One other unusual occurrence was the pressure drop at  
16 Martin Station. I don't recall if that was before or after the  
17 report of the explosion.

18 Q. Do you, by any chance, recall how much the pressure drop  
19 was?

20 A. I believe it was somewhere around 300 pounds.

21 Q. It dropped by 300 pounds or it dropped to 300 pounds?

22 A. By.

23 Q. Okay. And that was before the rupture?

24 A. I don't remember the timeframe, the sequence, in  
25 comparison to the rupture.

1 Q. Okay. Do you know what time the rupture occurred?

2 A. No.

3 Q. Did you see anything on your SCADA to indicate that  
4 there was a rupture?

5 A. Nothing. The only indication of a rupture was by phone  
6 from the call center.

7 Q. And do you know when that happened?

8 A. No.

9 Q. So did that phone call occur before you saw the pressure  
10 drop or after? I understand, I'm just trying to narrow it down.  
11 I'm not trying to put you on the spot. I'm just trying to figure  
12 it out.

13 A. You know, I don't know. I think that the -- I know that  
14 the SCADA -- the pressure drop time is available somewhere,  
15 because all of that is documented to the second. So, from my own  
16 recollection, I don't remember which happened first.

17 Q. And do you understand that all of the phone  
18 conversations are also recorded through SCADA? That we can get a  
19 copy of your phone logs and maybe we can resolve that.

20 A. The phone logs should, I believe, have some type of time  
21 stamp associated with them.

22 Q. Okay.

23 MR. CHHATRE: Yes, sir?

24 MR. FASSETT: Just clarification.

25 BY MR. FASSETT:



1 Q. So all you have is pressure recordings, correct?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. You do not have flow measurement between Milpitas to the  
4 end of the system?

5 A. There is no flow measurements that I'm aware of between  
6 Milpitas and Martin Station.

7 Q. So absent flow measurement, you couldn't use the classic  
8 method of determining rupture, which would be pressure dropped,  
9 the volume increased, correct?

10 A. Correct.

11 MR. FASSETT: Thank you.

12 BY MR. ~~SHORT~~: CHATRE

13 Q. So if pressure drops by itself, what does that mean to  
14 you? What about the information about the pressure drops, what  
15 does that mean to you?

16 MR. JAUQUES: You're going to have to be more specific on  
17 that question.

18 BY MR. ~~SHORT~~: CHATRE

19 Q. I'm just if you see a pressure drops -- I think what Bob  
20 said was short of -- I'm just saying what that does a pressure  
21 drop mean to you?

22 A. It could mean a malfunction of a valve. We've had SCADA  
23 at times give us incorrect values of pressures, making drastic  
24 increases or decreases because of --

25 Q. Has that happened in the past?

1 MR. JAQUES: Let him finish his answer.

2 MR. GENERA: Yes. It's not unusual to see pressures  
3 drop or increase outside of normal operating pressures on SCADA.

8/A

BY MR. ~~SHORT~~: CHATRE

5 Q. Of that magnitude of psi?

6 A. Correct.

7 MR. GUNTHER: Bob Fassett, PG&E?

8 BY MR. FASSETT:

9 Q. But it would be safe to say that a pressure drop is an  
10 anomalous condition that you would further investigate?

11 A. Correct.

12 Q. And did you further investigate?

13 A. We did.

14 MR. FASSETT: Thank you.

15 MR. CHHATRE: You took my question.

16 BY MR. CHHATRE:

17 Q. So what actions would you take after you see something  
18 like that? For me, you said it might be a malfunction of a valve.  
19 And I don't know what that means. And you said something else.  
20 So what does malfunction of a valve mean?

21 A. Sometimes valves will not operate according to -- some  
22 of these valves are old and sometimes get stuck. We've had to  
23 dispatch mechanics to locations throughout the system to check on  
24 valves that appear to be operating unusually.

25 Q. And is that log available some place? We would request

1 that you prepare that information. Would that be stored some  
2 place?

3 A. Those types of communications are in the GLS when they  
4 occur.

5 Q. I'm sorry, what is GLS?

6 A. Gas logging system.

7 Q. I'm sorry?

8 A. Gas logging system.

9 Q. Oh, GLS?

10 A. Yes.

11 MR. CHHATRE: Thank you.

12 MR. GUNTHER: Bob?

13 BY MR. FASSETT:

14 Q. When you say sometimes a valve gets stuck, you mean  
15 sometimes control valves, not the valves that are required to be  
16 operated manually by a mechanic in the first place?

17 A. Right, correct.

18 Q. Thank you.

19 BY MR. CHHATRE:

20 Q. Now, on line 132, do you recall a situation like this  
21 that the valve was stuck and the pressure dropped -- I would say,  
22 so that it's not an open-ended question -- over the last couple of  
23 years?

24 MR. JAQUES: I'm sorry. I just didn't understand what  
25 that question was. Can you repeat it?

1 BY MR. CHHATRE:

2 Q. Okay. Do you recall in the last couple of years on line  
3 132, which ruptured, do you recall any incidents where the  
4 pressure dropped by 2-300 psi because the valve was stuck?

5 A. On line 132?

6 Q. Yes, sir.

7 A. Not that I can remember.

8 Q. Thank you.

9 Do you recall on the other system lines in the past  
10 couple of years where the pressure dropped like that because the  
11 valve was stuck? And those lines would be 101 and 109.

12 A. Not when I was on duty.

13 Q. Yeah, that's all you can answer. Okay.

14 Now, what happens when you change your shift in your  
15 control room? What procedure do you have in a shift change?

16 A. From normal?

17 Q. From normal.

18 A. Normally, it involves a transfer of a written summary  
19 from one shift to the next.

20 Q. Okay.

21 A. We also, by normal practice, review the GLS for the  
22 shift preceding.

23 Q. What is GLS?

24 A. Gas logging system.

25 Q. Okay.

1 A. And that would have any material events that would be  
2 worth --

3 Q. Okay.

4 A. -- noting.

5 There's also a verbal debriefing --

6 Q. Okay.

7 A. -- of the day's events or the shift's events, rather,  
8 between operators.

9 Q. Yes, sir.

10 And typically how long it takes? I'm sorry, I didn't  
11 want to interrupt you.

12 A. It takes usually between 10 to 15 minutes. Sometimes  
13 longer if there's more activity.

14 Q. Depending on the activity, then.

15 If I recall correctly, there are three control room  
16 operators in San Francisco or are there four?

17 A. There's normally three.

18 Q. Okay. Per shift?

19 A. Per shift.

20 Q. And what are the typical shift hours?

21 A. 6:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m.

22 Q. And how are -- are the people constantly on each shift,  
23 or do you rotate shifts?

24 A. Any <sup>given</sup> operator or transmission coordinator could work  
25 anywhere from one to four consecutive shifts.

1 Q. But would they be all morning shifts or night shifts?

2 A. In any given stint of shifts, it would either be  
3 exclusively day or exclusively night.

4 Q. So, once again, one to four consecutive morning shifts  
5 and consecutive night shifts?

6 A. Correct.

7 Q. And how do you switch -- or do you switch at all from  
8 morning to evening shift? When I say you, I mean the controllers.

9 A. We have a six-week schedule, and the schedule for one  
10 person usually includes a combination of day and night shifts.

11 Q. So during your tenure, I guess, as far as the vast  
12 majority goes, do you recall any time during the shift change,  
13 communications -- anybody mentioning it to you about a specific  
14 drop of 2-300 psi on lines 132, 109, or the sister lines?

15 A. No, I don't remember that ever being mentioned.

16 Q. And since you mentioned that the valves can get stuck  
17 occasionally on different locations and different lines, do you  
18 have any recollection of how does the valves on 132 -- do you  
19 recall any unusual situations of them getting stuck as compared to  
20 the other two lines --

21 A. Can you repeat the question?

22 Q. Sure. Do you -- the answer you gave is sometimes the  
23 valves get stick -- like 2-300 psi. And my question is I'm trying  
24 to compare these three lines with their sister lines, in my  
25 opinion, these would be the same construction, the same location,

1 coming from the same compressor station. I'm just trying to get a  
2 feeling as to whether --

3 MR. FASSETT: A point of clarification. I would not  
4 classify -- I would not classify these as similar lines. They  
5 were built over various, long periods of time for different  
6 reasons, out of different materials and different well  
7 classifications, different construction methods, from 1930 through  
8 1990.

9 MR. CHHATRE: We'll just call them T-lines radiating  
10 from Milpitas with using the same MOD. Would that be reasonable?

11 MR. FASSETT: That would be reasonable.

12 BY MR. CHHATRE:

13 Q. So on those three lines, how do you compare the events,  
14 like a drop of these, because of a valve problem, getting stuck,  
15 leaving open -- whatever -- on these three lines? Which of these  
16 three lines would have more events versus less events?

17 A. I don't think I can answer that. I wouldn't know.

18 Q. Do you recall these events occurring on all three lines  
19 in the past?

20 MR. JAQUES: I object. He's asked and answered that.  
21 He said no, he doesn't recall any.

22 MR. CHHATRE: Okay, all right.

23 MR. JAQUES: We're going to be a long time if you ask  
24 the same things again.

25 BY MR. CHHATRE:

1 Q. Briefly, once you got a phone call about the fire and  
2 rupture, what action did you take, if any?

3 A. If we suspect that it could be related to a line, we  
4 would call the division foreman and alert him of the possibility  
5 of an event.

6 Q. And did you do that?

7 A. I didn't make any of those calls. Normally, that role  
8 would be something that a gas system operator might do.

9 Q. Okay. The last question: Did you know if a gas system  
10 operator made such a call?

11 A. I believe a call was made.

12 MR. CHHATRE: Thank you very much.

13 MR. GUNTHER: Okay. Any more questions?

14 MR. SHORI: I've got some follow-ups, unless somebody  
15 else has to clear first.

16 BY MR. SHORI:

17 Q. This -- I guess in regard to the 300 psi G-drops on  
18 SCADA that you see, it seemed to me that you're saying that that's  
19 a very common occurrence in terms of seeing that on SCADA? I  
20 mean, it seemed to be -- it didn't seem to be an unusual event to  
21 you, the way you characterized it. Do you see this often?

22 A. I wouldn't characterize it as common, but it's not  
23 unusual. We have at times for unexplainable reasons, our  
24 indication on SCADA might deviate for a matter of seconds, from  
25 the -- what is registering and I could probably best characterize



1 as blip -- as a blip. And these happen from time to time. And  
2 sometimes occur in a range higher than 300 pounds.

3 Q. Okay. Any particular line in particular or it could be  
4 any line where you see these types of blips?

5 A. It could be any line.

6 Q. The 300 psi that we were talking about, was that on line  
7 132?

8 A. That was at Martin Station on line 132.

9 Q. Okay. And the valve malfunctions that occur -- that  
10 cause these?

11 A. They are usually remote valves, valves that we can  
12 operate from the control room. Manual valves usually seem to  
13 maintain a steady position.

14 Q. Okay. And I understand that. But in terms of those  
15 remote valves, is it common for them to move -- to change to some  
16 level that would cause you to see that change? I mean if a valve  
17 is causing the change that you said you're seeing, what would  
18 cause the valve to change to see that? I mean, wouldn't it be  
19 controlled in order for that to happen? So is it doing that on  
20 its own that you would see that? Can you explain that?

21 A. Well, a manual valve wouldn't likely do that.

22 Q. Right. But an automated valve -- a control valve that  
23 you do have a remote control, would it do that?

24 A. It's not common, but occasionally a remote valve could  
25 get stuck in any given position and might require a -- a visit

1 from a field person to check on -- to see if it's, indeed, stuck  
2 or not.

3 Q. Does that -- is that saying, then, it was in open and  
4 then somehow it reduces itself to the point that you -- that it  
5 requires that kind of a trip?

6 A. Usually it -- where I've seen it happen is a valve is in  
7 a specific setting or location and we're asking the valve to move  
8 remotely, and the signal is sent, but the valve might have oil or  
9 debris or something that's physically preventing it from moving to  
10 the desired location.

11 Q. And earlier -- basically when you saw that condition,  
12 when you saw that abnormal condition in terms of the pressure  
13 reduction, you indicated you took actions in response to that on  
14 line 132 on September 9th. What actions did you take?

15 A. In response to what?

16 Q. Do you consider the fact that you saw the 300 pound drop  
17 or that you saw pressure reduction on line 132, would you consider  
18 that as an anomalous condition or an abnormal condition?

19 A. Yeah.

20 Q. In response to that, what actions did you take?

21 A. I believe what I did in response to that was I called  
22 the -- I can't remember if -- I called a -- I think I was asked to  
23 call a transmission system planner that would be available. I  
24 think by the time we -- I had noticed the pressure drop, there was  
25 suspicion that there was a line break. And what I did was I

1 pulled out -- or accessed a geographical information system which  
2 shows the location of the transmission pipes, to see if the report  
3 of an explosion -- the location of the reported location was  
4 anywhere near the -- any of our transmission lines.

5 Q. So that suspicion that you had that there was a line  
6 break, was that prior to you getting a call from the gas call  
7 center?

8 A. No, our first indication of a possible line break was  
9 the call from the call center.

10 Q. Where did you log your actions in regard to that?

11 A. The actions of?

12 Q. Well, you're having an abnormal condition. You're  
13 responding to it. Where would you log it -- either then or after  
14 the fact, where would you log what you did?

15 A. The actions of any types of communications were  
16 handwritten by myself. As far as my actions to confirm the  
17 location of the pipe in relation to the event location, I -- there  
18 wasn't any documentation of that, per se. That is something I  
19 just did.

20 Q. So you have handwritten notes available?

21 A. I took handwritten notes of calls that I made and  
22 received once we began to suspect that there was a line break.

23 Q. What is the Vox logger? What does that refer to?

24 A. The Vox logger?

25 Q. Um-hum.

1           A.    I don't know what that is.  That might be the phone  
2 recordings.

3           Q.    And I think at some point you had indicated that  
4 incidents that come into you aren't logged into the gas logging  
5 system?  You don't log incidents that are reported to you?

6           A.    When we receive calls from the call center of reports of  
7 events that might be related to the transmission system or our  
8 distribution system, even, those -- that information is put into  
9 the log.

10          Q.    How come there's nothing in the log for the -- for the  
11 incident of the rupture, for that time?

12          A.    I don't know -- I don't know.  I don't -- normally, when  
13 someone receives a call, the person who receives the call  
14 is -- makes notation of the information.

15          Q.    You said you received a call from the customer call  
16 center or somewhere?

17          A.    Our control room did.  I didn't personally receive a  
18 call.

19          Q.    Okay.

20                MR. SHORI:  That's it for me.  I think you have one or  
21 two.

22                MR. KATCHMAR:  I have just a couple -- DOT.

23                BY MR. KATCHMAR:

24          Q.    You said you just -- you all just moved in together.  
25 Has there been any problems with that or is it better --

1 A. No.

2 Q. -- or not as good as it used to be or what?

3 MR. JAQUES: Personal opinion.

4 MR. GENERA: I think it's better.

5 BY MR. KATCHMAR:

6 Q. Any problems with the control system, ongoing stuff that  
7 happens over and over and over and over?

8 MR. JAQUES: I'm sorry. I'm not sure what you're  
9 asking.

10 Do you understand the question?

11 MR. GENERA: No. Can you restate?

12 BY MR. KATCHMAR:

13 Q. Any abnormal situations with the control center that  
14 occur repeatedly?

15 A. No.

16 Q. Okay. Where is your storage, gas storage?

17 A. Our underground storage facilities?

18 Q. Yes.

19 A. We have one -- we have three. We have one at McDonald  
20 Island near Stockton. We have one called Los Medanos and another  
21 one called Pleasant Creek.

22 Q. Los -- spell that last one?

23 A. It's L-o-s, space, M-e-d-a-n-o-s.

24 Q. And I guess I'm asking for where are they on the earth?  
25 Are they in between -- are they in between Milpitas and Martin?

1 A. No.

2 Q. Okay. On this log -- I found it -- on the gas logging  
3 system, at 6:12 -- which is when we understand the event occurred,  
4 okay? Just to let you know. We understand that it occurred 6:11,  
5 6:12 -- there's an acknowledgment at 6:04. There's a "K-4 off  
6 line," at 6:12. And then at 6:12 somebody says, "Thanks." And  
7 then at 6:30:27, Valenti says, "Just received a call from the  
8 Concord Dispatch informing us of a house fire in San Ramon caused  
9 by a gas meter explosion. GSR en route."

10 And then -- that was 1630. And then 1659, Valenti says,  
11 "Per incident in San Ramon is false. Per on-call supervisor Joel  
12 Hart there were cardboard boxes stored near gas meter. Somehow  
13 cardboard caught fire and the heat caused the indexes to melt.  
14 There was no release of gas, no damage to structure, and meter is  
15 being replaced at this time. Whew!" W-h-e-w, exclamation.

16 And I guess my question is, if they put that in there,  
17 why wouldn't there be anything about this San Bruno event?

18 A. It sounds like the event you're referring to is at least  
19 an hour before the explosion occurred.

20 Q. You're right, 16. That's 4:00. You're absolutely  
21 correct. I'm sorry, I get that 24-hour thing mixed up.

22 But, still, they log that one, okay? And so it tells me  
23 that they are logging things.

24 MR. KATCHMAR: Yes, sir?

25 MR. FASSETT: Point of clarification, if it doesn't

1 pertain to this gentleman, how would he know why somebody did  
2 something? It's kind of like saying he knows what's in their head  
3 and what their intentions are.

4 MR. KATCHMAR: No, I'm asking him about the log itself.  
5 And he said we use it. But then there's nothing in here about the  
6 San Bruno event.

7 But I did find this one earlier that's in there.

8 So I'm just asking the question --

9 MR. FASSETT: I understood --

10 MR. KATCHMAR: -- they use it --

11 MR. FASSETT: I understand it as a legitimate question.  
12 I don't understand how this gentleman, who did not take the call,  
13 could answer that question.

14 MR. KATCHMAR: Okay, I'm done.

15 BY MR. KATCHMAR:

16 Q. I've got one last question: Is there anything we have  
17 not asked you here today that you think we need to know about?

18 A. The only thing I might add is it seemed -- it seemed  
19 that the explosion on the line was not clear to us. It wasn't  
20 clear to us immediately after it happened that it might have been  
21 a gas line explosion. I think there were some reports that a  
22 plane had crashed. And so, although we received that information,  
23 we were still investigating and researching as if it could be a  
24 line break on one of the peninsula lines. But, for some time  
25 there was uncertainty as to what this catastrophe actually was.

1 Q. All right. Thank you very much.

2 MR. GUNTHER: I'd say one more -- I guess would the  
3 interviewee like to make a statement for the record?

4 MR. GENERA: No.

5 MR. GUNTHER: Thank you for being here. I appreciate  
6 your time.

7 (Whereupon, the interview was concluded.)

8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

A large black rectangular redaction covers a signature area. Above and below the redaction are several large, handwritten scribbles in black ink, which appear to be initials or a signature that has been obscured.



CERTIFICATE

This is to certify that the attached proceeding before the

NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD


IN THE MATTER OF:           PACIFIC GAS & ELECTRIC COMPANY  
                                  SEPTEMBER 9, 2010 ACCIDENT  
                                  SAN BRUNO, CALIFORNIA  
                                  Interview of Joaquin Genera

DOCKET NUMBER:           DCA-10-MP-008

PLACE:                      Burlingame, California

DATE:                      September 16, 2010

was held according to the record, and that this is the original,  
complete, true and accurate transcript which has been compared to  
the recording accomplished at the hearing.

  
Richard Friant (mz)  
Official Reporter