Huhn Michael

From: Sent: To: Subject:

Thursday, November 05, 2015 9:52 PM Huhn Michael Re: Eddie Andreini Accident

Mr. Huhn:

Please feel free to identify me and my email in the public docket relating to this accident and thank you for your excellent work on the Andreini accident investigation. It is my sincerest hope that these efforts will manifest themselves in practical operational improvements that enhance Airshow safety.

Sincerely, Brad Donner

On Nov 5, 2015, at 17:52, Huhn Michael < wrote:

Hi Brad

Its been a while but im just about finishing up this investigation/report

I wanted to place your email in the public docket, and want to know whether I can leave your name on it or want me to de-identify it

FYI your email raised many good points and i have tried to get as many answers, and ID as many issues as I could. Unfortunately i didn't have the resources or acess to do all I wanted, and some people were very reticent to provide any info

Thanks

Michael Huhn Air Safety Investigator NTSB Western Pacific Region M:

From: Sent: Wednesday, May 07, 2014 3:36 PM To: Cc: Huhn Michael; Subject: Re: Eddie Andreini Accident

Gentlemen:

Thank you for affording me the opportunity to comment on the issue of CFR response time at airshows. Although the context of my discussion is the Eddie Andreini accident at Travis Air Force Base, the issue of CFR response time following an airshow mishap is not new, nor is it isolated to the Andreini

accident. The fact that long CFR response time is not isolated to one accident is what compels me to comment. I sincerely hope you will take my comments in the constructive and serious nature in which they are offered; I place myself at your disposal for further dialogue and consent to my comments and identity becoming part of the public record.

Although I am not an airshow performer, I am a member of ICAS. My comments are my own and may or may not reflect the collective position of ICAS on this matter. I am also a 13,000+ hour professional pilot who has completed (as a civilian) an extensive Aviation Safety Officer training program; following completion of that training, I served as an Aviation Safety Officer in Afghanistan for a previous employer. My resume and academic credentials are available for your review upon request.

The problem of CFR response time, as I see it, is in three distinct areas:

1. Positioning of CFR Personnel & Equipment:

I have been attending airshows for over 30 years as either a support person for a performer or as a spectator / sponsor. I cannot recall a single airshow where CFR personnel and equipment were staged anywhere other than in or adjacent to the airport firehouse, or in close proximity to the flight line. In many cases, the CFR equipment was a de facto static display.

The nature of the airshow venue is unique. The large number of spectators in close proximity to CFR equipment requires them (the spectators) to move or be moved before the equipment can roll. Crowds are dense; potentially unruly; and during a mishap, they are more focused on the mishap than they are on getting out of the way of emergency equipment. This requires CFR personnel to serve in a crowd control / crowd dispersal capacity and severely limits the speed at which the equipment can move towards the mishap location.

I strongly believe that during the "flying" part of an airshow, there should be at least one piece of CFR equipment (preferably a fire truck) staged closest to the most likely location of a mishap - **the aerobatic box**. This is a sterile area that is free from spectators and other non-essential personnel. Staging there would allow CFR personnel to be in a distraction free environment, affording them the best opportunity for a fast and focused response. I further believe that such positioning would make the goal of a **60 second or less response** completely achievable. Staging a piece of CFR equipment and it's associated personnel in or near the aerobatic box would require some logistical support of the affected personnel - food, water, and toilet facilities would need to be provided. These are easy problems to solve and should not dramatically increase the cost of the CFR presence. Given the statistical likelihood of a mishap during an airshow and the need for a fast response, the placement of CFR equipment and personnel in or near the aerobatic box would.

2. Training of CFR Personnel:

As stated above, the airshow venue is unique; an airshow mishap is even more so. CFR personnel are highly trained professionals, but how often do they train on civilian aerobatic aircraft? Are they familiar with the shoulder harnesses and parachutes used in aerobatic aircraft? Do they know how to promptly and safely upright an aircraft that has come to rest inverted? This happened in Eddie Andreini's accident and in Charlie Hillard's fatal landing mishap at Sun N Fun in April 1996. In both cases, promptly up righting the aircraft could have saved the life of the pilot. Are they familiar with how to open or release a canopy? Can they identify and turn off fuel, smoke, ignition, and electrical systems in a light airplane? Many performers are providing CFR personnel a briefing card on their specific aircraft during the pre-show pilot briefing, but are CFR personnel taking the time to look at the aircraft and familiarize themselves with the content of the briefing cards?

A training program involving the airshow industry (ICAS) and first responders should be explored, with the goal of *optional* credentialing of CFR personnel as "airshow qualified". Smaller airshows and venues clearly don't have the resources for this, hence my emphasis on optional credentialing.

3. Empowerment of Air Bosses To Ensure CFR Readiness:

ICAS is working hard towards a formal training and credentialing program for Air Bosses. Part of that training should address the scope of the Air Boss' authority regarding CFR personnel. I have attended an airshow where firefighters had barbecue grills set up in front of their trucks. When the Air Boss questioned this, he was told that he was not in charge of CFR personnel. This was an isolated event, but the Air Boss must have the authority to direct the staging and readiness of key safety personnel at an airshow. Air Boss training should include material on how best to utilize emergency personnel. Do they

know the location of the nearest trauma or burn center? What is their plan for transporting an accident victim to that location? Is there a clear egress path from the aerobatic box to the nearest road that leads to a hospital? These are issues that need to be considered at *every* airshow, regardless of size; ICAS has already generated a cadre of highly trained Air Bosses who do this, but they need to be empowered to enforce it. Only a cooperative effort on the part of all stakeholders will make this possible.

It is my sincere hope that my comments, and the comments of others, will bring about long overdue changes in the management of first responder resources at airshows. If I can do anything further to help bring this about, I hope you will call upon me. Thank you again for the opportunity to comment.

Sincerely, Brad Donner

Original Message	
My name is Brad Donner,	

I was saddened to learn the news of Eddie Andreini's accident at Travis AFB. In looking at the video of the accident, I believe (and I do not represent to be an expert) that Eddie was alive following the impact. It appears as though the accident airplane's elevator is being manipulated post impact; it also appears as though the cockpit and turtle deck are sufficiently intact post impact for Eddie to have

had a reasonable chance of survival. Only the post mortem exam will tell, but I believe Eddie burned to death and a contributing cause to his death was the 5 minute response of the CFR crews at Travis.

This is not an isolated incident. Charlie Hillard died at the Sun N Fun airshow several years ago following a landing mishap that caused his Sea Fury to come to rest inverted. The airplane did not sustain significant damage and it did not catch on fire. Charlie died of positional asphyxia. While his airplane was inverted at the side of the runway, knowledgeable mechanics and pilots attempted to intervene and bring the aircraft to an upright position. They were kept away by CFR personnel.

The Bryan Jensen accident in Kansas City was clearly not survivable, but also had a 4+ minute response by CFR personnel.

Here's my point. There appears to be a disconnect in existing CFR procedures and the operational needs that exist in an airshow setting. The Eddie Andreini accident has brought this issue to light and it's a topic of informal but persistent discussion in the airshow community. I am wondering if I might be able to make an "on the record" comment about CFR response times and articulate recommendations for new procedures as part of the Andreini accident investigation? I realize the NTSB's focus will be on what caused the accident and CFR response time is an ancillary issue that may not be part of the final report. Nevertheless, it's a real issue and I'd like to weigh in on it, if I may.

Sincerely Yours, Brad Donner

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE - THIS E-MAIL TRANSMISSION MAY CONTAIN INFORMATION THAT IS PRIVILEGED, CONFIDENTIAL, PROPRIETARY, SUBJECT TO COPYRIGHT, AND/OR EXEMPT FROM DISCLOSURE UNDER APPLICABLE LAW. IT IS FOR THE USE OF INTENDED RECIPIENTS ONLY. If you are not an intended recipient of this message, please notify the original sender immediately by forwarding what you received and then delete all copies of the correspondence and attachments from your computer system. Any use, distribution, or disclosure of this message by unintended recipients is not authorized and may be unlawful.