

National Transportation Safety Board

Washington, D.C. 20594 Office of Marine Safety

Interview Summary – DCA15FM035

Interview of:	Master of Carnival Liberty	
Date/Time: September 11, 201	5 from 1547 to 1630	
Location: On board Carnival Liberty, San Juan, PR		
Interviewed by:	- USCG,	— Fowler Rodriguez,
- USCG,	– NTSB IIC	
Case: Carnival Liberty engine room fire, September 7, 2015		

- Has been with CCL from August 1999 to 2008 he then worked land based until 2010 he returned to sea and sailed with another cruise operator until he returned to CCL in 2013 as a staff captain – sailed on Carnival Liberty, Splendor and Magic as staff captain
- He worked as a staff captain and also shore side at CCL working on the ERP (7 to 8 months in 2014)
- He was promoted to master May 2015 and has sailed as master on Carnival Liberty and Sunshine
- He signed on Carnival Liberty on August 20, 2015 for a 6 day overlap before taking over as master on August 26
- A shore based captain sailed with him an additional 4 days for mentoring and oversight

Master was asked to recall the accident events:

- Master was walking with the staff captain to deck 0 to the officers mess for lunch
- On the way, he heard the Alpha 1st stage response code announcement over the PA system aft engine room
- He heard an announcement after that stating that all WTDs would be closed
- He ran up the stairs from deck 0 to deck 8 which is where the bridge was
- He estimated it took 4 to 5 minutes to get to the bridge
- When he arrived on the bridge he got a situation report that there was a fire in the engine room – he went to the HF panel and saw the pressure was 40 bar and questioned why so low
- He was told that the pressure must be 50 bar for the machinery spaces
- Was not confident that 50 bar was the required pressure
- He noticed that all the HF systems were activated local and total flooding
- There was a lot going on that he had to orient himself with
- The staff captain took over his part (emergency duties) and the captain took over control of the emergency
- He realized the entire engine casing was in (fire) alarm
- When he got to the bridge, the SMCS was frozen grey no indication
- Autronica system (fire detection) was working but the big SMCS display was grey

- The staff captain told the master they had to reboot the SMCS 3 times to get it back to normal
- They managed to determine the fire extent because of the Autronica fire detection system and they had alarms up to deck 14 in the engine casing
- The cameras were not available because SMCS was down
- An officer went to another station to monitor the CCTV and he reported he could see the HF was running
- Initially the fire went down but came up again he estimated this took place over a 40 minute duration
- The master called the chief engineer on the phone a few times asking about the pressure of the HF
- Looking at the CCTV, he saw there was something wrong with the HF spray not like what he has seen in training videos before –he felt something was not working properly
- Master asked CE about fuel pumps, isolations and QCV's
- He also recalled the CE calling him to confirm the valves were closed for fuel
- He called the CE and asked for the roll call
- CE then called the master and roll call was done was safe to release CO2 fire was still there – up and down – HF pressure still low
- As soon as he understood, the fire was in the engine space he gave the order to sound the crew alert to go to their stations
- After that, he sounded the general emergency alarm and he made and announcement to the passengers to evacuate the vessel from deck 0 where the gangway ashore was located – they were to walk out to the pier from there – ship evacuation
- The cruise director came on the bridge (late) and helped with the announcements
- His concern at the time was the smoke from the fire since the engine casing was filled with smoke
- He had communications with the on scene commander (safety officer) on deck 0 and the muster control who is the HD – made inquiries about smoke with them
- He was assured by the on scene commander and the HD who had people in crew (zone commanders) in position throughout the ship that there was no smoke
- He gave the order to discharge the CO2 CE confirmed the discharge was successful everything seemed to work fine
- After the CO2 discharge, the CE asked about stopping the HF in the forward engine room since the total flooding was activated he gave permission but this was after the CO2 had been discharged
- Fire teams monitored the temperatures what was reported back was nothing in excess of 40 to 50 C
- The HF continued to run
- The master estimated after about 2 hours the first fire squad entered the aft engine room from the incinerator room – the squad checked the areas near DG 5 and 6 and the non A60 bulkhead between DG5 and DG4 – all clear
- The second squad went down to inspect around DG4 (on the other side of the bulkhead) from the same entrance into the aft engine room
- The squad reported to the safety officer that it was all clear no fire

- Back at the staging area, during the debrief, one of the fire squad crew said there was a little smoke at the corner of the engine
- They then sent another squad down for further inspection everything was fine no fire
- The area was then ventilated and the staff captain, CE, staff chief, went to inspect the area

Follow up questions:

- Re-entry into the aft engine room about 1600 or 1630 when the space was re-entered after ventilation
- Passengers evacuated to pier the operation went well but there was no precise means to keep track of people – many passengers went to the gangway without their A pass card
- All section leaders reported back that all public spaces were clear and all cabins were clear
- It was also reported that all crew cabins were clear but there was no 0 count on A pass
- Passengers were mustered on the pier and the started to account for them with a hard copy list but even then it was challenging there was some mismatching
- By that time there was no smoke and the fire was contained fire was out
- Eventually they gave up with the accountability process around 1600 or 1630 they did not manage to get a 0 count with the A pass
- A pass information the master can see this on the bridge he had an officer monitoring this giving updates
- When asked about passengers mustered on the pier not properly aligned scattered around, at least initially. The master sent one deck officer to help organize
- Passengers were scattered, team members (crew) were confused he went to the bridge wing a few times to look down and at least initially it looked disorganized
- After some time, things got more organized
- There was not a lot of people he estimated about 600 to 700 people on board at the time of the fire – did not know this at the time of the emergency though – it was only after when he looked at the total persons who were on board at the time
- General alarm is seven short and one long
- There were 2 gangways the chief security officer was instructed to let everybody out since the ship was in emergency mode
- When asked about shore based communications it was challenging he had the 1st officer call the manager on duty and told her there was a fire in the engine room and they were considering discharging CO2
- He expected a call back straight away because the manager on duty normally activates the emergency response center shore side
- After he gave the instruction to contact the another person ashore and he also contacted captain Di' Angelos who was ashore (he is the director of stability)
- By that time, he had made the decision to discharge CO2
- When asked about the pressure of the HF he saw 40 bar but saw on the CCTV the pressure was going up and down
- The HF control panel on the bridge is just for indication no control

- Was asked about in port evacuation and abandonment there is an SMS procedure this was followed - team members activated the procedures – in port manning procedures implemented
- The A Pass system can provide information regarding exactly how many persons are on and off the ship at any time
- There is no electronic process for accountability of passengers the company is moving in that direction but nothing implemented on the Carnival Liberty
- The A pass system was partially used during the evacuation of people ashore partially meaning that persons with a cruise card (scanned in A pass) were punched out but ones without a card just left the ship
- They had to use a manual list to account for guests and crew on the pier
- The persons on the pier were eventually gathered as if they were at their muster stations – this took place after they sent the muster station leaders to the pier
- Time from fire announced to deployment of CO2 was about 15 minutes
- After the CO2 deployment CE requested to turn off the forward engine room water mist total flooding – captain gave permission after a while when he was 100% sure the fire was out and no risk of re ignition
- Company policy is to keep running HF to keep cooling no policy for CE to ask permission to make changes to HF
- Captain would expected a request for permission to reset HF would never allow reset if he knew the fire was still going
- He knew the pressure was low with the HF
- Captain eventually gave permission to stop total flooding in the forward engine room eventually did not monitor any change in pressure because the fire was well extinguished by about an hour
- When asked about the SMCS freezing after the fact, he thinks the system froze because of too many alarms – it is an essential system but the main fire detection system is Autronica which worked fine – they were able to work with the other systems they have
- All fire alarms were still coming from Autronica overwhelming amount of alarms all HF indications are in Autronica
- Fire doors are indicated on SMCS there is a mimic panel as well
- There was no information missing even though the SMCS was frozen
- Master stated his concern was not the spread of the fire around the ship, it was the spread of smoke that was his concern

Glossary:

- AC air conditioning
- CCTV closed circuit television
- CE chief engineer
- CO2 carbon dioxide
- DG diesel generator
- ECR engine control room
- EOW engineer of the watch
- ERP Emergency response plan

HD – hotel director HF – hi fog LO – lube oil PA – public announcement QCV – quick closing valve QRT – quick response team SMCS – safety management control system WTD – water tight door